



Final External Independent Evaluation

“Curb early child marriage through human rights education and advocacy in Sindh, Pakistan “

January 01, 2016 to December 31, 2017

Evaluation Report

April 2018

Conducted by: Shahzadi Tunio–Consultant

Submitted to: Sindh Community Foundation

Disclaimer: This project end evaluation was made possible with the support from United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence against Women –UNWOMEN. The contents are the responsibility of Sindh Community Foundation, and do not necessarily reflect the opinion of United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence against Women –UNWOMEN.

Contents

Executive Summary.....	4
1. Context of the project.....	10
2. Description of the project.....	10
3. Purpose of the evaluation.....	11
4. Evaluation objectives and scope.....	11
5. Evaluation team	12
6. Evaluation questions.....	12
7. Evaluation Methodology.....	13
8. Sample selection	14
9. Ethical Considerations.....	15
10. Limitations to the evaluation methodology	16
11. Findings and Analysis per Evaluation Questions.....	16
12. Conclusion.....	39
13. Recommendations	42
14. Final Version of ToRs.....	43
15. Evaluation Matrix (ANNEX 4A).....	70
16. Beneficiary Data Sheet (Annex 4C)	73
17. Additional methodology related documents.....	73
18. List of persons and institutions interviewed or consulted and sites visited.....	77
19. List of supporting documents reviewed.....	78
20. CVs of consultants who conducted the evaluation	78

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ASP	Assistant Superintendent Police
ASI	Assistant Superintendent Inspector
CHRG	Community Human Right Group
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DMCs	District Monitoring Committees
DCC	District Coordination Committee
DDO	Dawn Development Organization
EM	Early Marriage
FGDs	Focus Group Discussions
GBV	Gender Based Violence
HP	Health Practitioner
IDI	In- Depth Interview
KII	Key Informant Interview
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
M.T.Khan, MTK	Tando Mohammad Khan
LHV	Lady Health Visitor
NADRA	National Database & Registration Authority
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NK	Nikahkawan
PRA	Participatory Rapid Assessment
TL	Team Leader
ToR	Terms of Reference
TOT	Training Of Trainers
SCMRA	Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act
SCF	Sindh Community Foundation
UC	Union Council
UN	United Nation
UNTF	United Nations Trust Fund
UNEG	United Nations Evaluation Group
USD	US Dolor
YLO	Young Leaders Organization
WDD	Women Development Department
WLO	Women Leaders Organization

Executive Summary

Curb early marriage through human rights education and advocacy in Sindh, a two-year project was designed to address early child marriage, a form of human rights violation, through creating awareness on the Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013 (SCMRA)¹. The project was funded by the United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence against Women (UN Trust Fund) with a total grant of USD 99,980 and it was implemented during January 2016 to December 2017. The project was implemented in 30 villages across three districts (10 in each district) named Tando Mohammad Khan, Dadu and Sukkur with support from three local organizations (Bade Saba-TMK, Dawn Development organization –Dadu and NAARI Foundation-Sukkur). The overall goal of the project was to ensure **“girls in three districts of Sindh have increased protection against early marriage by 2017”** with a key focus on the following three outcomes: 1) Parents and peers support girls to avoid early marriages in 30 villages of Sindh province; 2) Service providers (Nikahkawan, Lawyers, police, media and health practitioners) have improved response to protect girls from early child marriages; CSOs are advocating girls protection from GBV; 3) Girls targeted by the project have increased leadership skills to negotiate their rights in their families.

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess project success in terms of effectiveness, relevance, efficiency, sustainability, impact and knowledge generation. The evaluation has also been done to draw lessons learned, best practices and to generate recommendations to be used for better design and implementation of future projects.

The evaluation team comprised of two local female consultants including a Team Leader (TL) and Focus Group Discussion (FGD) expert/researcher, familiar with the local context and equipped with the required knowledge and experience in evaluation of relevant studies.

The evaluation design was a post-test without a comparison study, based on community/beneficiary's perception implementer's opinion and document review and was conducted in nine villages randomly selected across three districts using qualitative data collection methods. The study was inclusive in nature, involved the community, implementing partners and relevant stakeholders. In addition to primary data, knowledge was also generated through a review of project documents collected from SCF and partners. For the FGDs and Key Informant Interviews (KII), the Evaluation matrix designed by UNTF, FGD and KII guidelines developed by consultant were used. Data collected from the field and information extracted from project documents/reports has been analyzed and used in the report writing. The sample selection was developed with support from the SCF team and local partners. All protocols regarding the safety and security of consultants and respondents, community members and stakeholders were properly followed. Among limitations to the evaluation methodology included unavailability of baseline data for comparison and conclusion of the quantitative change and missing opinion of the direct project team/staff, who could not be reached during evaluation as they were project staff, therefore left organization after project ended.

As per information from senior management of SCF, they conducted only a general survey of the villages of the three districts to understand the situation of girls' education and child marriage frequency. The

¹ Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013 is an improved version of CMRA 1929 which has been passed by Provincial Assembly of Sindh on June 28, 2014 and assented by the Governor of Sindh on June 10, 2014. Under SCMRA Whoever (person above 18 years age, parents, nikahkawan or any other party) found guilty of facilitating child marriage (A child married before 18 years age) shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment which may extend to three years but shall not be less than two years and shall be liable to fine.

findings of the survey were incorporated in the project background and rationale sections of project proposal document.

The project has made an appreciable contribution in achieving the project goal ***“girls in three districts of Sindh have increased protection against early marriage by 2017”***. This has been evidenced by a shift in attitudes amongst beneficiaries (girls and parents) around the protection of girls from early marriage and awareness about SCMRA 2013. Girls and mothers contacted by consultant team shared that generally parents do not ask girls willingness before arranging their marriages due to the centuries old customs deeply rooted in the society. According to old norms of the society parents have full authority to fix marriages of their children at any age with any person without knowing girls’ and boys’ willingness. It was also shared that project activities through sessions and theater have increased their understanding about their rights and are able to speak with friends and can negotiate with parents. In addition to this, the project was able to bring about positive changes in the attitudes and behaviors of parents which are evident from the number (about 200 as reported in the project reports) of marriages delayed/postponed (till they reach 18 years of age) by parents which were planned before. As well as supporting primary beneficiaries, the project equally sensitized other relevant stakeholders in the villages (health practitioners, NK/Pundits,) and at district level (Media, police, lawyers and civil society), who played a great role in mobilization and creating awareness among the communities in the targeted areas. The development of partnerships with local partners and structures at community level proved a good strategy in achieving the targets. SCF with support from its stakeholders and a law expert reviewed and shared a draft narrating loophole in the SCMRA 2013 and issues/gaps restricting law from proper implementation. The draft of review was shared with 2 policy makers/ and chairperson of Sindh Human Rights Commission for their pursuance. One day provincial dialogue/workshop for advocating gaps in the law and pursue its implementation process with policy makers was held at Karachi which was attended by CSOs, media, police community, Chairperson of Sindh Human Rights Commission and representative of Ending Violence Alliance. SCF also translated rules of business in Sindhi language for understanding of the implementers and shared with police, media, CBOs and other stakeholders.

The project results indicate that sensitizing and involving key stakeholders (NK/Pundits, HP, police, media and lawyers) and implementing the project in partnership with local civil society groups/organizations proved a successful approach in achieving project targets within the available timeframe and budget. The project created awareness among girls, boys and parents and service providers that resulted in a reduction of cases of early marriage and saved the life (y stopping and or delaying marriages) of 200 underage girls during project period whose marriages were planned.

Using interactive theater and social media to promote information on the law, GBV and the negative impacts of early marriage proved an effective tool as reported by every respondent contacted during evaluation. In addition to this, strengthening and engaging local human rights activists to mobilize parents and community members helped keep the community vigilant against early marriage by helping to create awareness to reduce incidents of early marriage. Findings of document review and of interviews with students show that educating the girls through training and by providing a platform for them to share opinions through essay writing ²/ debate competitions increased their knowledge and confidence levels. Girls were of the opinion, that after training they are more able to talk about the subject with friends/peers and to negotiate with parents about early marriage. Parents, particularly mothers (victims of early marriage themselves) have realized that early marriages spoil the childhood of girls and damage the health of underage girls.

² After awareness sessions students of 11 girl’s schools from three districts were given topics (GBV, Impacts of early marriage on life of girls and importance of education) for essay writing and debate competition

I was married at the age of 15 years and became mother at the age of 17 years. I suffered low hemoglobin and other complications during first pregnancy. It was difficult to run family and manage household chores. I faced lot of problems due to early marriage but now I will not let this happen to my children. (Mrs. "A" wife of "M" from Dadu district and a mother of three children).

The project strategy and activities had high contextual relevance to the needs of women and girls. Interviews with community, parents and other stakeholders reveals that the practice of early marriage was so deeply internalized that parents, community members and even targeted stakeholders did not consider it a crime. Project approached to the stakeholders such as parents, nikahkawan, police, media and lawyers who were equally responsible for supporting this violence of human rights. Police did not take actions neither media was highlighting these issues of early marriage in these areas. The reason they shared was unawareness about the law. Government made the law, but no steps were taken for its implementation (Ayaz Husain Rind, advocate district Dadu). Review of documents, discussions with beneficiaries reveals that Issue based interactive theater in the local language and face to face meetings with parents were found to be effective participatory approaches to create awareness on the subject. Parents understood issues related to early marriage and legal consequences.

The project was implemented and managed in accordance with the project document. Engaging local partners helped to easily access the community and efficiently complete project activities within the project's time frame. Local partners were already present in these villages and had developed trust of the community due to earlier projects. Their close interaction with community saved time otherwise required for mobilization process. Building capacity of local partners and engaging activists in certain field activities proved an effective strategy in controlling the cost of mobility and data generation. Regular monitoring of the project activities at far distant villages would have taken lot of time and cost if directly done by SCF team. The partners involved local youths and community members as volunteers keeping watch on the project activities and that proved a good strategy of achieving targets with due time and available budget. Technical support provided to partners has enhanced their efficiency in project implementation, documentation and reporting. It was also identified by the partners that if financial support in form of staff salaries and equipment was provided, it might have helped them in developing more focused approach.

The project activities were designed in a way to ensure sustainability of the project. Empowering girls at school to transfer learned knowledge amongst fellow students and developing linkages between trained Community Human Rights Groups (CHRG), youth and community, service providers (Nikahkawan/pundits,) ensured accountability and stimulated a community level response. Strategic linkages between local actors, police and media stimulated district level participation in taking actions against early marriage in the area. 150 school girls oriented on impacts of early marriage, violation of human rights and SCMRA law will continue to share this with peers and transfer this knowledge to others. The same information was confirmed during interview with school girls from Johi-Dadu and Dodo Sarwari- Sukkur.

The project has left a significant positive impact on the lives of girls and parents around the issue of early marriage within the project area and its surroundings. Reduction in the frequency of early marriage as reported by project beneficiaries (Also reported in progress report, that about 200 below 18 years girls marriages were stopped, delayed during project period, till they turn 18 years), realization

about the importance of education for girls, and re-schooling (10 girls saved from early marriage started schooling again as reported in project documents) of some victims of early marriage are major key successes of the project. During FGDs and interviews, parents also showed great interest in getting their girls enrolled in schools and requested to open schools and vocational centers in their villages where girls can get education and learn employable skills for their better future. Changing behaviors of service providers (Nikahkawan and Pundits who solemnize marriages) in these areas where literacy rate is very low and old customs are deeply rooted, is another achievement of the project. Trained NK shared during interviews that they are also spreading learned information with fellow NK and parents in their respective areas. Behaviors do not change overnight; it takes time and continuous, integrated efforts. During evaluation process it was also learned that inclusion of interventions on education and the generation of employable skills such as handicraft, tailoring, embroidery, value addition to existing crafts, mobile repairing etc., along with developing market linkages in this project would have left a sustainable and long term impact on the lives of girls, because most cases of EM happens due to poverty.

The evaluation found that involvement of local partners and community members (girls, boys and activists) in project activities increased their ownership and proved a best practice in achieving the project goal. Imparting knowledge through interactive theater in local language for less educated community proved successful strategy in spreading knowledge about GBV, EM and SCMRA. Training to NK/Pundits, as they are among most influential persons and have good say within local communities also proved good option for spreading knowledge among parents. Keeping trained youths responsible to watch incidents of early marriage in their areas and share information with other stakeholders (police, lawyers, media and CSOs) without indicating reporter's name was a best approach in avoiding community conflict. It was also learned that use of social media for spreading knowledge on SCMRA, GBV and EM proved good approach in reaching maximum number of recipients. Engagement of trainer familiar with local norms, values and language also left a good impact on learners (beneficiaries). Following are the lessons learned during two years project in targeted districts:

- Poverty and illiteracy are the root causes of early marriage in the project target areas. It is recommended by the majority of the respondents that support must be provided to victims of early marriage in form of trainings in alternate employable skills, informal education and provision of safe homes at district and UC level.
- To bring sustainable behavioral change and eliminate deep rooted negative traditions of early marriage, there should be long term interventions rather than short term projects. A two-year project time- period is very short to deal with such a silent menace.
- Mobilization through interactive theater in the local language proved a good approach. In communities where literacy rates are very low, theater can leave a long-lasting impact on the community. It was proved during interviews where totally illiterate mothers and girls narrated whatever they saw regarding impacts of EM on the life of girls and their families. These types of activities should also be used in other projects of sensitive nature and where communities are illiterate/less educated.

- Arrange more discussion forums, speeches and essay competitions. This would help to open up discussion on early marriage, GBV, gender discrimination, etc., and their negative impacts. This will prove more helpful in creating knowledge among youth regarding these harmful practices
- Training to NK/Pundits and health practitioners proved a successful strategy in achieving the goal of the project. It is recommended that the duration of trainings/sessions should be increased and the scope of training needs to be widened by including more remote villages from same and neighboring districts. There is also a need to train Nikkah Registrars³ who in turn can make NK/Pundits follow the law.
- Marriage bureau, Dalalat village level (who search brides and grooms on behalf of parents and arranges meetings between parents of both bride and groom) should also be sensitized on the law.
- Lobby for implementation of SCMRA 2013 at all levels of the judiciary. It was reported by lawyers and police that Judges are still following the old version of the law which gives parent/girls right to marry at the age of 16 years. Implementation of the new law at all levels should be made mandatory; otherwise many perpetrators will not get the appropriate justice in court.
- During interviews it was revealed that before trainings given by SCF, none of the stakeholders targeted under project were aware of the law, neither provided any copies of the laws passed, at their offices. Any development/amendment in the law should be shared with key stakeholders from provincial to UC level to ensure a proper understanding and implementation of the law. All laws need to be translated into local languages and made available at government offices.
- More pressure groups need to be formed and strengthened to put pressure on the state for strong enforcement of the laws.
- Trainings on EM and SCMRA plus the new bills/laws passed on violation against women should also be extended to teachers and be made part of the school syllabus for class 8, 9 or 10. During trainings, documentaries of relevant success stories should be shown to trainees.
- Emerging grassroots organizations working on women rights and / or on early marriage often lack technical expertise and financial hardships, hence strengthening of these groups through technical and financial supports would prove more helpful in achieving better results.
- More messages on the negative impacts of EM and legal punishments due to perpetrators should be announced through local TV cable networks and radio.
- The main points on the law regarding legal age and legal aspects of the law should be displayed at courts, police stations, press clubs, mosques and offices of local councilors through posters. Messages should be in local languages and include pictures and cartoons for ease of understanding, especially for those people who may not be able to read.

³Nikah Registrar is responsible for registration of marriage and issue marriage certificate.

1. Context of the project

Curb early marriages through human rights education and advocacy in Sindh, was a two years project designed in response to address violation of human rights in the form of early child marriage, which is deeply rooted in tradition, customs and culture of Pakistan. It is not considered as a crime by not only communities in less developed areas but also by the so called civilized communities of developed areas in Pakistan. Yet, it is a serious violation of human rights but still in Pakistan, one in three girls are married before reaching the age of 18 years (Demographic and health Survey 2012-13)ⁱ.

Child marriage robs girls of their childhood and future prospects. Girls who marry before 18 years are less likely to finish their schools and are at a high risk of domestic violence. It keeps the Total Fertility Rate (TFR) very high along with infant and maternal mortality; families are trapped in poverty and , property disputes, exchange marriages(sometimes even before the birth of child), forced conversion of religion from non-Muslim into Muslims as it is mandatory in Islam to marry a Muslim man or girl (Forced conversion of religion is common in Pakistan due to absence of law for Hindu and other non-muslim religions that register their marriages and provide them protection) and poor/non-implementation of existing laws contribute to this trend of early marriage.

In the context of SCF (Districts TMK, Dadu and Sukkur), child marriage was considered a domestic issue and not a crime due to illiteracy and lack of awareness on Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013(SCMRA). Keeping in mind the prevailing situation of serious human rights violation, and to create awareness on the legal implication of child marriage in terms of social, economic and health factors of girls/women, SCF designed a project and earned a grant for a two years project from UN Trust Fund and implemented this project in 30 villages of three districts in Sindh province with support from three local partners' Foundation, Dawn Development organization and Bad e Saba foundation. While selecting areas for project implementation, SCF in support from local partners selected remote areas of the three districts, Dadu, MTK and Sukkur with the focus on villages having low literacy rate and lacking knowledge on law protecting girls from early marriage and high poverty rate. Domestic violence and forced conversion of girls from minority (Hindu) into Muslim for marriage purpose in these communities are witnessed. Early marriages of girls and boys are also frequent due to different reasons stated above.

2. Description of the project

The project, ***Curb early marriages through human rights education and advocacy in Sindh***, Pakistan, was a two years project that started in January 2016 and ended on December 31, 2017. The project was funded by UN Fund Trust with a total grant of USD 99,980. The total expenditure made during two years was USD 87,184.38 whereas unspent amount was U.SD 1,734.73. This amount was unspent due to various reasons in few activities expenses went below the estimated amount. Project was implemented by Sindh Community Foundation (SCF) in 30 villages of three districts of the Sindh province namely Tando Mohammad Khan, Dadu and Sukkur in partnership with three local organizations including two women and one youth led organization (*NARIFoundation-Sukkur, Dawn Development organization-Dadu and Bade Saba Women Organisation-T.M.Khan*). These areas were selected for project activities due to

high number cases of girls married and having children before the age of 18 years. The communities in these areas were also not aware about the law passed on by Sindh government for restricting early child marriage. The overall goal of the project was to ensure that ***Girls in these three districts of Sindh have increased protection against early marriage by 2017.*** To achieve the overall goal, the project focused on three outcomes:

1. Parents and peers support girls to avoid early marriages in 30 villages of Sindh province.
2. Service providers (Nikahkawan, Lawyers, police, media and health practitioners) have improved response to protect girls from early child marriages; CSOs are advocating girls protection from GBV
3. Girls targeted by the project have increased leadership skills to negotiate their rights in their families

To achieve overall goal of the project, project activities targeted 4294 community members including primary beneficiaries 3132 (964 girls under 18 years age and 2168 female parents) and 1164 secondary beneficiaries (youth, police, lawyers, health practitioners, Nikahkawan and media) of 30 villages from three districts including Tando Mohammad Khan, Dadu and Sukkur.

During two years life of project, the purpose of the project was to curb early marriage through creating awareness among the community about human rights, encouraging civil society efforts and the role of police, lawyers and the media to be vigilant on the violation of early marriage legislation, sensitization of relevant stakeholders and the advocacy for speedy implementation of the Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013 with a proper and clear implementation mechanism in Sindh. The law was passed but it was not implemented properly. It was also learned during meetings with government officials who are supposed to be responsible for implementing law, were unaware about SCMRA. Though it was Government of Sindh's responsibility to brief its institutions and bound them to follow rules of business of the law, but it did not happen. The project was also designed to promote girls leadership as a tool to combat violence and early marriages.

3. Purpose of the evaluation

The project end evaluation assessed the impact of project activities carried out by SCF and its local partners based on its relevance to the beneficiaries, including primary (girls and women) and secondary (boys, parents, facilitators and other stakeholder) beneficiaries along with exploring the level of effectiveness and sustainability of the project. Furthermore, the evaluation is used as an exercise to draw and document lessons learned best practices and subsequently generate recommendations that might be used to improve the design and implementation process of relevant future projects.

4. Evaluation objectives and scope

The main objectives of project evaluation agreed between SCF and consultant, as per ToR are stated below:

- To evaluate the entire project in terms of effectiveness, relevance, efficiency, sustainability and impact, with a strong focus on assessing the results at the outcome and project goals;
- To generate key lessons and identify promising practices for learning;

The project evaluation covered the entire project duration (January 2016 to December 2017). The evaluation team visited 09 villages (three from each district) of three districts namely Tando Mohammad Khan, Dadu and Sukkur, identified by Sindh Community Foundation with support from its three implementing local partners. Consultant team held meetings with primary beneficiaries (girls, both parents) and secondary beneficiaries including youth, community members/activists and other stakeholders (police, lawyers, media, health practitioners and Nikahkawan & Pundits /Maharaj). The collected data from primary and secondary sources was analyzed as per indicators, outcomes and output level. Evaluation looked at project management, partnerships established, capacity built and project approach.

No such major challenge was faced by the Evaluation team during field visits. Due to holidays for examination preparations, schools remained off during field visit therefore no school was visited. Instead one local partner (Dawn Development Organization) invited five female students of grade 9 and 10 to their office in Johi, Dadu.

5. Evaluation team

For conducting the end line assessment, the team comprised of two members: the Team Leader and FGD expert.

The **Team leader** was responsible for the overall direction and completion of the study. She performed the following specific tasks:

- Participation in the orientation meeting with SCF/Donor
- Collection and review of all documents/reports of the project implemented by SCF in three districts of Sindh - Tando Mohammad Khan, Dadu and Sukkur,
- Designing study tools/guidelines
- Coordination with SCF project management/team and field activity
- Analysis of data and report writing

The **FGD Expert** conducted FGDs and KII with target beneficiaries, both direct and indirect. She also conducted KII and IDI with youth groups, the police, DMCs, media and implementing partners in the three districts. Other than collecting data through PRA techniques, the FGD expert/researcher was also responsible for the compilation of field data collected through FGDs KII or IDI/Meetings with different stakeholders.

6. Evaluation questions

Evaluation Criteria	Mandatory Evaluation Questions
Effectiveness	1) To what extent were the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs achieved and how? 2) To what extent did the project reach the targeted beneficiaries at the project goal and outcome levels? How many beneficiaries have been reached? 3) To what extent has this project generated positive changes in the lives of targeted (and untargeted) women and girls in relation to the specific forms of violence addressed by this project? Why? What are the key changes in the lives of those women and/or girls? Please describe those changes.

	<p>4) What internal and external factors contributed to the achievement and/or failure of the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs? How?</p> <p>Alternative questions in case of project focusing at the policy level</p> <p>5) To what extent was the project successful in advocating for girls protection against child marriages? If it was not successful, explain why.</p> <p>6) Have key stakeholders responded effectively cases of early marriages?</p>
Relevance	<p>1) To what extent was the project strategy and activities implemented relevant in responding to the needs of women and girls?</p> <p>2) To what extent do achieved results (project goal, outcomes and outputs) continue to be relevant to the needs of women and girls?</p>
Efficiency	<p>1) How efficiently and timely has this project been implemented and managed in accordance with the Project Document?</p>
Sustainability	<p>1) How are the achieved results, especially the positive changes generated by the project in the lives of women and girls at the project goal level, going to be sustained after this project ends? Have collective efforts of the community helped to protect girls against early marriage?</p> <p>How effectively have stakeholders involved in implementation of Sindh Child Marriages restraint act 2013 responded to cases of early marriages?</p>
Impact	<p>1) What are the unintended consequences (positive and negative) resulted from the project?</p>
Knowledge Generation	<p>1) What are the key lessons learned that can be shared with other practitioners on Ending Violence against Women and Girls?</p> <p>2) Are there any promising practices? If yes, what are they and how can these promising practices be replicated in other projects and/or in other countries that have similar interventions?</p>

7. Evaluation Methodology

An evaluate study is a post-test without comparison with baseline data (due to unavailability of baseline data of the project area), using project documents as a reference document and data, collected through FGDs, KII and meetings held project beneficiaries and implementing agencies. The study is inclusive in nature, used qualitative method of data collection. The Evaluation was conducted in nine villages (three villages from each district) of three districts of Sindh province namely, Tando Mohammad Khan, Dadu and Sukkur.

Along with primary data, knowledge was also generated and verified through review of relevant literature and documents including progress and monitoring reports, proposals and other project documents. Group and individual discussions with all stakeholders, collection of relevant data, records and information material from the field and line departments, observations, and analysis of information within the given context of study areas. The methodology used in evaluation is described below:

Briefing with SCF Staff: Prior to developing inception report and conducting field visit, the consultant held meeting with SCF executive director and monitoring officer to collect relevant information and documents. The project manager and advocacy officer could not be contacted, as the project team had

left as soon as the project ended by December 31, 2017. During the briefing session, the consultant clarified queries regarding the evaluation objectives and data required.

Review of Secondary data: For the purpose of designing inception report and developing study tools, consultant reviewed project documents (progress reports, cases studies, monitoring reports, annual reports, proposal, media clippings, etc.) obtained from SCF to get a better understanding on the project background, objectives and outcomes, outputs achieved by project over period of two years. The same information was used in analysis and report writing.

Designing assessment tools: After review of available reports/information, the consultant developed guidelines and an open-ended questionnaire for conducting FGDs, meeting and key informants interviews from different stakeholders both direct and indirect beneficiaries (parents, youths, the police & law officials, media and Nikahkhawan etc.), implementing partners and relevant government line departments. Assessment tools were made according to required information included question regarding effectiveness, relevance & appropriateness, efficiency, sustainability and knowledge. Different PRA techniques including observations, FGDs, KII, etc. were used in collection of information regarding output and impact of the project operations in target areas.

Data collection from field: KII and FGDs were conducted with primary and secondary beneficiaries identified with the help of SCF partners in the target areas. Evaluation took place in the nine villages of the three selected districts where SCF has carried out its interventions since January 01, 2016 till December 31, 2017. Nine villages were randomly selected which makes 30% of total villages (30) targeted under the project. SCF selected the villages for project end evaluation where ratio of early marriages before project activities was high in both Muslim and non-Muslim communities.

FGDs and interview with women, men and girls were conducted in villages except one meeting at DDO office (participants of girls' leadership training). KII/meetings with police, Nikahkhawan and Health practitioners were held at village (TMK) and offices of partners (Dadu and Sukkur). Lawyers and media persons were contacted at their respective offices (Chambers and press club).

Analysis of the data and preparation of Draft Report: The report mainly contains the perceptions of the beneficiaries regarding project activities carried out by SCF and its partner organizations in 30 villages of three districts. Meetings with the SCF and partners staff were held to have a better understanding of the situation and information collected from the field. Most of the information is collected and organized on the basis of responses of the beneficiaries of project in three districts who participated in FGDs and KII. While community perceptions are documented without being influenced by any other factors, the observations based on the assessment team's own understanding are organized by triangulating the information collected by various sources including literature review, meetings with key informants and informal discussions with SCF/partners staff during field visits.

8. Sample selection:

A total of 09 villages were randomly selected by SCF in consultation with its implementing local partners for project end evaluation. Effort was made to visit villages where ratio of early marriages was high and

education among girls was very high. The list of villages visited with population is attached as in annex. Number of villages, meetings and FGDs held in the SCF project area are given in the table below:

Stakeholders	Activities	# of meetings, FGDs / Sites			Villages/meetings/FGDs per site	Total number of participants
		Tando Mohammad Khan	Dadu	Sukkur		
No of villages per site		03	03	03	09	
Girls under 18 years and parents	FGD and interview	03	03	03	09	140
FGD with Youth activists	FGD/interview	01	01	01	03	04
Community Human rights groups-village & districtlevel	FGD/interview	02	03	03	08	04
Nikahkawan	Meeting	01	01	01	03	06
Police/SHO	Meeting	01	01	01	03	02
DMC	Meeting	01	01	01	03	0
Media	Meeting	01	01	01	03	04
Lawyers	Meeting	01	01	01	03	05
Partners	meeting	01	01	01	03	05 including SCF management
Total meetings		16	16	16	47	170

A total of 140 direct beneficiaries including girls ages between 14-18 years, parents and 30 indirect beneficiaries (Police, lawyers, media, NK&Pundits, youths, CHRG and health practitioners) were contacted during the evaluation of the project in three districts of Sindh province - M.T.Khan, Dadu and Sukkur. In each FGD session, participants' ratio was 12-18 including parents, girls and other family members.

9. Ethical Considerations

- During field visits, Evaluation team followed following ethics:
- The respondents/project stakeholders were informed about FGDs and meetings to be held by the evaluation team a week earlier by the local implementing partners.
- Meetings with male groups (Lawyer, Nikahkawan, Police and youth groups) were held in the separate rooms in their respective offices and somewhere in separate rooms at partners' offices. Media persons were contacted at their respective press clubs/offices.
- Meetings with women, girls and male parents were held in their villages with prior permission/verbal consent and their willingness.
- A verbal consent from the parents of girls (under 18 years) was taken before talk with girls at all villages. All parents were uneducated therefore verbal consent was taken.

- Before initiating discussion, all participants were briefed in detail about purpose of data collection and its utility
- Photos were taken in some of the meetings with prior verbal permission. No such activity was done where the beneficiaries refused it. Names of participants, where necessary, are kept confidential to avoid any dispute
- During discussions, direct and indirect beneficiaries gave some suggestions/ recommendations for strong impact of the future project, are also reported in the draft.
- The names of all female respondents are not disclosed in the report for confidentiality purpose.

10. Limitations to the evaluation methodology.

The evaluation was done after three months of the project completion and during that period all project staff of SCF and volunteers of partners had left organizations. Therefore they could not be contacted and their point of view is missing in the report. There was no baseline data regarding frequency of cases of early marriages happening in the targeted villages. Therefore it is difficult to compare and conclude the percentage of reduction in the cases of early marriages. There were some questions added by consultant to identify the situation regarding early marriages before project, which were asked from both direct and indirect beneficiaries. Their responses are narrated in the report.

11. Findings and Analysis per Evaluation Questions

Evaluation Criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question	#01 To what extent were the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs achieved and how?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>The project goal: <i>Girls in 03 districts of Sindh province has increased protection by December 2017</i></p> <p>The project has made an appreciable contribution to achieve the overall project goal. The project beneficiaries (both primary and secondary) demonstrated knowledge, awareness and shift in attitudes around protection of girls from early marriage and legal consequences of the ECMRA 2013. Parents and girls of the targeted villages indicated that this knowledge came out as a result of project activities. According to them this was the first ever project that shared knowledge about law which is made to protect girls from early marriages. Before this project early marriage was considered as a family matter.</p> <p>It was admitted by parents and girls during FGDs and interviews that girls never had a say in family, neither consulted for marriages. School girls of Johi-Dadu and from villages, reported that project increased confidence of girls by equipping them with knowledge about human rights and available law protecting girls from early marriage, they are able to negotiate with parents and discuss with peers.</p> <p>Mrs. "A" w/o Mr. "M" from village Birhmani, Johi-Dadu shared that she was married at the age of 15. According to her she was not consented by her family</p>

before fixing her marriage. She took a deep sigh and said” *I wish this project has come earlier to my area; I may not have been married early.*

Nikahkawan/Pundits (religious persons), who were solemnizing marriages without considering age of bride and groom before awareness session/trainings, were also of the view that project activities equipped them with the knowledge regarding available law that prohibits early marriage. In their words, they did not know about any law before that can punish even facilitators of early marriage. It is because of this project that they are promoting idea of negative impacts of early marriage on health of girls and their social life and legal consequences of ECMRA 2013 among fellow NK and communities. The major change that appeared after project is reduction in the number (about 200 during two years of project period)ⁱⁱ early marriages not only in the project targeted villages but also in the neighboring areas.

At district level, through coordinating the service delivery of justice, health and media and social services, the project established a referral pathway that has started working at the districts (Three targeted) level.

The project created a pressure group of youths and activist that are now keeping watch on the issues of EM and sharing information on legal punishment through use of social media (SMS, WhatsApp, and Facebook). This group has proved an effective tool in reporting issues of EM happening in their respective areas.

Review of SCMRA 2013 for identification of gaps, initiating debate on amendments in the law and its proper implementation mechanism, was the result of project activities. In this regard a day long provincial level dialogue was held in Karachi which was attended by civil society, media persons, lawyers, community members and chairperson of Sindh Human Rights Commission (SHRC)ⁱⁱⁱ. The printed copy of document reviewed was also shared with two policymakers for pursue at assembly level. Though it will not bring a quick change, but at least an initiative has been taken from the project platform. It needs proper follow up. SCF has also translated rules of business in Sindhi language and shared with police, lawyers and other stakeholders for their understanding. Prior to this project no laws are translated in local language for understanding of institutions and a common man (indicated by a police officer during interview).

Review of goal, indicators as reported in the project documents and discussion with project participants reveals following achievements made at goals level:

Protection to girls: 03 girls (two in district TMK and one in Dadu) were saved due to timely action taken by trained police officials (oriented by the project) in three districts.

Perspective of parents and girls: After becoming part of the project, increasing awareness on worst impacts of early marriages and legal consequences under

present law SCMRA 2013), parents of 12 couples (parents of bride and groom) from three target districts (TMK, Dadu and Sukkur) delayed marriages of their children till they turn 18 years.

The project has also left its positive impacts on neighboring areas where parents are getting approval from Nikahkawan/Pundits for arranging marriages of their children (as reported by NK and Pundit).

Community Human Rights Groups (CHRG): Formation and strengthening CHRG in all target villages has proved most strong pressure group which in coordination with police stopped 4 marriages during project period. According to CHRG members, without disclosing their name, they informed police about marriages happening in their areas. Police intervened and stopped marriages.

Ms. "A", a resident of village of Dadu, is an activist and a member of CHRG, stopped one marriage of her close relative. According to her a 12 year girl (her cousin's daughter) who was exchanged for land, was being married with a middle age man. Just three days before her marriage, she informed DDO team and also called police officer of her area. As police were also trained under the project, thus were able to take action, by picking up the girl and arresting the parents of groom. Later on, the parents of groom broke the marriage and the parents of girl returned the land received in exchange of girl.

Outcome 01

Change in attitude of parents/communities in the areas where education status is very slow, due to centuries old customs being practiced and lack of knowledge about legal perspective of law, early marriage was not even considered as a crime. In such a challenging situation SCF and its partners implemented their activities through creating close coordination with community and achieved planned results as stated below:

The review of project reports and discussion with beneficiaries contacted during evaluation reveals that with increased knowledge (through awareness sessions) on legal consequences of ECMRA 2013 and worst impacts of early marriages on health of girls, parents in four villages of three districts delayed marriages of their underage children.

Girl's confidence has increased after getting knowledge on different forms of gender based violence being practiced at home and community level. The project documents (progress reports) reveals that awareness sessions were conducted with 350 students of 11 girls high schools from three districts. 75 of them also participated in debate competition and spoke on GBV, violation of human rights and impacts of early marriage on the life of girls. During discussion with school girls at Johi-Dadu, it was shared that in the history of these schools, it was first time when girls spoke on early marriage and GBV at schools and these sessions and activities has increased their confidence level. They are discussing now with parents and friends. According to them other schools also had shown interest in such kind of competitions in their schools. They also suggested that same activities should also be done at boys' schools.

Community Human Rights Groups (which included all age's people from 30 villages) are meeting parents and sharing information of ECMRA 2013. Groups also are linked with police, and media for reporting issues of early marriages in their respective villages of TMK, Dadu and Sukkur. Trained Youth groups are sharing information about SCMRA 2013 with peers and friend through social media (FB, SMS, and WhatsApp). In result to the stated actions, 10 underage girls were saved in three targeted districts.

GAPs identified:

Following are some of the gaps identified during FGDs with girls, parents, community and interviews with stakeholders in three districts.

Project targeted school girls only. Along with girls' students, there was need of educating teachers who are one of the influential groups and have say in students and their parents/community. They may transfer the same knowledge to every class passing through them.

Output 1.1.

The review of project documents reveals that a total of 4294 community members including parents (male &female), boys and girl increased understanding on the legal aspects of law (SCMRA 2013), Gender equality, importance of education and developed realization about worst impacts (negative) of early marriages on the lives of girls.

Two youth theater groups, trained in an interactive theater on VAW and early marriages, held 03 theater performances in three villages (one in each village) of two districts (Sukkur and Dadu). Audiences included girls, boys and parents.

Respondents at village Johi –Dadu shared that many parents of married girls cried during theater performed by youths group where they were shown how early marriage kills dream of young girls and deteriorate their whole life.

10 youth groups were trained and engaged in social media (SMS, WhatsApp) campaign for promoting law with friends and peers and reached 200 persons during project period as reported in the project document^{iv}.

Output 1.2.

Discussion with girls at DDO office, in the villages and CHRG members reveals that Girl's confidence has increased with active support from Community Human Rights group. These groups are performing their roles very actively in stopping early marriages through mobilizing parents in face to face meetings and with support from influential. Use of social media (WhatsApp, FB) and through SMS these groups are updating friend and viewers about SCMRA 2013.

A total of 30 CHR groups(one in each village) were formed and trained during

three-days training program and other platforms on Gender Equality, impacts of early marriage, and legal aspects of available law. Group members' capacity on mobilization and advocacy was enhanced and were also linked with police, media, civil society and other relevant institutions in their respective districts.

Outcome 2:

Under outcome 2, efforts were made through various interventions to improve perspective of the service provider (Nikahkawan, police, Lawyers, Health practitioners, Media and Civil society) so that they protect girls against GBV and early marriage.

Document review reveals that 30 Nikahkawan (NK) /Pundits have increased their knowledge on the legal age of marriage and legal consequences of solemnizing marriage of children below 18 years (as per business rules of SCMRA 2013).

The NK and Pundits confirmed during interviews, that after trainings conducted by SCF and its partners they are now verifying age of brides and grooms from parents, requesting birth certificate and or other available proof of age. They also shared that document proof of age is also mandatory for registration of marriage at union council(**Under administrative system of Pakistan tehsil is a subdivision**).

The project reports also reveals that it is also because of the project activities that 10 marriages were not solemnized by NK and Pundits in target villages of three districts when they found couples were under 18 years.

Generally at villages, NK doesn't access to bride for asking her consent on marriage, it is her close relatives who on behalf of NK inquire her willingness. In such traditional setups, it is difficult to say how many girls will be saved by NK.

During interview with Police officers including Assistant Superintendent Police Sukkur city and Assistant Sub Inspector Saleh Pat, they acknowledged that they learned business rules and legal aspects of the law from these project activities (half day sessions with police at each district). Police never interfered in such type of issue as it was considered a family issue, until and unless reported by someone from close relatives. After getting knowledge on the law, police is taking action by arresting the culprits (parents, NK/Pundits) involved in early marriage in their respective areas. Trained police officials are linked with other service providers(NK, CHRG and youth groups) and are responding such complains in their respective districts. More trainings and awareness sessions are required to develop a sustainable judicial system (shared by police officials interviewed).

Lawyers in three districts have also enhanced their knowledge regarding SCMRA 2013 and shown great interest regarding support to parents and girls in such cases. It was also reported by the lawyers that after getting training, they

remained part of project activities, especially during sessions with community, media and NK.

During interviews with lawyers at Dadu and Sukkur, they said laws are designed and passed but there is no effort taken by government to properly implement those laws. In their opinion this is the responsibility of government to arrange such trainings whenever a new law is passed.

During meetings it was also observed that some of them (lawyers) were not very much hopeful and feared that implementation of this law may remain ineffective as courts are still following old version of law (Child marriage Act1929)where girls marriage age is 16 years and mostly decisions taken are based on willingness of brides. Which means if girls at 16 years of age are willing to marry a man of same age or older, courts consider their marriage as legal one.

The review of project reports and meetings with following stakeholders also revealed that:

Health practitioner (Doctor, LHVs) sensitized in the project are mobilizing parents during visit to their clinics, health centers, about health issues related to early marriages. The project reports reveals that parents of 12 couples(girls and boys) whose marriages were planned earlier were delayed due to counseling by health practitioners. These trained HP also participated in sessions held with parents and girls in three districts.

Media was included in the list of stakeholder who was considered as main source of highlighting issues of early marriage and GBV and raise awareness about the present status of the available law (SCMRA2013). Sensitized media persons are highlighting issues of early marriage in their respective areas and have reported gaps in the law that affects its proper implementation.

Civil society organizations (06)and 03 implementing partners enhanced their capacities and knowledge on SCMRA, GBV, Advocacy and Mobilization, have designed projects on girls' empowerment with focus on early marriages, girls 'education, SRHR and developed linkages with District Monitoring Committee(Sukkur).

One partner (NAARI-Sukkur) has received a grant and included two villages of this project from UC SalehPat.It was also an additional result of project activities that 13 Civil Society Organizations (CSO)trained in the project jointly formed CSOs Coalition to curb child marriage.

Gaps identified during interviews with stakeholder:

The decision making authorities in the courts (Judges) were not included in the project. Inclusion and motivation of Judges may have produced decisions in accordance with SCMRA 2017.

Facilitators such as , caterers, decorator were also needed to be part of the project, as their refusal may also had an impact on reducing cases of early marriage.

Output 2.1

A total 424 service provider from three districts (including NK-30,Media-62, lawyers -92,health practitioners-41, police officers-112 and DMC members-41) received one day training on SCMRA 2013, its rules of business and their respective role in preventing cases of early marriages.

Media persons from print and electronic media are highlighting issue of early marriage with improved language and contents. Whereas, 10 trained HP with their effective motivation has convinced 20 parents not to marry girls before 18 years of age.

Output 2.2:

Review of documents and verification from stakeholders during interviews, FGDs with parents reveals that:

Nikahkhawan are inquiring age of couples before agreeing to marriage solemnization. NK applied rules of business of the law and refused to solemnize 10 planned marriages in three districts. During inquiring about age of the bride, parents did not provide true evidence of age of bride. According to NK they also confirmed from neighbors and when not get satisfied, they refused to solemnize marriages. They knew it was a crime and there can be a punishment as per rules of law which may damage their career and reputation in the area.

4 Police officials applied rules of business of the law and two of the trained lawyers followed registered cases and saved life of girls. Assistant Superintendent Police(ASP) city office Sukkur shared that a case of early marriage was registered by the neighbors of an underage girl going to be married (Case no 37216 sec 310 4/6 Child Marriage Act). They registered FIR, investigated case but the court refused on the ground of old law where girls can marry at the age of 16 years. Very next day police appeared before judge with the 2013 SCMRA Act which later accepted by Judge and resolved the case. Parents were arrested and punished according to law.

Output 2.3:

SCF did review and analysis of gaps affecting proper implementation of SCMRA 2013. Reviewed document was shared with 2 policy makers including special secretary to chief minister for Women Development Department (WDD) and Chairperson of Human Rights Commission.

Copies of SCMRA 2013 translated in Sindhi Language (by SCF)were shared with lawyers, and police officials, civil society and other stakeholders for their better

	<p>understanding.</p> <p>Held one day provincial dialogue at Karachi which was attended by Civil Society Activists, lawyers, and representatives of Sindh High Court and Chairperson of Sindh Human Rights Commission and two policy maker. The purpose of dialogue was to bring attention of the policymakers towards strengths and loopholes in SCMRA 2013, underline gaps and issues facing its implementation and extend recommendations for its effective implementation.</p> <p>02 District coordination committees (Sukkur and Dadu) improved their coordination mechanism and are conducting quarterly meetings even after completion of project. During DCC meetings NGOs working in these districts are updating project progresses. Before this project, there was no such active platform where government and NGOs could update each other regarding ongoing project activities which also caused duplication of activities in some areas..</p> <p>Outcome 3:</p> <p>Targeted secondary class female students from 11 schools of three districts have built their confidence, communication & leadership skills and knowledge about various forms of GBV and business rules of law. Learned knowledge is being shared with parents and peers. <i>(We did not know about law and GBV before training that EM is a crime and it leaves worst impacts on life of girls. We learned it during training session held by the project in our schools-shared by Students of Johigovt girls school)</i></p> <p>Girls further added that First time in the life; they participated in the district level debate competition and spoke on GBV, SCMRA 2013 and importance of education. In their opinion these kinds of activities should be part of their curricular activities at every school including boys.</p> <p>Output 3.1:</p> <p>150 students from 11 secondary schools of three districts (TMK, Dadu and Sukkur) were provided 3 days training on communication & leadership skills. Students received knowledge on various forms of GBV and the law against early marriage.</p> <p>Three debate competitions, one in each district, were held for students of same schools (trained on leadership skills) who spoke on GBV, importance of education and law that protects girls from early marriage. In total 350 students participated in the event and improved knowledge on worst impacts of early marriage, law protecting ECM and GBV.⁴In the opinion of girls contacted during evaluation, these kinds of activities enhance knowledge and builds confidence of students. In future if anything happens to them, they are now in a position to</p>
--	---

⁴ Interview with students of Johi girls schools-Dadu

	defend or take an action against it.
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Review of project documents including progress reports, project proposal, Monitoring reports, media reports, and training /awareness session reports. FGDs, KII, meetings
Conclusions	<p>Based on the analysis of secondary and primary data it can be concluded that project has achieved its goal, <i>'Girls in 03 districts of Sindh have increased protection against early marriages by December 2017'</i> through engaging parents, girls ,boys and service providers by creating awareness and understating on harmful impacts of early marriages and the law against early marriage.</p> <p>Some of the stakeholder (teachers, Judges, caterers and decorators) are missed in this project, which if were included, have had positive contribution in the implementation of law and protection to girls from early marriage. Gaps in SCMRA2013 as identified may cause hindrance in implementation of law but still there is a move initiated by this project which needs persuasion on regular basis. Overall a shift in the attitudes was observed in all primary and secondary beneficiaries contacted during evaluation.</p>

Evaluation criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question	1. To what extent did the project reach the targeted beneficiaries at the project goal and outcome levels? How many beneficiaries have been reached?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>The project reached 3915 beneficiaries both primary and secondary in 30 villages of three district of Sindh province. These included:</p> <p>Primary beneficiaries Girls 694 (Under 18 years of age) Female 2053 Boys is 404 Male 762</p> <p>Secondary beneficiaries 30 Nikahkawan 112 Police 41 Health Practitioners 62Media persons 92 Lawyers 41 DMC members Project documents reported 200 youths were reached through social media campaign till Dec 2017.</p>
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response	Source of data was review of available documents and meetings with project implementing partners.

and analysis above	
Conclusions	Review of the documents and discussion with project implementers reveals that the project has exceeded its original targets at goal, outcome and output level. Engaging Nikahkawan, project has reached untargeted beneficiaries of many neighboring villages, as they are also invited by outsiders for solemnizing their marriages. Use of social media, SMS has also reached to a number youths and proved a good source of promoting law against early marriage in and outside their respective areas.

Evaluation criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question	2. To what extent has this project generated positive changes in the lives of targeted (and untargeted) women and girls in relation to the specific forms of violence addressed by this project? Why? What are the key changes in the lives of those women and/or girls? Please describe those changes.
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>Raised awareness and understanding on GBV, EM and the law: The project raised awareness among girls and women(as evidenced from their participation and sharing of information during FGDs and interviews) on various forms of violence, worst impact of early marriage on girls’ health and their social life and importance of education. Understanding aspects of ECMRA 2013 and human rights brought a positive change in lives of girls who are still not married or saved by project activities.</p> <p>Participation of 350 girls from high schools in debate /essay competition and sharing their opinion on early marriage and its negative impacts is an indication of level of awareness and confidence among girls.</p> <p>Sensitization to parents has brought shifts in the attitudes (as reported in the project documents and also observed during FGDs) regarding early marriage and realization about importance of education for girls. In result to advanced knowledge about law, parents in three villages of targeted districts delayed marriages which were fixed with their relatives and retained education of their children.</p> <p>After getting awareness about law and learning leadership & communication skills, girls studying at schools have shown positive sign of motivating their parents for themselves and their younger brother, sisters and other relatives in family.</p> <p><i>We learned from trainings that ECM is a crime and it harms life of girls. We also received training in leadership skills. Now it is our responsibility to take action such as spreading knowledge among fellow students. We did share knowledge with other students at school, our parents and other family members. These kind of trainings need to be continued in schools-shared by students of class 9, and10 from govt girls schools of Johi-Dadu.</i></p>

	<p>Community human rights groups have proved a very strong pressure group in securing underage girls from early marriage. With their active watch, 10 young girls were saved from early marriage who were going to be married at targeted villages</p> <p>After training CHRG group members used to call a meeting with parents of bride and groom 10 days before the marriage ceremony and consult them regarding age of children to be married. When they found underage girls, they motivated parents to delay marriages and informed them about health issues and legal consequences of marriage. In some cases they informed directly to police where counseling was not successful- shared by an activist, Mohammad Ramzan from village Yaar Mohammad Lashari-TM K.</p> <p>Education of girls: Some of the girls (about 10 girls from three districts as reported in project documents) saved from early marriage went back to school, and got an opportunity to live at least 18 years of their life at parents’ home. The parents⁵contacted by evaluation consultant team had also agreed that they will send their girls to school and will focus on their education. In villages of TMK, parents also demanded schools in their villages where they can send their girls.</p> <p>Untargeted women and girls: As for as change in the lives of untargeted girls and women is concerned, community contacted during evaluation visits shared that this information is also spread in the neighboring villages via word of mouth and social media. During project activities, the marriage of an underage girl in Talhar (untargeted area) was stopped by a police officer who was trained in the project. Moulvi⁶/NK who was solemnizing marriage and parents of groom were locked up. This act alerted many parents and service providers of targeted and neighboring areas and increased girls’ confidence on the law.</p> <p>A strong and long lasting impact of this project can be achieved if girls and women are also empowered through different vocational skills and support of tools in same targeted areas. The major cause of early marriage in many families is poverty. When girls are earning and supporting parents, they may have a say regarding their marriage and parents also would not feel them as burden.</p>
<p>Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above</p>	<p>Progress reports, FGD and KII with women and girls, boys and other stakeholders.</p>
<p>Conclusions</p>	<p>The project has left a significant impact on lives of women and girls (both targeted and untargeted) in respect to awareness and knowledge about early marriages and legal aspects of SCMRA 2013. The key success in this regard is</p>

⁵ Village Misri Kolhi –TMK and Sodho Khan Sarwari- Sukkur

⁶ Moulvi is religious person who solemnize marriages along with other religious rites

	reduction in cases of early marriage due to intervention by trained stakeholders and mobilized parents in targeted villages as reported by the beneficiaries contacted during evaluation in three district of Sindh and readmission of some girls in the school as reported earlier in same question.

Evaluation criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question	3. What internal and external factors contributed to the achievement and/or failure of the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs? How?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>SCF implemented some of its activities such as awareness and advocacy session at community and district level in partnership with three local organizations (Baade Sab-TM Khan, DDO-Dadu and NAARI Foundation-Sukkur). All the three partners already had presence in some of the targeted villages. This helped in smooth implementation of activities and achievement of project goal.</p> <p>Close coordination with partner organizations and timely follow ups, technical support from SCF to local partner organizations in management of project activities and documentation was helpful in achieving targets.</p> <p>Sensitizing youths and civil societies proved effective tool in achievement of project goal.</p> <p>Selecting and Sensitizing direct beneficiaries (girls and parents) and indirect beneficiaries, the opinion leader (Police, Lawyer, Nikahkawan, media and community human rights groups) on impacts of ECM and legal consequences of ECMRA 2013.</p> <p>Hiring of independent project team (project manager, advocacy officer and accountant) for project life with required capacities was one of the major factors in contributing achievement of the stated project goal, outcomes and outputs. The team paid its due time and focused on achievement of the project targets to bring a visible change in the project areas.</p> <p>Timely monitoring of project activities for keeping project on the right track. With effective monitoring, timely gaps were identified and corrections were made.</p> <p>Technical assistance from Un Women Trust Fund supported implementing agency in timely and efficiently implementation of project activities. Along with technical assistance, if budget for project staff of implementing partners of SCF were provided, these results would have been more impactful. Due to financial</p>

	constraints, partners hired volunteers who could not pay as much attention as a fully paid staff can ⁷ .
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Meeting with SCF management, and partner organization KII with stakeholders
Conclusions	From selection of beneficiaries, to relationship with partner organization project went smooth and achieved project goals. Success of the project goes to effective monitoring, timely technical support to partners and coordination with stakeholders at district level.

Evaluation criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question	4. To what extent was the project successful in advocating for girls protection against child marriages? If it was not successful, explain why
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>The project successfully advocated for girls protection at local, district and provincial level. Success of the interventions can be measured from following results:</p> <p>At local level project trained and sensitized parents on worst impacts of EM with support from health practitioner and CHRG through awareness sessions and interactive theater resulted in change of mind of some parents who delayed marriages of their children, already planned.</p> <p>Sensitized NK and pundits started verifying age of brides and groom before making commitments for marriage solemnization.</p> <p>Police officials, media admitted that before trainings they were not aware about the law, never considered child marriage a legal crime. Sensitized police officials in four villages of targeted districts took timely action and stopped marriage of underage girls during project period. Two lawyers provided legal service in cases of early marriage and media have highlighted issues,(reported in documents and verified during interviews with lawyers).</p> <p>30 members from 13CSOs capacity was built on human rights, GBV and the law to advocate girls protection against EM, have started designing projects on human/women rights and two of them (NARI and PEACE Foundation) have received grants.</p> <p>At Provincial level, sharing review of law with two parliamentarians of Sindh Assembly and conducting provincial dialogue on proper implement of law, which was attended by about 100 people including community, partners and</p>

⁷Pervaiz Ali Bahoto-Directo DDO

	other project stakeholders, was an effort to ensure girls protection from early marriage. Though at provincial level change is not very much visible, but the issue is brought into the table for discussion. The plus point is that new projects are planned on same theme and SCF has a full time advocacy officer, therefore the follow up at provincial level may keep going on.
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Document review, KII, meetings with SCF, implanting partners.
Conclusions	The project achievements reflects a success in advocating girls protection at local and district level, whereas at provincial level more follow ups and strong lobbying is needed. Two years project for behavior change on such a sensitive issue that is deeply rooted in the traditions is like throwing pebble in the mighty ocean.

Evaluation criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question	5. Have key stakeholders responded effectively cases of early marriages?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>The findings of evaluation reveals that during project period almost all targeted stakeholders provided due support and saved about 200 girls from early marriage in the targeted villages of TMK, Dadu and Sukkur. The actions taken by the targeted stakeholders in three districts are highlighted below:</p> <p>03 Police officers (SHO) trained in the project; two from Dadu and one of Sukkur district applied SCMRA 2013 rules of business and stopped three child marriages from being solemnized.</p> <p>10 Nikahkhanan and pundits from target villages applied rules of business and refused to solemnize marriage when parents failed to satisfy them regarding age of the brides and grooms. With knowledge about law, NK /Pundits are verifying age of bride and groom from the documents such as birth certificate, CNIC</p> <p>Health practitioners were engaged throughout awareness session in community and took active part in mobilizing parents on worst impacts of early marriages on girl's health. With effective counseling, they convinced 20 parents who delayed marriages of their children already planned with neighbors⁸.</p> <p>One case of early marriage in Johi Taluka was stopped with timely legal support provided from a lawyer Mr. A who filed a petition and called police at the venue of the marriage. Another female advocate (Ms. A) also provided legal support in case of early marriage at Johi, Dadu.</p>

⁸ Progress report, verified from the staff of implementing partners, Health practitioner during field visit by consultant

	<p>Media persons supported and highlighted issues of early marriages in print and electronic media. After getting awareness of the law, the media also supported SCF and highlighted gaps identified during review of the law.</p> <p>District Monitoring Committee, already formed by the Government, was briefed on their role regarding implementation of rule of the law (SCMRA 2013). DMCs in Dadu and Sukkur have improved their coordination mechanism and have started conducting quarterly meetings.</p> <p>Community human rights groups performed their role of mobilizing parents and youths and created awareness on the issue of early marriage and legal aspects of the law. With effective mobilization, and coordination with other stakeholders stopped early marriages in four targeted villages.</p> <p>Youth groups through theater performance and social media spread information about SCMRA 2013 and the worst impacts of early marriage with their community and friends. During theater performances, parents who had already married their underage girls were found upset and some of them even cried during show (shared by an activist from Dadu district).</p> <p>CSO took part in discussion on gaps in implementation of SCMRA 2014 at local level and designed projects with focus on early marriage and SCMRA 2013 for some of the same areas and also included other districts experiencing issue of EM and violence against women.</p>
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Review of project reports, KII with CHRG members/activists, FGDs with parents and stakeholders.
Conclusions	Overall stakeholder response throughout project period and after project remained amazing. All stakeholders tried to perform their utmost in helping to achieve the goal of the project.

Evaluation criteria	Relevance
Evaluation Question	1) To what extent was the project strategy and activities implemented relevant in responding to the needs of women and girls?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	See the response of question 2
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the	

evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	
Conclusions	

Evaluation criteria	Relevance
Evaluation Question	2) To what extent do achieved results (project goal, outcomes and outputs) continue to be relevant to the needs of women and girls?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>The project strategy and activities had high contextual relevance to the needs of girls and women in the targeted villages of three districts(TMK, Dadu and Sukkur) and will be needed.</p> <p>Female literacy rate in Sindh and particularly project areas is very low due to old mindset of parents and community and inappropriate education facilities. This is the reason that girls and women are not aware about human rights and available law that protects girls and women. The practice of early marriage was so internalized that it was not considered as a crime. Forced conversion of religion and fear of girl’s resistance, marriages in early age was considered by parents as the only solution to problems. High rate of poverty in these areas is another factor inducing parents to marry their girls as soon as possible.</p> <p>The project strategy was designed to respond occurrence of early marriage within intervention areas using following approaches:</p> <p>Preventing violence through mobilizing and developing capacities of community groups and leaders, strengthening institutional responses and improving service delivery.</p> <p>Selected human rights activists, trained in human rights, advocacy and motivation skills, motivated parents and promoted law which resulted reduction in the frequency of child marriage(At least parents and facilitators are aware about legal consequences early marriages).</p> <p>Engagement of relevant service provider (NK, HP, police, lawyers and media) provided legal support to the victims of early marriage has also proved a good strategy.</p> <p>Advocacy at provincial level has not created an immediate impact but identification of gaps in the law are highlighted and communicated to the relevant stakeholders. Proper implementation by state would induce behavior change of all stakeholders.</p> <p>Developing leadership skills among school girls proved an effective tool in spreading information on GBV and child marriage among friends and fellow students. Giving the opportunity of expression of their opinion through a debate competition enabled girls to negotiate their human rights.</p>
Quantitative and/or	Document review, FGDs, KII

qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	
Conclusions	<p>The project strategy and activities designed were very much relevant with the immediate and future needs of the community, particularly girls and women. There was a need to create awareness among girls, women and their parents to prevent early marriages which are not considered as crime.</p> <p>Training and sensitizing stakeholders who have influence in the life of community was direly needed to bring behavior change in parents and community at local level.</p>

Evaluation Criteria	Efficiency
Evaluation Question	How efficiently and timely has this project been implemented and managed in accordance with the Project Document?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>Discussion with senior management of SCF and partner's organization and review of documents reveals that project was implemented and managed in accordance with the project document/timeline. The project efficiently covered all projected activities with given resources and timeframe. Project was able to keep operational cost aligned with available budget by Hiring local staff and carrying out some of the activities by using in house expertise.</p> <p>Approach to trained and implement certain activities through local origination proved very much successful in many aspects such as: it reduced implementation cost, strong local monitoring mechanism and data generation which otherwise could be very costly and less effective. Mobility cost was also curtailed down through involving local activist in project areas.</p>
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Documents review, discussions with project management/partners.
Conclusions	Project activities are implemented within timeframe as stated in the proposal.

Evaluation Criteria	Sustainability
Evaluation Question	How are the achieved results, especially the positive changes generated by the project in the lives of women and girls at the project goal level, going to be sustained after this project ends?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>It was evident from discussion with parents and girls during FGDs and interviews at targeted villages, that the project's direct beneficiaries (girls and women) are well equipped with information on worst impacts of early marriage on health of girls and the recent development in law against early marriage.</p>

This information will also remain with the girls not married yet and those who are married at early age. Women contacted during field visit by consultant, shared that worst impact of early marriage they have experienced themselves by being married at a tender age (before 18). They said that they will not get their children to pass through the same situation. ***It was difficult to manage home, in-laws and husband. I always remained confused and depressed after marriage-Ms.R, a 16 year old mother of a child from Misri Kolhi-TMK.***

Progress reports reveals that 150 school girls oriented on impacts of early marriage, violation of human rights and SCMRA law will continue to share this with peers and transfer this knowledge to others. The same information was confirmed during interview with school girls from Johi-Dadu and Dodo Sarwari-Sukkur.

The same applies to community human rights and Youth-led groups as they have been trained by the project and have saved lives of many girls of their areas from early marriage through mobilization and informing police where parents were not mobilized. These groups are linked with other stakeholders such as police, media and civil society.

Even after project ended, these group members were found active and committed. A youth counselor (Mr. T from UC Ghulam Shah Bajrani TMK) trained under youth group by SCF published a penaflex with information about SCMRA 2013 and distributed within villages of UC. Another Activist from a village in district Sukkur, who is a teacher and owner of school, also shared that during morning assembly, students are given lecture on impacts of early marriage, human/women rights and legal consequences of law. He himself postponed marriage of his 18 years old son which was planned earlier with a 16 year old girl from his relatives.

Nikahkhawan and Pundits are also sensitized on the legal consequences of law. This stakeholder has a great say and influence on the community at large. They have become conscious and are now verifying age of the brides and grooms before making any commitment of solemnizing marriage. During interview with NK/Pundits, it was revealed that Majority of NK are Moazin (Moulvi), they will continue sharing information during Juma prayers. Hindu Pundits trained by SCF have stopped and delayed marriages in their villages; It was also shared during the meeting with Hindu community that their Maharaj Mr. P was also trained by SCF, now he doesn't allow anyone to get their children married before the age of 18 years. It was also revealed⁹ that information is being shared with all participants of Hindu community during gatherings on different occasion such as festival after pilgrimage and other rituals.

NK and Pundits role can be more effective if they themselves contact brides regarding consent of marriage. Still girl's close relatives (brother, uncle) are

⁹ Shared by Sham mall, an activist and a councilor from village Misri Kolhi

asked to get information about girls consent. Still more trainings to NK are required at wider scale.

Building capacity of local CSO in targeted three districts on GBV, child marriage and advocacy skills, project has ensured sustainability of the project which is evident from the actions taken by CSOs during project period. With local partners; SCF had easy access to community. These trained CSOs are promoting cause of girl empowerment. Two local CSOs, NAARI foundation and Peace foundation have received grants from Amplify Change to address health aspects of adolescent girls under their SRHR programs. These CSO are covering 30 villages in Sukkur and Mirpurkhas with inclusion of some village of Sukkur from current project.

To keep the impact of project sustainable, SCF has also won grant for a two year project focusing SRHR as tool to curb early marriage in three targeted districts and will cover existing and new villages.

Police and media were also unaware about recent developments in the law protecting girls from early marriage. It was also shared that they had not been updated on any development in law by the state; neither copies of law are shared with them. SCF and partners during one day session briefed police, lawyers and media (separately) on the law and also shared copy of the law which was also translated into local language for better understanding and implementation of rules of business.

Some of the trained police and media persons have applied acquired knowledge in their routine investigation and highlighted incidents of early marriage in their areas as stated in responses of earlier questions. But for keeping this practice continues, they (police officials, lawyers, NK/Pundits interviewed by consultant) demanded more sessions and availability of different laws on GBV, human rights in local language at government office.

It was also pointed out by the lawyers during meetings that along with lawyer, if Judges were also having been included as stakeholder, the result would have more sustainable as both were to be working in same line to restrain early marriage.

At provincial level, the initiative taken under project will not produce quick response due to slow process and lack of interest among parliamentarians plus the pressure from religious parties. Follow up on regular basis is needed. One plus point is that SCF has a full time advocacy officer; therefore follow up regarding amendments in law will definitely keep going.

Have collective efforts of the community helped to protect girls against early marriage?

Please see previous response.

	<p>How effectively have stakeholders involved in implementation of Sindh Child Marriages restraint act 2013 responded to cases of early marriages?</p> <p>During meetings with SCF team and partners it was shared that SCF and NAR Foundation has earned projects for the same areas to enhance the impact of project activities. SCF's project funded by DAI would work for school enrollment and alternate livelihood for girls.</p> <p>NAARI Foundation's project funded by AmplifyChange will also focus on implementation of SCMRA 2013 in north Sindh including two villages of Taluka Saleh Pat from previous project.</p>
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Review of reports, FGD and KII with project implementers, community and other stakeholders in three districts.
Conclusions	Overall, these findings reflect that project has a significant potential for sustainability and continuity of activities undertaken by the stakeholders involved. However; there are few limiting factors which need to be addressed to ensure sustainability of the project goal.

Evaluation Criteria	Impact
Evaluation Question	What are the unintended consequences (positive and negative) resulted from the project?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>Unintended positive consequences</p> <p>Education is valued (by all stakeholders contacted by consultant) as a base for stopping incidences of early marriages. Both parents and girls realized and made illiteracy responsible for practices of GBV and EM. Parents showed a change in their attitudes¹⁰ by sending back girls to schools and demanded schools and livelihood skills for youths (both girls and boys).</p> <p>The project has created a sense of women empowerment among both primary and secondary beneficiaries. Parents contacted by consultant shown keen interest in empowering their girls before marrying them. Other stakeholders were also of the opinion that through provision of alternate livelihood skills and support to girls, it will reduce frequency of early marriage as most of the parents marry their girls due poverty.</p> <p>Information about the law has reached untargeted areas through NK/Pundits and youth groups via SMS and WhatsApp. During the project period, a case of early marriage was reported in Talhar(a divisional unit of district Badin). One of the police officer (SHO) who was trained by SCF registered a case and stopped</p>

¹⁰ Progress report and discussion with parents and girls

	<p>the marriage. The NK (NiazAhmed) was arrested and punished. This certain case has left a great impact on both targeted and untargeted areas of the project.</p> <p>Birth of Peace foundation by joining 13 CSOs, by the end of training provided by SCF is an impact of project. PF has designed SRHR to curb early marriage and also received grant from the Amplify Change.</p> <p>Unintended negative consequences</p> <p>As such no big negative impact was found during collection of primary data and review of secondary sources of information.</p> <p>There is a little confusion on implementation of law. Courts are still following old version of law (1929) where girl's age for marriage is 16 years. Due to this many parents or other perpetrators may take benefit.</p> <p>Clash between relatives and neighbors on the matter of refusing or delaying marriages was also reported but its intensity is not very high as reported by the respondents during field visit. Very few families experiencing it. But due to knowledge spread among parents, NK and other stakeholders regarding legal consequences and punishments, they avoid taking any serious action against parents or girls.</p> <p>While taking with NK/Pundits, it was revealed that there are some unregistered NKs who can secretly manage underage marriages in the villages out of project area. They added that it should be mandatory to have a license/certificate from Nikkah registrar for solemnizing marriages.</p> <p>A child marriage was stopped at Talhar district, where NK along with parents of girl and boy were arrested by a police officer trained under project (Later transferred to Talhar) was narrated by every NK/Pundit during interviews with consultant. It became viral through social media. That incident has created a fear among NK/Pundits of not only project area but also in other districts of Sindh.</p>
<p>Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above</p>	<p>Discussion with primary and secondary beneficiaries, partners, SCF and review of reports.</p>
<p>Conclusions</p>	<p>The project has left greater positive unintended impacts than negative. Negative unintended impacts can be minimized with little efforts such as addressing missing factors in the future interventions and implementation mechanism of the SCMRA .</p>

<p>Evaluation Criteria</p>	<p>Knowledge Generated</p>
<p>Evaluation Question</p>	<p>1) What are the key lessons learned that can be shared with other</p>

	practitioners on Ending Violence against Women and Girls?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>In absence of law implementation mechanism at district level, cases of early marriage were not tackled effectively at police stations and courts.</p> <p>Lack of proper age verification system at NADRA offices, may provide a room to perpetrators to get CNIC with desired age.</p> <p>The project sustainability can be ensured by introducing supporting programs for beneficiaries (both girls not experienced EM and victims of EM). In absence of alternate support to the girls saved from early marriages under this project keep them vulnerable. These girls needs to be empowered through provision of informal education, livelihood skills and required financial support in form of tools and materials.</p> <p>Engaging police officials in monitoring proved a good strategy in achieving goal of the project. These police officials (SSP-Sukkur) instructed Moulvi /NK to follow the legal rules of business regarding early marriage.</p> <p>In such a conservative and illiterate society direct discussion on legal aspects of EM were not have produced encouraging impacts. Focusing health impacts of early marriage with support from health practitioners proved effective tool in reaching parents and girls in changing their attitudes and behaviors.</p> <p>Girls' leadership training and debate competition proved an effective source of spreading knowledge on GBV and child marriage among girls studying in schools. These events raised awareness and built confidence of girls who may now be more alert and conscious about the right to education. These activities were highly appreciated by school administration of other schools and requested to target more schools.</p> <p>Youth led groups spread information on the law through social media and SMS. This was considered a best and easy way to reach maximum people within and outside target area. This could have more impact if local cable operators had also included in the list of stakeholder (indicated by stakeholders during interviews). Through cables strong messages about worst impacts of early marriage and consequences of not following the law could have been delivered to community and facilitators.</p> <p>Inclusion of Judges and teachers was equally important which might have left strong impacts. Teachers have regular interaction with students and indirectly with parents and can influence parents intaking decisions of marriages for their girls.</p> <p>Lawyers and police were made aware on the new law, but Judges were missed. These three stakeholders should be on the same page regarding law used for prevention of child marriage.</p>

	<p>SCMRA 2013 was reviewed and gaps were documented and shared with parliamentarian. There is need to keep follow ups for early response to amendments and get legal status of recommendations.</p> <p>Partnership with three local organizations helped in smooth and timely completion of the project activities. All the three partners were already engaged with same community therefore SCF and partners did not receive big threat or challenge during implementation of the project on a very sensitive issue.</p> <p>Partnering with local organizations helped SCF by working in optimization cost model they contributed their time of human resource, volunteers involved in projects activities .</p> <p>Local partners technical capacity enhanced, coordination with stakeholder at district level improved. During project, NAARI and PEACE designed projects on SRHR and won grant.</p>
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Document review, discussion with implanters, stakeholders
Conclusions	The evaluation reveals that project has learned a number of lessons regarding early marriage in the target area. While designing future project by SCF and its partner learned lessons may increase chances of success in implementation of project.

Evaluation Criteria	Knowledge Generated
Evaluation Question	2) Are there any promising practices? If yes, what are they and how can these promising practices be replicated in other projects and/or in other countries that have similar interventions
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	<p>Interactive theater in local language proved a best tool in creating awareness on worst impacts of early marriage and SCMRA. Majority of the community was illiterate and the subject was of very sensitive nature. It was an easy method to get them understand the subject.</p> <p>Girl's leadership skill through awareness on GBV, education and early marriages is a good strategy to access more girls. Such practice can be used in other project of same nature with boys as well. subject covering health related and socio-economic issues of EM on life of girls and family should also be part of the school syllabus (school girls of Johi-Dadu)</p> <p>Creating awareness among NK and Pundits also proved best option in spreading knowledge among community. These persons are very much respected by community. During Friday prayer, they can include topic of early marriage in their discussions. Same applies to Pundits, as they also have a great say in their community.</p>

	<p>Keeping watch on issues of early marriage in the targeted villages and sharing with stakeholders without identification of reporter's name was best approach in avoiding conflict among local community.</p> <p>Use of social media with help of youths in spreading information on the law was also a best way to access maximum number of recipients.</p> <p>Engagement of trainer familiar with local culture and values and use of manual in local language was a best practice in this project.</p>
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	Document review, discussion with project implementers, beneficiaries and stakeholder.
Conclusions	Empowering girls and boys through knowledge and spreading powerful messages on early marriage and SCMRA through social media were most promising practices in the project. Involving influential groups such as NK/Pundits and Health Practitioners enhanced the impact of project which can be used by organizations working on same projects with such kind of community.

12. Conclusion

Evaluation criteria	Conclusion
Overall	<p>The evaluation finding suggests that project has clearly been successful in achieving its targets at the goal, outcomes and output level in a very efficient manner. This is demonstrated in achieved targets, increased awareness and knowledge about early marriage and legal aspects of SCMRA2013 in targeted, untargeted areas and reduction in cases of early marriage (as reported in the documents) in the project area.</p> <p>Selection of stakeholder such as NK/Pundits, health practitioners and involvement of local community human right activists and youth groups proved best practice in improving security to girls against early marriage in the project area.</p> <p>Strong Coordination and timely technical support to local implementing partner and close coordination with stakeholders at district and community level helped SCF in achievement of set targets. Project strategy and activities were found relevant to the need of community and there is significant potential for its sustainability. To maintain the impact and continuity for longer time and in wider community, SCF and its two partners have designed and received funding for same project areas to supplement and continue work on curbing early marriages with same beneficiaries.</p>

<p>Effectiveness</p>	<p>The project has left visible impact on the lives of targeted primary beneficiaries. Project was effective in implementing its activities at community level. Life of about 200 girls saved from early marriage during project period (two years) in three districts was a key achievement of the project. Developing skills of school girls through knowledge on law and GBV, providing opportunity to debate on the issue, was an effective strategy to reach maximum girls who could be the victims of early marriage.</p> <p>At school level teachers also need to be trained to increase impact of the project due to their close relation with girls and their families. Knowledge about available law has created confidence and sense of protection among girls and women. To capitalize the gains from this project, SCF and partners lobby for inclusion of topics on impacts of early marriage in school syllabus at middle class level.</p> <p>It was shared by the implementing local partners that training to NK/Pundits and health practitioners and their involvement during mobilization sessions with parents regarding impact of early marriage on the health of girls helped in behavior change of parents. These actors have great influence in rural parts of Sindh province.</p> <p>Using interactive theater in local language and mobilization through local activists increased effectiveness of the project aiming to curb early marriage in targeted villages of three districts.</p> <p>At district level. Project has created awareness about SCMRA 2013. For farther impact, more training are needed for police.</p> <p>Sensitization to lawyers might have been more effective if judges were also trained. Media play a vital role in raising awareness and highlighting issues. Training to media persons has changed their perception regarding issue of early marriage, it was considered as family issue therefore media avoided to highlight it. This shift in mindset of media persons is result of the project activities.</p> <p>Regular monitoring by SCF team and meetings with partners also played a vital role in success of project.</p>
<p>Relevance</p>	<p>The project was found to be highly relevant to the needs of girls and women of targeted areas. As stated above, early marriage is being practiced without considering it a crime due to lack of knowledge and awareness. This project has created awareness about the violation of their human rights and gave them knowledge about law for protection of their right. There was a need and will remain need of the coming years to create awareness among girls, women regarding human rights and GBV and their parents to prevent early marriages which were not considered even as crime. This two years project was not sufficient for eliminating deeply rooted tradition and practices prevailing in the society since centuries. To bring a visible change, more projects combatting human rights violations are needed for undeveloped/less</p>

	<p>developed rural parts of Sindh province.</p> <p>Stakeholders (NK/Pundit & HP) who are in direct interaction and have influence on lives of community was direly needed to be sensitized for the purpose of bringing behavior change in parents and community. The evaluation reveals that more projects of same nature needs to be implemented at wider scale for long lasting impact.</p>
Efficiency	<p>Throughout the life of project effort was made to bring a shift in the behaviors of girls/women, parents, and service providers regarding negative impacts of early marriage on the health of girls and advocate proper implementation of SCMRA 2013 at district and provincial level.</p> <p>Organizing human rights group, youth groups and engaging civil society, project has achieved its goal. These groups proved strong pressure groups in mobilization parent and keeping vigilance on the incidents of EM. At the same time training in use of social media increased awareness within project and untargeted areas.</p> <p>Training and engaging NK/Pundits and health practitioners provided easy access to parents and achieving the results. This is one of best practice that can be used in other project of same nature.</p> <p>Project involving local partners in implementation of some activities achieved its targets with time frame and assigned budget. Due to the presence of local partners in the targeted communities, and earlier experience in women related projects, project activities went smooth and fruitful in terms of project goal achievement.</p>
Sustainability	<p>The project managed to instill a sense of realization among primary and secondary beneficiaries regarding impacts of EM and legal consequences of law. This was observed during evaluation meetings and the review of documents. Parents are contacting NK/Pundits before deciding marriages of their children, NK and pundits are verifying age of the brides and grooms before making any commitment in solemnization of marriage.</p> <p>Building capacity and engaging CSO in advocacy for protection of girls from early marriage also ensures sustainability of project. These organizations have designed project and received grants for same cause and communities. Community trusts these local organizations, due to which implementation of project activities went smooth.</p> <p>Moreover, engaging local human rights group and youths for promoting awareness on law and impacts of EM were found committed and active even after project duration.</p> <p>Media has changed its reporting language and taking issues of EM as national instead of domestic problem. Police and lawyers shown keen interest in implementation of law and protection to girls against early marriage. More training was demanded by these actors for sustainability of the project activities.</p>

Impact	The project addressed the issue of EM that deeply rooted in customs and traditions of the rural and tribal areas of Sindh province. There is a great impact left by project which was evident from the attitudes of parents, boys, girls and service providers. The project stimulated discussion on the topic of early marriage at school level for the first time in the targeted district. These discussions are now taking place among friends and parents. Parent, particularly mothers have shown attitude of not to marry their girls before 18 and would prefer to send them to schools. Advocacy at provincial level regarding amendments in the present law and its implementation needs strong persuasion and follow up.
Knowledge Generation	The project generated knowledge and lessons for future programming. Use of school students, community human rights groups and youth groups stood out as a successful strategy in creating awareness on GBV and early marriage and reducing incidents of early marriage. Engagement of service provider at local level to implement law was essential for the success of the project.

13. Recommendations

S#	Recommendation	Responsibility
1	It was demonstrated that most of the early marriages are taking place due to poverty. Along with advocacy on protection of girls from EM, there is need to provide support to the victims of early marriage in form of trainings in alternate employable skills, informal education and provision of safe homes at district and UC level.	SCF, partners org being involved in project implementation, District Management Committees
2	To bring sustainable behavioral changes and eliminate deep rooted negative traditions of early marriage, there should be long term interventions rather than short term projects. Two years' time- period is like putting pebble into mighty ocean which may not make a noise.	SCF, Partner org. donor
3	Mobilization through interactive theatre in local language proved fruitful approach. Communities where literacy rate is very low, theater leave strong and long-term impact.	SCF, Partner org
4	Arrangement of more discussion forums, speeches and essay competitions on these topics would help to open up discussion on the topics and its negative impacts and will prove more helpful in creating knowledge among youths regarding these harmful practices.	SCF, Partner org, school management
5	Training to NK/Pundits and health practitioners proved successful strategy in achieving goal of the project. It is recommended that duration of trainings/sessions should be increased and scope of training needs to be widen by including more NK from other remote villages.	SCF, Partner org
6	There is also need to train Nikah registrar who in turn will make NK/Pundits bound to follow rules of business of law.	SCF, Partner org, government
7	Marriage bureau/Catering shop owners should also be sensitized on the law	SCF, Partner org
8	Lobby for implementation of SCMRA 2013 at all level of judiciary. It was reported by lawyer and police that Judges are still following old version of law which give parent/girls right to marry at the age of 16 years.	Sindh government,

	Implementation of new law at all levels should be made mandatory; otherwise many perpetrators would access to courts and get favors.	
9	Before trainings by this project, none of the stakeholder targeted under project were aware about the law, neither have received copies of law at their offices. Any development/amendment in the law should be shared with key stakeholders from provincial to UC level for proper understanding and implementation of rules of business. All laws need to be translated into local language and made available at government offices.	Sindh government
10	More pressure groups needs to be formed and strengthen for strong enforcement of the laws through vigilance and reporting to relevant government and non- governmental organizations of the area.	SCF, Partner org
11	Trainings on EM and SCMRA plus any bills/laws passed on violation of women/girls rights should also be extended to teachers and shall be included in the school syllabus for class 8, 9 or 10. During trainings, documentaries of relevant success stories should be shown to trainees.	SCF, Government
12	Emerging grass root level organization working for women rights and or on early marriage often lack technical expertise and financial hardships, hence strengthening of these groups through technical and financial supports would prove more helpful in achieving better result.	SCF, donor
13	More messages of negative impacts EM and legal punishments to perpetrators should be announced through local TV cable and radio.	Government, SCF, partners
14	Major/strong point from the law regarding legal age and legal aspects of law should be displayed at courts, police stations, press clubs, mosques and offices of local councilors through posters with text, pictures or using cartoons.	Government, SCF, partner org

14. Final Version of ToRs

1. Background and Context

1.1 Description of the project that is being evaluated.

The project aims to engage a wide array of stakeholders – including civil society, youth, the police, the media, the judiciary and religious leaders – in 30 villages across Sindh Province in creating a safe and protective community environment for girls at risk of early marriage. The project seeks to curb early marriages through community human rights awareness and by encouraging local stakeholders to be vigilant in identifying violations of the early marriage legislation. It will also encourage them to become agents of change, promoting the effective implementation of the Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013 . The project will also promote girls’ leadership as a tool to eliminate violence and early marriages.

a) Name of the project and the organization: Curb early marriages Through human rights education and advocacy in Sindh Pakistan – Sindh Community Foundation

b) Project duration, project start date and end date

1st Jan 2016 to 31st Dec 2017

c) Current project implementation status with the timeframe to complete the project

Project has completed 7 Quarters only one quarter is behind.

d) Description of the specific forms of violence addressed by the project

The project aims to address early marriage as a form of violence against women in Sindh province of Pakistan. According to Pakistan's 2007 Demographic and Health Survey, 50 per cent of women aged between 15 and 29 marry by the age of 20 and 7 per cent become mothers by the age of 15. In 2013, the Sindh Assembly passed the Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act, prohibiting the marriage of children below the age of 18. This is the first legislative tool to curb early marriage in the country.

Of the many ills that plague the Pakistani society, child marriage is one that sustains and strengthens the dismal state of affairs people are trapped in. It keeps Total Fertility Rate very high along with infant and maternal mortality. It also keeps the family trapped in poverty and children deprived of education. Poverty, property disputes, forced conversions and "inadequate" laws and non-implementation also contribute to the trend of early marriages. Poverty is the major contributor, but a lack of alternatives fear of attack on unmarried girls and general low status of women, all contribute greatly to this menace. In the cases of early marriage meant they could not continue their studies or pursue a career, adding that in case they were already working, marriage meant giving up their career. According to Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey (2007), she said while 50 per cent of women (between 15 and 29 years) were married at the age of 20, around seven per cent become mothers at 15. According to UNICEF's country statistics marking the period 1987 to 2005, total urban child marriages amounted to 21 percent of all children, total rural child marriages amounted to 37 percent and total average child marriages equaled 32 percent of children. Recently Sindh Assembly on passed the Sindh Child Marriage Restraint act 2013 prohibiting marriage of children below 18 years, which is great step and legislative tool to curb early marriage in Sindh. The assembly is the first provincial legislature in the country to approve a act to curb child marriages. Under the act, the minimum for marriage is 18 years. Those found violating the law would be punished in line with the penalty suggested in the legislation. According to the law, in cases of underage marriages, those involved can be sentenced to three years in prison and they can also be fined. Earlier the Child Marriage Restraint Act 1929 was promulgated which was ineffective and outdated. Child marriage poses an obstacle for many of the SDGs development goals- SDG1) eradicating poverty and hunger (3); Good health and wellbeing (SDG 4); quality education (SDG 5); promoting gender equality (SDG 3); protecting children's lives. It is also violation of human rights, its impacts child development and exploits the rights to freedom of choice and overall girls' empowerment and it is also one of the key factors.

e) Main objectives of the project

The purpose of grant is to curb early marriages through community human rights awareness and through encouraging civil society efforts and role of police, lawyers and media to be vigilant on violation of the early marriage legislation and sensitization and community and civil society watch for speedy implementation of Sindh Child Marriage Restraint act 2013 with proper and clear implementation mechanisms in Sindh, the project will also promote girls leadership as a tool to combat violence and early marriages.

f) Description of targeted primary and secondary beneficiaries

Primary beneficiaries (individuals) –

Targeted beneficiaries	Number
Women and girls in general	2000
Women/girls survivors of violence	50
Total	2050

Main characteristics of Primary Beneficiaries

Age

Adolescents (10-19)

Young women (20-24)

Adult Women

Secondary beneficiaries

Targeted beneficiaries	Number
Members of civil society organizations (including NGOs)	30
Journalists/Media	60
Legal officers (i.e. 60 lawyers, 60 Police officials , 30 Nikahkhuwans)	150
Men and/or boys	650
Health practitioners	30
Total	920

1.2 Strategy and theory of change (or results chain) of the project with the brief description of project goal, outcomes, outputs and key project activities.

The project has been implementing strategies :awareness raising and sensitization

- Community awareness will be conducted to reach women and men through sessions of human rights, legal aspects of the early marriages law legal awareness on current legislation and advocacy, Human rights monitoring and documentation skills. These sessions will be delivered in 30 villages through trained human rights activists.
- District and divisional level civil society dialogues will be conducted for the members from media, NGOs, bar association, writers and human rights activists and police department. University level awareness workshop for 60 male female students will be arranged to understand early marriages as worst social issues , legislation and their role in protecting human rights of women and girls. 2 types messages with the quote from recent legislation; 2) worst impact of early marriage as a human rights violation.
- Awareness will be created through FM by inviting doctors and lawyers to talk about the legal awareness on early marriages and health aspects of the early marriages. Key

message will run for 3 months on local FM in Sindhi language.

Capacity Building Human rights education to community members and CSOs

- Train 36 male female representative CSOs and WLOs in TM Khan District leadership, advocacy, anti-early marriage law and violence against women
- 3 days TOT on usage of ICT and social media, advocacy to stop early marriages for 12 YLOs
- Train 3 young theater groups on interactive theater on violence against women , early marriages
- Train 90 community human rights activists from 30 villages, 3 from each district (male female) will be developed through three, 3 days long TOTs
- 3, three days' workshop for 90 and college girls from High schools from 3 districts
- Capacity building workshop will be arranged for 30 registered Nikahkhawans 10 from each district on recent legislation and sensitization.
- 03, Three days' workshop for CSOs, WLOs for 36 members
- Orientation and sensitization meetings with 30 health practitioners /lady doctors in three districts
- 03 district level orientation workshop for 60 media persons 03 one day workshops for 60 police official(including women police)
- 03 district level Orientation workshops with district bar associations for 60 lawyers

Advocacy

- 3 district level Essay/debate competitions among high and college girls to enable girls to speak out about these social issues as a human rights violation-right to education
- 30 village level community human rights support groups
- Formation of 3 district level human right support group to combat gender based violence specifically early marriages
- Provincial level dialogue to bring CSOs, policy makers and law experts for implementation mechanisms of law
- Develop and dissemination of IEC material 3000 copies of posters and brochures
- Review of the law and develop suggestions for implementation mechanism

Outcome 1: Parents and peer support girls to avoid early marriages in 30 villages of Sindh province by Dec 2017	Output 1.1: Parents and peer have increased knowledge of the Sindh Child Marriages Restraint Act 2013	Activity 1.1.1: Community awareness among 2700, girls, parents women and men through 90 sessions of human rights, legal aspects of the early marriages
		Activity 1.1.2: Develop and dissemination of IEC material
		Activity 1.1.3: Train 3 young theater groups on
	Output 1.2: Girls in the targeted area have increased safety against early marriages by strong community human rights support system	Activity 1.2.1: Formation of 30 Community Human Rights Support Groups
		Activity 1.2.2: Train 90 community human rights activists from 20 villages , 30 from each district (male female) will be developed through three , 3 , three days long Training of

		trainers workshop
<p>Outcome 2: Services providers (Nikahkhuwans (Religious person who solemnize the marriage), Lawyers, Police and Health providers) have improved response to protect girls from early marriages ;CSOs are advocating girls protection from GBV</p>	<p>Output 2.1: Service providers have increased knowledge of legal instruments for girls protection against early marriages</p>	<p>Activity 2.1.1: Train 30 male female representative CSOs/WLOs/YLOs in three districts on Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act advocacy, anti-early marriage law and violence against women</p>
		<p>Activity 2.1.2: Three district level orientation workshop for 60 media persons</p>
		<p>Activity 2.1.3: Threedistrict level orientation workshop for health practitioners</p>
	<p>Output 2.2: Police officers , lawyers and Nikahkhuwans in 3 districts have better responded to SCMRA</p>	<p>Activity 2.2.1: Three one day workshops for 60 police Officials</p>
		<p>Activity 2.2.2: Three Orientation meeting with lawyers</p>
		<p>Activity 2.2.3: Awareness session on legal perspective of SCMRA for Nikahkhuwans</p>
	<p>Output 2.3: Policy makers are and human rights departments are sensitized and moved for effective for effective implementation of law</p>	<p>Activity 2.3.1: Formation of 3 district human right support groups to combat gender based violence and early marriage incidents</p>
		<p>Activity 2.3.2: Review of existing law</p>
		<p>Activity 2.3.3: Provincial dialogue for 100 persons from media, CSOs, community human rights groups, policy makers and human rights</p>
<p>Outcome 3: Girls targeted by the project have increased leadership skills to negotiate their rights in their families</p>	<p>Output 3.1: Girls have increased knowledge on GBV and incre</p>	<p>Activity 3.1.1: 3 ,3 days leadership and peer educators workshop for 90 girls of High schools</p>
		<p>Activity 3.1.2: District level essay competition among High school girls students</p>

1.3 The geographic context, such as the region, country and landscape, and the geographical coverage of this project. Inputs required by grantee

The project has targeted 30 villages, 10 from each districts of 1) Tando Muhammad Khan , 2) Dadu, 3) Sukkur.

1.4 Total resources allocated for the intervention, including human resources and budgets (budget need to be disaggregated by the amount funded by the UN Trust Fund and by other sources/donors).

The total cost allocated for the intervention is 99,980 USD by UNTF and 4,100 USD by Sindh Community Foundation. Project staff is consisted project manager, advocacy officer and accountant

1.5 Key partners involved in the project, including the implementing partners and other key stakeholders. Inputs required by grantee

- NARI Foundation- Sukkur
- Dawn Development Organization –Dadu
- Bade-Saba Social Welfare Organization – Tando Muhammad Khan(engaged in 10 awareness sessions)

2. Purpose of the evaluation

The project evaluation is being conducted to assess the impact and decrease in frequency of the early marriages by preventing measures taken by parents having information on the Sindh child Marriages Restraint Act 2013.

2.1 Why the evaluation needs to be done

As the project is in its final stage and completed almost all activities so now there is need to measure the impact and sustainability. The evaluation will assess the success and failures of project implementation and measure the impact by assessing different activities and interviewing relevant audiences/stakeholders. It will give an overview of the impact of project and level of transformational change –among the parents (behavioral change), change in practices by communities, police, lawyers and Nikahkhuwads towards the protection of girls against early marriages. The evaluation will be an evidence base for the state of the implementation of the law at local level for other organizations and even for government departments. The evaluation will suggest the possibility to expand the program in other districts and sustainability.

2.2 How the evaluation results will be used, by whom and when.

The evaluation results will be published in a report available on SCF's website and online forums of UNTF and UNWOMEN and will be shared with a number of donors, INGOs and local NGOs and used to encourage others to fund similar interventions in other areas of Sindh province where there is high frequency of early marriage. The results will also used to design new programs with the modifications and recommendations made in this evaluation to expand the coverage of targeted groups and number of beneficiaries.

2.3 What decisions will be taken after the evaluation is completed?

The project evaluation report findings will be shared with the SCF board, NGOs and partner organizations through a workshop and will be published in reported placed on the SCF website and online forums. SCF will develop new programs using the lessons learnt from the project implementation.

3 Evaluation objectives and scope

3.1 Scope of Evaluation:

Timeframe: this evaluation needs to cover the entire project duration. (1st Jan 2016- 31st Dec 2017)

Geographical Coverage: Inputs required by grantee Three districts Tando Muhammad Khan, Dadu and Sukkur (09 villages three from each district)

Target groups to be covered: this evaluation needs to cover the target primary and secondary beneficiaries as well as broader stakeholders: Male and female parents, adolescent girls, community members, CSOs, Youth activists, Police officials, lawyers, media persons, Nikahkhuwans

3.2 Objectives of Evaluation:

The overall objectives of the evaluation are to:

- a. To evaluate the entire project in terms of effectiveness, relevance, efficiency, sustainability and impact, with a strong focus on assessing the results at the outcome and project goals;
- b. To generate key lessons and identify promising practices for learning;
- c. Inputs required by grantee

4 Evaluation Questions

Evaluation Criteria	Mandatory Evaluation Questions
Effectiveness	1) To what extent were the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs achieved and how? 2) To what extent did the project reach the targeted beneficiaries at the project goal and outcome levels? How many beneficiaries have been reached? 3) To what extent has this project generated positive changes in the lives of targeted (and untargeted) women and girls in relation to the specific forms of violence addressed by this project? Why? What are the key changes in the lives of those women and/or girls? Please describe those changes. 4) What internal and external factors contributed to the achievement and/or failure of the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs? How? <i>Alternative questions in case of project focusing at the policy level</i> 5) To what extent was the project successful in advocating for girls protection against child marriages? If it was not successful, explain why. 6) Have key stakeholders responded effectively cases of early marriages?
Relevance	1) To what extent was the project strategy and activities implemented relevant in responding to the needs of women and girls? 2) To what extent do achieved results (project goal, outcomes and outputs) continue to be relevant to the needs of women and girls?
Efficiency	1) How efficiently and timely has this project been implemented and managed in accordance with the Project Document?

Sustainability	1) How are the achieved results, especially the positive changes generated by the project in the lives of women and girls at the project goal level, going to be sustained after this project ends? Have collective efforts of the community helped to protect girls against early marriage? How effectively have stakeholders involved in implementation of Sindh Child Marriages restraint act 2013 responded to cases of early marriages?
Impact	1) What are the unintended consequences (positive and negative) resulted from the project?
Knowledge Generation	1) What are the key lessons learned that can be shared with other practitioners on Ending Violence against Women and Girls? 2) Are there any promising practices? If yes, what are they and how can these promising practices be replicated in other projects and/or in other countries that have similar interventions?

5 Evaluation Methodologies

1) Proposed evaluation design (will be finalized by Evaluator)

The evaluation methodology and design should be proposed by the evaluator in their proposal. However, it should take an approach that assesses the value of the project as perceived by the (intended) beneficiaries, thereby aiming to give voice to their priorities and concerns. It should assess the evidence for whether or not the SCF project has contributed to observed outcomes and impact and unpack whether the initiative's theory of change/results chain led to the observed change to allow for a plausible assessment of the initiative's contribution to results vis-à-vis other partners.

2) Data sources

Data sources that will be available to the evaluator will include: project progress reports, cases studies, monitoring reports, annual reports, proposal documents, theory of change, media clippings, data from Focus group discussions and interviews with beneficiaries.

3) Proposed data collection methods and analysis

It is suggested that the evaluator take an approach to data collection that builds on previous data collected during the project including through Focus Group Discussions, In-depth interviews, assessments of case studies and media clippings as well as meetings with staff, project partner organizations, and SCF's overall staff.

4) Proposed sampling methods – will be at the discretion/suggestion of the evaluator, however it is recommended that it includes (within the limits of the budget) interviews or focus group discussions with:

- 136 primary beneficiaries out of 2050 targeted
- 22 secondary beneficiaries out of 340 targeted

5) Field visits

It is recommended that (within the limits of the budget) field visits will be conducted in 3 villages out of 10 from each district total 9 villages will be covered.

6 Evaluation Ethics

The evaluation must be conducted in accordance with the principles outlined in the UN Evaluation Group (UNEG) 'Ethical Guidelines for Evaluation' <http://www.unevaluation.org/ethicalguidelines>.

It is imperative for the evaluator(s) to:

- Guarantee the safety of respondents and the research team.
- Apply protocols to ensure anonymity and confidentiality of respondents.
- Select and train the research team on ethical issues.
- Provide referrals to local services and sources of support for women that might ask for them.
- Ensure compliance with legal codes governing areas such as provisions to collect and report data, particularly permissions needed to interview or obtain information about children and youth.
- Store securely the collected information.

The evaluator(s) must consult with the relevant documents as relevant prior to development and finalization of data collection methods and instruments. The key documents include (but not limited to) the following:

- World Health Organization (2003). *Putting Women First: Ethical and Safety Recommendations for Research on Domestic Violence Against Women*.
www.who.int/gender/documents/violence/who_fch_gwh_01.1/en/index.html
- Jewkes, R., E. Dartnall and Y. Sikweyiya (2012). *Ethical and Safety Recommendations for Research on the Perpetration of Sexual Violence*. Sexual Violence Research Initiative. Pretoria, South Africa, Medical Research Council. Available from
www.svri.org/EthicalRecommendations.pdf Researching violence against women: A practical guide for researchers and activists November 2005

http://www.path.org/publications/files/GBV_rvaw_complete.pdf

- World Health Organization (WHO), 'Ethical and safety recommendations for researching documenting and monitoring sexual violence in emergencies' 2007,
http://www.who.int/gender/documents/OMS_Ethics&Safety10Aug07.pdf

7 Key deliverables of evaluators and timeframe

	Deliverables	Description of Expected Deliverables	Timeline of each deliverable (date/month/year)
1	Evaluation inception report (language of report: English)	The inception report provides the grantee organization and the evaluators with an opportunity to verify that they share the same understanding about the evaluation and clarify any misunderstanding at the outset. An inception report must be prepared by the evaluators before going into the technical mission and full data collection stage. It must detail the evaluators' understanding of what is being evaluated and why, showing how each evaluation question will be answered by way of: proposed methods, proposed sources of data and data collection/analysis procedures.	06/11/2017

		The inception report must include a proposed schedule of tasks, activities and deliverables, designating a team member with the lead responsibility for each task or product. The structure must be in line with the suggested structure of the annex of TOR.	
2	Draft evaluation report (language of report: English)	Evaluators must submit draft report for review and comments by all parties involved. The report needs to meet the minimum requirements specified in the annex of TOR. The grantee and key stakeholders in the evaluation must review the draft evaluation report to ensure that the evaluation meets the required quality criteria.	22/12/2017
3	Final evaluation report (language of report: English)	Relevant comments from key stakeholders must be well integrated in the final version, and the final report must meet the minimum requirements specified in the annex of TOR. The final report must be disseminated widely to the relevant stakeholders and the general public.	01/01/2018

8 Evaluation team composition and required competencies

Independent, experienced evaluator having background in the evaluation the field of gender equality, GBV , women and girls empowerment will be hired

8.1 Evaluation Team Composition and Roles and Responsibilities

The Evaluation Team will be consisting of 1 national consultant.

Evaluator will be responsible for undertaking the evaluation from start to finish and for managing the evaluation team under the supervision of evaluation task manager from the grantee organization, for the data collection and analysis, as well as report drafting and finalization in English (or French or Spanish).

8.2 Required Competencies

- Evaluation experience at least 3-5 year in conducting external evaluations, with mixed-methods evaluation skills and having flexibility in using non-traditional and innovative evaluation methods
- Expertise in gender and human-rights based approaches to evaluation and issues of violence against women and girls
- Specific evaluation experiences in the areas of ending violence against women and girls

- Experience in collecting and analyzing quantitative and qualitative data
- In-depth knowledge of gender equality and women’s empowerment
- A strong commitment to delivering timely and high-quality results, i.e. credible evaluation and its report that can be used
- A strong team leadership and management track record, as well as interpersonal and communication skills to help ensure that the evaluation is understood and used.
- • Good communication skills and ability to communicate with various stakeholders and to express concisely and clearly ideas and concepts
- Regional/Country experience and knowledge: in-depth knowledge of country Pakistan is required.
- Language proficiency: fluency in English and Urdu is mandatory; good command of local language Siddhi is desirable.

9 Management Arrangement of the evaluation

Name of Group	Role and responsibilities	Actual name of staff responsible
Evaluation Team	External evaluator/consultant to conduct an external evaluation based on the contractual agreement and the Terms of Reference, and under the day-to-day supervision of the Evaluation Task Manager.	External evaluator
Evaluation Task Manager	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Someone from the grantee organization, such as project manager and/or M&E officer to manage the entire evaluation process under the overall guidance of the senior management, to: • lead the development and finalization of the evaluation TOR in consultation with key stakeholders and the senior management; • manage the recruitment of the external evaluators; • lead the collection of the key documents and data to be share with the evaluators at the beginning of the inception stage; • liaise and coordinate with the evaluation team, the reference group, the commissioning organization and the advisory group throughout the process to ensure effective communication and collaboration; • provide administrative and substantive technical support to the evaluation team and work closely with the evaluation team throughout the evaluation; • lead the dissemination of the report and follow-up activities after finalization of the 	M&E Officer or Project Manager of Grantee Organization Sindh Community Foundation as <i>Evaluation Task Manager</i>

	report	
Commissioning Organization	Senior management of the organization who commissions the evaluation (grantee) – responsible for: 1) allocating adequate human and financial resources for the evaluation; 2) guiding the evaluation manager; 3) preparing responses to the recommendations generated by the evaluation.	Senior Management of Sindh Community Foundation
Reference Group	Include primary and secondary beneficiaries, partners and stakeholders of the project who provide necessary information to the evaluation team and to reviews the draft report for quality assurance	Primary : women and girls in general , survivors of GBV/early marriages
Advisory Group	Must include a focal point from the UN Women Regional Office and the UN Trust Fund Portfolio Manager to review and comment on the draft TOR and the draft report for quality assurance and provide technical support if needed.	VesnaJaric (Portfolio Manager, UNTF)

10 Timeline of the entire evaluation process

Stage of Evaluation	Key Task	Responsible	Number of working days required	Timeframe (dd/mm/yyyy - dd/mm/yyyy)
Inception stage	Briefings of evaluators to orient the evaluators	evaluation task manager	1 Day	18/10/2017
	Desk review of key documents	Evaluation Team	06 Days	19/10/2017 24/10/2017
	Finalizing the evaluation design and methods	Evaluation Team	06Days	19/10/2017 24/10/2017
	Preparing an inception report	Evaluation Team	06Days	25/10/2017 30/10/2017
	Review Inception Report and provide feedback	Evaluation Task Manager, Reference Group and Advisory Group	05Days	01/11/2017 05/11/2017
	Submitting final version of inception report	Evaluation Team	06Days	06/11/2017
Data collection and analysis stage	Desk research	Evaluation Team	10 Days	07/11/2017 16/11/2017
	In-country	Evaluation Team	15 Days	17/11/2017

	technical mission for data collection (visits to the field, interviews, questionnaires, etc.)			01/12/2017
Synthesis and reporting stage	Analysis and interpretation of findings	Evaluation Team	15 Days	02/12/2017 16/12/2017
	Preparing a draft report	Evaluation Team	8 Days	17/12/2017 22/12/2017
	Review of the draft report with key stakeholders for quality assurance	Evaluation Task Manager, Reference Group, Commissioning Organization Senior Management, and Advisory Group	05 Days	23/12/2017 27/12/2017
	Consolidate comments from all the groups and submit the consolidated comments to evaluation team	Evaluation Task Manger	2 Days	28/12/2017 29/12/2017
	Incorporating comments and revising the evaluation report	Evaluation Team	2 Days	30/12/2017 31/12/2017
	Submission of the final report	Evaluation Team	1 Day	01/01/2018
	Final review and approval of report	Evaluation Task Manager, Reference Group, Commissioning Organization Senior Management, and Advisory Group	5 Days	02/01/2018 06/01/2018
Dissemination and follow-up	Publishing and distributing the final report	commissioning organization led by evaluation manager	10 Days	07/01/2018 16/01/2018
	Prepare management responses to the key recommendations of the report	Senior Management of commissioning organization	3 Days	17/01/2018 16/01/2018
	Organize learning events (to	commissioning organization	1 Day	18/01/2018

	discuss key findings and recommendations, use the finding for planning of following year, etc)			
--	--	--	--	--

11 Budget

The total budget for this evaluation is 3000USD.

12 Annexes

1) Key stakeholders and partners to be consulted

Parents and girls

3 Villages of Tando Muhammad Khan

3 Villages of Dadu

3 Villages of Sukkur

Police station/SHOs

Monitoring Committee members at district level

Member of Community Human Rights Support Groups at village level

Media person at district level

Lawyers at district level

Nikahwkhuwans at village-district level

Partner organizations

Youth activists at village level

Alliance member organizations

Resource persons

- This annex can also suggest sites to be visited.

3 Villages of Tando Muhammad Khan

3 Villages of Dadu

3 Villages of Sukkur

Police station/SHOs

Monitoring Committee members at district level

Member of Community Human Rights Support Groups at village level

Media person at district level

Lawyers at district level

Nikahwkhuwans at village-district level

Partner organizations – at district level

Youth activists at village level

Alliance member organizations- SCF office

Resource persons-SCF office or sky online discussions

2) Documents to be consulted

A list of important documents, data set and webpages that the evaluators should read and understand at the outset of the evaluation and before finalizing the evaluation design and the inception report. This

should be limited to the critical information that the evaluation team needs. Data sources and documents may include (but not limited to):

- Relevant national strategy documents
- Strategic and other planning documents /project documents
- Baseline data of the project (i.e. Results Monitoring Plan and Baseline Report)
- Monitoring plans, indicators and summary of monitoring data
- Progress and annual reports of the project
- Reports from previous evaluations of the project and/or the organization
- Media reports

3) **Required structure for the inception report** [see the suggested structure below under Section 4.3 of this document]

4) **Required structure for the evaluation report** [see the suggested structure below under Section 4.4 of this document]

4.3 Inception Report

What is an inception report?

An inception report is a document that is used by the grantee organization and by the evaluators to verify that they share the same understanding about the evaluation and to clarify any misunderstanding at the outset.

Why does an inception report need to be prepared?

An inception report is important to verify if the evaluators understand **what** they have to do and **how, by when** based on the TOR and the initial consultation with the evaluation task manager and key stakeholders. This is a part of evaluation management process to oversee the work of evaluators.

Who needs to prepare it? When?

As part of evaluation management process and for quality assurance, the inception report should be prepared by evaluator(s) **after** they complete initial desk review and consultations but **before** they start main data collection and field visits.

Is submission of an inception report to the UN Trust Fund required?

Submission of the inception report to the UN Trust Fund is NOT required.

What needs to be specified in an inception report?

It is the grantee organization's responsibility to ensure:

1. The quality of the inception report prepared by external evaluator(s) in accordance with the TOR and the expected quality of the final report.
2. That the relevant stakeholders on the ground have been consulted before the finalization of evaluation questions and evaluation methodology specified in the inception report.

The following is the suggested structure of an inception report

Structure of Inception Report

6) Background and Context of Project

7) Description of Project

8) Purpose of Evaluation

9) Evaluation Objectives and Scope

10) Final version of Evaluation Questions with evaluation criteria

11) **Description of evaluation team**, including the brief description of role and responsibilities of each team member

12) Evaluation Design and Methodology

a. Description of overall evaluation design [*please specify the evaluation is designed from: 1) post-test only without comparison group; 2) pre-test and post-test without comparison group; 3) pre-test and post-test with comparison group; or 4) randomized control trial.*]

b. Data sources (accesses to information and to documents)

c. Description of data collection methods and analysis (including level of precision required for quantitative methods, value scales or coding used for qualitative analysis; level of participation of stakeholders through evaluation process)

d. Description of sampling (area and population to be represented, rationale for selection, mechanics of selection, limitations to sample); reference indicators and benchmarks, where relevant (previous indicators, national statistics, human rights treaties, gender statistics, etc.)

e. Limitations of the evaluation methodology proposed

13) **Ethical considerations**: a) Safety and security (of participants and evaluation team); and b) Contention strategy and follow up

14) **Work plan with the specific timeline and deliverables by evaluation team** (up to the submission of finalized report)

15) Annexes

a. Evaluation Matrix [see Annex 4A for the template]

b. Data collection Instruments (e.g.: survey questionnaires, interview and focus group guides, observation checklists, etc.)

c. List of documents consulted so far and those that will be consulted

d. List of stakeholders/partners to be consulted (interview, focus group, etc.)

e. Draft outline of final report (in accordance with the requirements of UN Trust Fund [see Section 4.4 of this guideline document])

4.4 Final Evaluation Report

This section of the guidelines is intended to serve as a guide for preparing meaningful, useful and credible evaluation reports of projects funded by the UN Trust Fund. It prescribes the definite structure and contents that must be included in quality reports.⁴

⁴ The quality criteria are derived from the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) standards (2005) and the UN Women Quality Criteria for Evaluation Reports (2009). UNEG standards for evaluation in the UN system (2005) instruct that *“the final evaluation report should be logically structured, containing evidence-based findings, conclusions, lessons and recommendations, and should be free of information that is not relevant for overall analysis. A reader of an evaluation report must be able to understand: the purpose of the evaluation; exactly what was evaluated; how the evaluation was designed and conducted; what evidence was found; what conclusions were drawn; what recommendations were made; what lessons were distilled*

The below described criteria and the report structure must be used by the grantees and the UN Trust Fund staff to assess the quality of evaluation reports. The report structure must be annexed to the Terms of References (TOR) of the evaluation so that the evaluators are informed about the requirements at the outset of the evaluation process.

Note: Each organization may add additional sections as they wish in evaluation report. However, the required sections and annexes specified below must be provided in the final evaluation report submitted to the UN Trust Fund.

Overall criteria for external evaluation reports

I: Quality of writing

1. Clear, precise and professional language
2. Correct terminology and grammar
3. No factual errors
4. Reader friendly
5. Useful graphs and tables (if relevant)

II: Language of the report

The report may be prepared in English, Spanish or French.

III: Logo and acknowledgement of the UN Trust Fund

The logo of the UN Trust should be in the final version of the report, and the contribution of the UN Trust Fund should be acknowledged in the report.

IV: Stakeholder participation

1. The evaluation report provides description and evidence of stakeholders' active participation throughout the evaluation process.
2. Participation of stakeholders includes both primary and secondary beneficiaries.
3. The methodology involves using participatory techniques, if relevant and possible.

V: Compliance to the UN Trust Fund Requirements

1. The report is written in accordance with the structure described below. The report is supported by concrete evidence and data.
2. The report is submitted with all the mandatory annexes listed in the structure described below.

Structure of evaluation report

****Please note the following color code:**

Text in blue = instruction to guide evaluators and grantee organizations on how to prepare that specific sections of evaluation report.

1. Title and cover page

- ☐ Name of the project
- ☐ Locations of the evaluation conducted (country, region)
- ☐ Period of the project covered by the evaluation (month/year – month/year)
- ☐ Date of the final evaluation report (month/year)
- ☐ Name and organization of the evaluators
- ☐ Name of the organization(s) that commissioned the evaluation
- ☐ Logo of the grantee and of the UN Trust Fund

2. Table of Content

3. List of acronyms and abbreviations

4. Executive summary

[A standalone synopsis of the substantive elements of the evaluation report that provides a reader with a clear understanding of what was found and recommended and what has been learnt from the evaluation. It includes]:

- ☐ Brief description of the context and the project being evaluated;
- ☐ Purpose and objectives of evaluation;
- ☐ Intended audience;
- ☐ Short description of methodology, including rationale for choice of methodology, data sources used, data collection & analysis methods used, and major limitations;
- ☐ Most important findings with concrete evidence and conclusions; and
- ☐ Key recommendations.

5. Context of the project

- ☐ Description of critical social, economic, political, geographic and demographic factors within which the project operated.
- ☐ An explanation of how social, political, demographic and/or institutional context contributes to the utility and accuracy of the evaluation.

6. Description of the project

[The project being evaluated needs to be clearly described. Project information includes]:

- ☐ Project duration, project start date and end date

- ☐ Description of the specific forms of violence addressed by the project
 - ☐ Main objectives of the project
 - ☐ Importance, scope and scale of the project, including geographic coverage
 - ☐ Strategy and theory of change (or results chain) of the project with the brief description of project goal, outcomes, outputs and key project activities
 - ☐ Key assumptions of the project
 - ☐ Description of targeted primary and secondary beneficiaries as well as key implementing partners and stakeholders
- ☐☐ Budget and expenditure of the project

7. Purpose of the evaluation

- ☐ Why the evaluation is being done
- ☐ How the results of the evaluation will be used
- ☐ What decisions will be taken after the evaluation is completed
- ☐ The context of the evaluation is described to provide an understanding of the setting in which the evaluation took place

8. Evaluation objectives and scope

- ☐ A clear explanation of the objectives and scope of the evaluation.
- ☐ Key challenges and limits of the evaluation are acknowledged and described.

9. Evaluation Team

- ☐ Brief description of evaluation team
- ☐ Brief description of each member’s roles and responsibilities in the evaluation
- ☐ Brief description of work plan of evaluation team with the specific timeline and deliverables

10. Evaluation Questions

- ☐ The original evaluation questions from the evaluation TOR are listed and explained, as well as those that were added during the evaluation (if any).
- ☐ A brief explanation of the evaluation criteria used (e.g. relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and impact) is provided.

11. Evaluation Methodology

[The template below must be used for this section.]

Sub-sections	Inputs by the evaluator(s)
Description of evaluation design	<i>[please specify if the evaluation was conducted by one of the following designs: 1) post-test only without comparison group; 2) pre-test and post-test without comparison group; 3) pre-test and post-test with comparison group; or 4) randomized control trial.]</i>
Data sources	
Description of data collection methods and analysis	[Please refer to the evaluation matrix (template Annex 4A)]

<p>(including level of precision required for quantitative methods, value scales or coding used for qualitative analysis; level of participation of stakeholders through evaluation process, etc.)</p>	
<p>Description of sampling</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☐ Area and population to be represented ☐ Rationale for selection ☐ Mechanics of selection limitations to sample ☐ Reference indicators and benchmarks/baseline, where relevant (previous indicators, national statistics, human rights treaties, gender statistics, etc.) 	<p>Description of sampling</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☐ Area and population to be represented ☐ Rationale for selection ☐ Mechanics of selection limitations to sample ☐ Reference indicators and
<p>Description of ethical considerations in the evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☐ Actions taken to ensure the safety of respondents and research team ☐ Referral to local services or sources of support ☐ Confidentiality and anonymity protocols ☐ Protocols for research on children, if required. 	
<p>Limitations of the evaluation methodology used</p>	

12. Findings and Analysis per Evaluation Question

[The template below must be used per evaluation question in order to provide direct answer to the question, key findings and analysis, and quantitative and qualitative evidence per evaluation question. Evaluators may add additional paragraphs/sub-sections in narrative format to describe overall findings and analysis if they wish.]

Evaluation Criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question 1	To what extent were the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs achieved and how?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	
Conclusions	
Others	

Evaluation Criteria	Effectiveness
Evaluation Question 2	To what extent were the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs achieved and how?
Response to the evaluation question with analysis of key findings by the evaluation team	
Quantitative and/or qualitative evidence gathered by the evaluation team to support the response and analysis above	
Conclusions	
Others	*For this specific question on beneficiaries, please complete the Beneficiary Data Sheet in Annex 4C.

*****Please repeat the same template per evaluation question.***

Instruction for Findings and Analysis

- ☐ Findings cover all of the evaluation objectives and the key evaluation questions agreed in the evaluation TOR and during the inception stage (inception report).
- ☐ Outputs, outcomes and goal of the project are evaluated to the extent possible (or an appropriate rationale given as to why not).
- ☐ Outcomes and goal include any unintended effects, whether beneficial or harmful.
- ☐ The report makes a logical distinction in the findings, showing the progression from implementation of the activities to the results (outputs, outcomes and project goal) with an appropriate measurement and analysis of the results chain, or a rationale as to why an analysis of results was not provided.
- ☐ Findings regarding inputs for the completion of activities or process achievements are distinguished clearly from the results of the projects (i.e. outputs, outcomes and project goal).

- ☐ Results attributed to the success/failure of the project are related back to the contributions of different stakeholders.
- ☐ Reasons for accomplishments and difficulties of the project, especially constraining and enabling factors, are identified and analyzed to the extent possible.
- ☐ Based on the findings, the evaluation report includes an analysis of the underlying causes, constraints, strengths on which to build on, and opportunities.
- ☐ An understanding of which external factors contributed to the success or failure of the project helps determine how such factors will affect the future initiatives, or whether it could be replicated elsewhere.

For evaluation questions related to lessons learned and promising practices

- ☐ Lessons and promising practices that contributes to general knowledge in the context of Ending Violence against Women, including innovative and catalytic methodologies/approaches.
- ☐ The analysis presents how lessons and promising practices can be applied to different contexts and/or different actors, and takes into account evidential limitations such as generalizing from single point observations.
- ☐ They are well supported by the findings and conclusions of the evaluation and are not a repetition of common knowledge.

13. Conclusions

[The template below must be used to provide conclusions organized per evaluation criteria, in addition to those for overall. Evaluators may add additional paragraphs/sub-sections in narrative format if they wish.]

Evaluation Criteria	Conclusions
Overall	
Effectiveness	
Relevance	
Efficiency	
Sustainability	
Impact	
Knowledge Generation	
Others (if any)	

Instruction

- ☐ The logic behind the conclusions and the correlation to actual findings are clear.
- ☐ Simple conclusions that are already well known are avoided.
- ☐ Substantiated by findings consistent with the methodology and the data collected.
- ☐ Represent insights into identification and/or solutions of important problems or issues.
- ☐ Focus on issues of significance to the project being evaluated, determined by the evaluation objectives and the key evaluation questions.

14. Key recommendations

[The template below must be used to provide recommendations per evaluation criteria. Evaluators may add additional paragraphs/sub-sections in narrative format if they wish.]

Evaluation Criteria	Recommendations	Relevant Stakeholders (Recommendation made to whom)	Suggested timeline (if relevant)
Overall			
Effectiveness			
Relevance			
Efficiency			
Sustainability			
Impact			
Knowledge Generation			
Others (if any)			

Instruction

- ☑ Realistic and action-oriented, with clear responsibilities and timeframe for implementation if possible
- ☑ Firmly based on analysis and conclusions
- ☑ Relevant to the purpose and the objectives of the evaluation
- ☑ Formulated in a clear and concise manner

15. Annexes (mandatory)

The following annexes must be submitted to the UN Trust Fund with the final report.

1) Final Version of Terms of Reference (TOR) of the evaluation

2) **Evaluation Matrix** [see Annex 4A for the template] please provide indicators, data source and data collection methods per evaluation question.

3) **Final version of Results Monitoring Plan** [see Annex 4B for the template] please provide actual baseline data and endline data per indicator of project goal, outcome and output

4) **Beneficiary Data Sheet** [see Annex 4C for the template] please provides the total number of beneficiaries reached at the project goal and outcome levels.

5) **Additional methodology-related documentation**, such as data collection instruments including questionnaires, interview guide(s), observation protocols, etc.

6) Lists of persons and institutions interviewed or consulted and sites visited

[As appropriate, specification of the names of individuals interviewed should be limited to ensure confidentiality in the report but rather providing the names of institutions or organizations that they represent.]

7) List of supporting documents reviewed

8) CVs of evaluator(s) who conducted the evaluation

Annex 4A: Template for Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Criteria	Evaluation Questions	Indicators	Data Source and Data
----------------------------	-----------------------------	-------------------	-----------------------------

			Collection Methods

Annex 4B: Template for Results Monitoring Plan with actual baseline and endline data

A. Statement of Project Goal, Outcomes and Outputs	B. Indicators for measuring progress towards achieving the project goal, outcomes and outputs	C. Data collection methods	D. Baseline Data Please provide actual baseline data per indicator	E. Timeline of baseline data collection For each indicator listed in column B, when was BASELINE data collected? Please specify month/year.	F. Endline Data Please provide actual endline data per indicator	G. Timeline of endline data collection For each indicator listed in column B, when was endline data collected? Please specify month/year.
Project Goal:	1					
	2					
Outcome 1	1.1					
	1.2					
	1.3					
Outcome 2	2.1					
	2.3					
Outcome 3	3.1					
	3.2					
Output 1.1						
Output 1.2						
Output 2.1						
Output 2.2						

Output 2.3						
Output 3.1						

Annex 4C: Template for Beneficiary Data Sheet

Beneficiary group	The number of beneficiaries reached	
	At the project goal level	At the outcome level
Female domestic workers		
Female migrant workers		
Female political activists/human rights defenders		
Female sex workers		
Female refugees/internally displaced/asylum seekers		
Indigenous women/from ethnic groups		
Lesbian, bisexual, transgender		
Women and girls in general		
Women/girls with disabilities		
Women/girls living with HIV and AIDS		
Women/girls survivors of violence		
Women prisoners		
Others (specify)		
Primary Beneficiary Total		
Civil society organizations (including NGOs)		
The number of beneficiaries reached		
Number of individuals reached		
Community-based groups/members		
The number of beneficiaries reached		
Number of individuals reached		
Educational professionals (i.e. teachers, educators)		
Faith-based organizations		
The number of beneficiaries reached		
Number of individuals reached		
General public/community at large		
Government officials (i.e. decision makers, policy implementers)		
Health professionals		
Journalists/Media		
Legal officers (i.e. lawyers, prosecutors, judges)		
Men and/or boys		
Parliamentarians		
Private sector employers		
Social/welfare workers		
Uniformed personnel (i.e. police)		
Others (specify)		
Secondary Beneficiary Total		

15. Evaluation Matrix (Annex 4A)

Evaluation Criteria	Mandatory Evaluation Questions	Indicators	Data source and Collection Method
Effectiveness	<p>1) To what extent were the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs achieved and how?</p> <p>2) To what extent did the project reach the targeted beneficiaries at the project goal and outcome levels? How many beneficiaries have been reached?</p> <p>3) To what extent has this project generated positive changes in the lives of targeted (and untargeted) women and girls in relation to the specific forms of violence addressed by this project? Why? What are the key changes in the lives of those women and/or girls? Please describe those changes.</p> <p>4) What internal and external factors contributed to the achievement and/or failure of the intended project goal, outcomes and outputs? How?</p> <p>Alternative questions in case of project focusing at the policy level</p> <p>5) To what extent was the project successful in</p>	<p>1) Progress against targeted indicators of project goals, outcomes and outputs</p> <p>2) Expected results against actual results, no of direct indirect beneficiaries benefited</p> <p>3) Reduction in occurrence of ECM Incidences, frequency of reports to police, Local support system at district level in place.</p> <p>4) Perspective of girls, parents, Nikahkhawan, facilitators, actions taken by human rights and civil society groups</p> <p>5) Organizational structure, relationship with stakeholder with stakeholders and efforts made to engage external bodies</p> <p>6) Number and types of actions taken by human Rights support group to stop early marriage, no of cases reported showing increase /decrease trend, policy level initiatives taken</p> <p>7) Policy changes in law related ECM, monitoring framework, stakeholder alignment, advocacy campaigns</p>	<p>1) Literature/Document Reviews, KII, FGDs, case studies, sensitization and mobilization session report (pre/posttest reports). , Attendance sheets. Media reports, Policy documents</p> <p>2) GDs, KII, documents/progress review</p> <p>3) FGDs with beneficiaries, youth, KII with stakeholders (govt officials, nikahkhawan, civil society, and human rights group, documents reviewed</p> <p>4) KII with stakeholders, local self-help groups staff contracts, partner agreement and session reports (awareness, sensitization and mobilization)</p> <p>5) FGD with CSHGs and civil society groups in each district, KII with Police to find out increase/decrease trend and actions taken</p> <p>Review of policy document, meeting with parliamentarians, Media reports/meetings</p>

	advocating for girls protection against child marriages? If it was not successful, explain why. 6) Have key stakeholders responded effectively cases of early marriages?		
Relevance	1) To what extent was the project strategy and activities implemented relevant in responding to the needs of women and girls? 2) To what extent do achieved results (project goal, outcomes and outputs) continue to be relevant to the needs of women and girls?	1) Number of cases reported and speedy justice system available at district level catering needs of girls and women. A well connected district level support/ monitoring mechanism in place benefitting women, girls and other beneficiaries. 2) Understanding of direct and indirect beneficiaries/stakeholder on legal perspective 3) No of ECM cases occurring and reported, up scaling and continuation of the activities in the neighboring areas(villages) ,	1) Review of project Implementation strategies, progress review, FGDs with beneficiaries and local stakeholders, capacity building sessions particularly govt officials, journalists, self-help groups 2) KII, project document review, baseline, mid-term report, cases studies, media reports joint action plan/advocacy/monitoring plan,
Efficiency	1)How efficiently and timely has this project been implemented and managed in accordance with the Project Document? 2)Were the same resources have been used to deliver additional results	1) Delivery of activities in compliance with project document. 2) Additional activities performed with given resources, new alliances and networks developed contributing in project objectives	1)Reviews of progress/ monitoring reports, event/ activity reports, financial records and field verification, KKI with stakeholder's Joint action plan with defined roles.
Sustainability	1) How are the achieved results, especially the positive changes generated by the project in the lives of women and girls at the project goal level, going to be sustained after this project ends? Have collective efforts of the community	1) Human rights support group are capacitated in GBV, ECM and Advocacy skill and taking inspirational actions in preventing ECM, 2)Exit strategy highlighting suitability measures 3)Types of trainings executed for organizational staff and	1)FGDs with beneficiaries, KII with major stakeholders, systems in place (change observation), policy document reviews , review of joint action plan, exit strategy 2)Session plans, ECI material/manuals, training reports, participants list 3)Case studies, lessons learned,

	<p>helped to protect girls against early marriage?</p> <p>2) How effectively have stakeholders involved in implementation of Sindh Child Marriages restraint act 2013 responded to cases of early marriages?</p>	<p>local self-help groups,</p> <p>3) Perception of beneficiaries (parents and local facilitators) regarding early child marriage</p> <p>4) Cases of delayed marriages reported due to stakeholder's interventions, # girls re-enrolled in schools due to delayed marriages</p> <p>5) DMC, Police, Nikahkawan, media, facilitators and other stakeholders have proper knowledge of implementation mechanism of SCMRA</p> <p>6) Actions taken by these stakeholders to prevent ECM in their areas/villages Established and strengthened local organizations getting support for the prevention of ECM and health issues of women and girls</p> <p>7) Secure additional funding/resources for continuation and up scaling of curbing ECM</p>	<p>progress reports</p> <p>4) Review of available record regarding ECM cases reported and actions taken, awareness session/workshop reports, KII with SHO and other stakeholders,</p> <p>4) Meeting with SCF Management, Exit strategy, documents of projects in pipeline regarding ECM</p>
Impact	<p>1) What are the unintended consequences (positive and negative) resulted from the project?</p>	<p>1) The extent to which beneficiaries has expanded, no of villages covered , no of direct and indirect beneficiaries reached, no of local self-help groups formed Joint action plan with defined roles</p> <p>2) Negative and positive factors affecting project if any. Improved contents of media reports, reduced cases of ECM in result of understanding SCMRA</p>	<p>1) KII, Document review, press releases/media reports, Beneficiaries list of self-help groups established, Case studies, amendments in the legal document.</p>
Knowledge Generation	<p>1) What are the key lessons learned that can be shared with other practitioners on Ending</p>	<p>1) Lessons learnt(positive, negative),</p> <p>2) Best practices, successful</p>	<p>1) Reviews of documents, media highlighted, field observation to check awareness level (pre-and post) , partnership plans,</p>

	Violence against Women and Girls? 2) Are there any promising practices? If yes, what are they and how can these promising practices be replicated in other projects and/or in other countries that have similar interventions?	and sustainable interventions	Mobilization and sensitization strategy, joint action plan, staff interviews
--	---	-------------------------------	--

16. Beneficiary Data Sheet (Annex 4C)

	Number of Beneficiary reached	
Primary beneficiaries	At the project goal level	At the outcome level
Females adolescent 10-19 years	1106	954
Females young 20-24 years	1126	1126
Females adult 25-59 years	1500	1500
Male 10-19 years		404
Male 20-24 years		262
Male 25-59 years		500
Secondary beneficiaries		
Police		112
Lawyers		92
Media		62
Nikahkawan	30	30
Health practitioners		41
Community Human rights groups	30	30
Youth groups		10
Members of District Monitoring Committee	57	57
CSOs	13	13
Indirect beneficiaries		
People reached through WhatsApp	200	200

17. Additional methodology related documents

Checklist of additional guiding questions for conducting end line evaluation of the project “Curb early child marriage through human rights education and advocacy in Sindh, Pakistan “

Police

- How many trainings/sessions have been arranged by the SCF?

- Number of officers trained
- What were the topics/themes of the training?
- Were these sessions informative and relevant with your job description?
- If yes, how?
- Have you received any training on Sindh Early Child Marriage Restraint Act? Y/N
- If yes, then who arranged these and where did they take place?
- What knowledge did you receive from these trainings?
- Are there any obtained benefits from the trainings?
- If yes, what are these benefits?
- Have there been any changes in how the law enforcement officers interact with women, girls and parents in the context of ECM?
- What are the changes?
- Number of ECM cases reported after project implementation showing the increase/decrease trend.
- Were there any efforts made to sensitize other members of the police force about what was taught in the training?
- How did the sensitization take place?
- Has there been any impact? What has been the impact?
- Do you think these kinds of trainings should be arranged in the future?

Community (Girls/Boys, parents)

- Do you know about the Curbing ECM project? Is it important to change? Why? What are the advantages and disadvantages?
- What was participation level of your community in project implementation?
- What interventions were done by the SCF and its partners regarding curbing ECM?
- Do you think this project is important and useful in local socio-cultural context? In what ways?
- What type of changes has this project brought over the two year period of time?
- Do you see any change in the perception of local community/parents/facilitators regarding ECM? If yes, in what ways?
- Any change in the support mechanism from the local government, police department and other relevant departments regarding ECM?
- What is ECMRA 2013? How supportive do you find this new law in curbing ECM?
- Was this two year project enough to get the community aware on legal, social, economic and health impacts of ECM?
- Has the project caused any difficulty/inconvenience or negative impact on the community? If yes, what was it?
- What was the best thing you gained from this program and wish that it should be continued or should be up-scaled?
- What is the overall impact of the program/project on girls, boys, families, neighborhoods, and the community?
- What do you think it will take to end ECM entirely in your community?

- Are you asked your willingness for marriage now? (from girls and boys)
- In your opinion, what is the right age of marriage?
- Do you know any merits and demerits of early marriages? Or the impact on the health of girls?
- Do you know human rights regarding ECM and the punishment under SECMRA 2013?
- How were you involved in the project? What trainings were you given?
- How has this project impacted your parents, neighbors, community, school fellows, and teachers?
- Was any training/information regarding ECM issues provided at schools before?
- What was good in the project which has brought a visible change in you and your community?
- Do you know about any support system at district level that can be sought to avoid unacceptable incidences? (Early child marriage, forced marriages, etc.)
- What other efforts should be taken to curb/abolish ECM in the area?

Nikahkhawan

- How long has it been since you have solemnized marriages?
- What's the average age of the bride/groom at the time of marriage?
- Do you ask whether the boy and girl agree with the marriage? How do know they have consented to it?
- What do you know about SCF's two year project?
- What type of trainings have you obtained during this two year period?
- What did you learn from these training?
- Do you know about SECMRA 2013? What rules of business of SECMRA have you learned from these trainings?
- Have you shared information gained from these projects/trainings with fellow nikahkhawan?
- What change you see after training?
- Did you take any step regarding curbing ECM in your village/area? If yes, what?
- What is the application of knowledge that you gained? Was there any change/impact you observed? (Positive and/or negative)
- What are your recommendations based on its impact?

Government officials

- What do you know about the project Curbing ECM ?
- Were the objectives of the project relevant with specific local needs?
- Did the project fit into local priorities? Do you think ending ECM was/is/will be the priority for your local community?
- Do you think activities carried out by the project are the right ones to meet the goals of reducing ECM in the area, building government and community capacity to end ECM, increasing girls' confidence level to avoid/delay ECM and send back girls to school?
- How many trainings/sensitization sessions did you attend? What did you gain from the trainings and how will you utilize this knowledge?
- What mechanism/system have you established after the trainings that contribute in reduction of ECM cases in your area?

- In your opinion, which components of the program were the most important in reducing ECM practices?
- Have you observed any improvement in the local community's perception regarding negative impacts of ECM on girls and the community?
- Do you see impacts of the changes/amendments in the SECMRA on incidences of child marriages in your area?
- What trends towards stakeholder involvement and ownership do you see whether or not the project used participative methods/key stakeholders during the planning and implementation of the interventions?
- Does the approach or strategies of the project contribute to long term efforts to curb ECM? If so, then how?
- Any recommendation/suggestion for future interventions?

Media persons

- What sort of trainings have you received from ACF? How were these trainings beneficial for you?
- How do you relate information/knowledge gained from this project with your work?
- Did you notice any change in perception of the communities, individuals, families and government officials regarding ECM after the amendments in the ECM laws and project interventions?
- Are project interventions in alignment with the needs and priorities of the area with prevalent socio-cultural context?
- What change in reporting (contents and language of the news) have you observed after the training?
- Do you think there is a need of such type of interventions/trainings/sensitizations and mobilization for media persons regarding ECM law?

Partner Organizations

- What was the role of Partner organizations in the implementation of these project interventions in their respective areas?
- Have you signed a contract/agreement with the main implementing organization? (SCF)
- Have you developed/followed policies, protocols and/or guidelines aimed at addressing issues related to ECM?
- Have you, as partner organizations, the experience of working on the issues of violence against women/girls and ECM?
- What were the value addition/added advantages of taking your (local organization) as implementing partners for Curbing ECM project?
- What sort of support have you received from the SCF (financial/ technical/institutional or another) for field facilitation and implementation support provided by you?
- What benefits have you gained (other than financial) through partnering with SCF for implementation of the project of Curbing ECM.

- As an implementing partner, what is your observation about how other stakeholders and community perceive the quality of the program interventions and capacity building activities provided by the project?
- What are your future plans to continue and/or up-scaling of the interventions for reducing ECM occurrence?
- As an implementing partner, what do you think of most promising practices which should be continued and up scaled?
- Have there been any changes in your organization's mandate/services delivery portfolio?
- If so, what are these changes?

Community schools (students and teachers)

- When was this school established?
- What is the strength of girl students enrolled in the school?
- What is the reason for girls dropping out from school? At what age do they leave school usually?
- Have you heard about the ECM project? What is it about?
- Does the teacher discuss ECM and its impacts on health and society?
- What do you know about SECMRA 2013? Who gave you this knowledge?
- What have you learned from this Act? How important it is for you?
- What trainings have you received from this project? How many teachers were trained? What changes did you see in yourself?
- How do you relate this knowledge with your teaching in school?(teacher)
- Have you started talking with parents and/or students, particularly after trainings, on the subject?
- Do you see any change in the community, parents and students perception about ECM after this project? How?
- Dropout ratio decreased/ enrollment increased / parents are open to discussion on the subject?
- In your opinion, were the project activities sufficient enough to bring change or do they need more activities and up-scaling?
- Any other suggestions/recommendations?

18. List of persons and institutions interviewed or consulted and sites visited

A total of 140 direct beneficiaries including girls ages between 14-18 years, parents, 30 indirect beneficiaries and 07 SCF and local partner's staff were contacted during the evaluation of the project in three districts of Sindh province - M.T.Khan, Dadu and Sukkur. In each FGD session, participants' ratio was 12-18 including parents, girls and other family members. Listed below is the list of stakeholders consulted:

Primary beneficiaries

100 Parent including both mothers and fathers

40 Girls ages 16 -18 years

Secondary beneficiaries

ASP City Sukkur

ASI Saleh Pat, Sukkur

Advocate Sukkur and Dadu

Electronic and print media persons- Dadu, Sukkur

Nikahkhan TM Khan, Dadu, Sukkur

Nikah registrar-Dadu, Sukkur

Pandit-TM Khan

Community Human Rights Group members (CHRG) –TM Khan, Dadu, Sukkur

Youth group members- TM Khan, Dadu, Sukkur

LHV

SCF and local partner staff

Executive Director

Monitoring Officer

Finance Officer

Dawn Development Organization

Executive Director

Project officer

NAARI

Chief Executive Officer

Project officer

19. List of supporting documents reviewed

1. Project Proposal
2. Project progress reports
3. Final Draft Review of SCMRA- 2013
4. Success stories
5. Media clips
6. Field reports
7. Contract/agreements signed with donor

20. CVs of consultants who conducted the evaluation

CVs of consultants are attached separately

ⁱ<https://pakistan.unfpa.org/en/topics/child-marriage-4>

ⁱⁱ Progress report, Implementing partners

iii Project progress report

iv Project report