

Evaluation Report

Final evaluation of the project

“Preventing exploitation, abuse, violence and trafficking of vulnerable girls through the development of effective and accessible state referral and support networks and services”

The project is funded by the United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence Against Women managed by the United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women

Implemented by the NGO Child Rights Centre

Evaluation is performed by:

Mr. Armen Melkumyan

Independent Evaluator

Monitor, EU Results-Oriented Monitoring Programme

Tel: 0037491203128

E-mail: armen_melkumyan@yahoo.com

Evaluation is managed by:

Mr. Tojidin Jalolov

Director of NGO “Child Rights Centre”

Tel: 00992372218125

E-mail: t.jalolov.crc@gmail.com

15 November 2012

Acknowledgements:

This UN Trust and Fund UN Women evaluation exercise has been performed during the July-August 2012 with the field mission during 15-20 July 2012 to Dushanbe and regions in Tajikistan. The performed evaluation is a decentralized external final evaluation aimed at assessment of the impact and outcomes of the project 'Preventing exploitation, abuse, violence and trafficking of vulnerable girls through the development of effective and accessible state referral and support networks and services'.

The evaluation mission has been supported by a number of organizations and individuals. The evaluation consultant would like to express his gratitude to the NGO Child Rights Center with his team, Regional partner NGOs, NCWFA, GSC, UN Women SRO in Kazakhstan, UN Trust Fund.

The presented information, analysis and findings are based on the desk study (second half June), field mission, consultations with the NGO Child Rights Centre and stakeholders (July), initial reporting (August-September) and comments by the UN Trust Fund. It is in conformity with the Terms of References for the final evaluation,

The results of the evaluation are primarily intended for the Government and NCWFA, UN Women/UN Trust Fund to End Violence against Women, the Implementer and its Partners, to build on the existing experience and utilize the observations and recommendations in future actions' design and planning.

Contents:

Glossary	4
Executive Summary	5
The framework and methodology of the performed evaluation:	7
Purpose of the evaluation	7
The methodology of evaluation	10
The context and description of the project	15
Findings and analysis per evaluation criteria	17
Relevance and quality of design	17
Effectiveness of the Intervention:	22
<i>Outcome 1: Target Girls are able to continue their rehabilitation and reintegration service in supported living units.</i>	<i>22</i>
<i>Outcome 2: Increase in assistance to the target group in their local community through the Regional NGO partners</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>Outcome 3: Effective Referral Networks identifies and refers girls throughout the country in 10 Districts in Tajikistan</i>	<i>28</i>
<i>Outcome 4: The National Committee on Women and Family Affairs (NCWFA) is the lead state agency actively promoting the rights of the girls in Tajikistan.</i>	<i>29</i>
Efficiency of implementation:	34
Prospects for Sustainability:	37
Impact: Longer-term effects of the project:	41
Conclusions	45
Recommendations	49
Annex 1. Evaluation Matrix	51
Annex 2. People met and interviews conducted	63
Annex 3. The documentation, information and sources	64
Annex 4. Terms of Reference for the Evaluation	65

Glossary

CEDAW - Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women

CRC – Child Rights Centre

CRD – Child Rights Departments of the National Commission on Child Rights of Tajikistan

EU – European Union

GSC – Girls Support Centre subordinated to the National Committee on Women and Family Affairs

NCWFA - National Committee on Women and Family Affairs

PDT – Policy Development Team

OSCE – Organization for Security and Cooperation of Europe

SDCA – Swiss Development and Cooperation Agency

SILU – Semi-Independent Living Units

SWOT – Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats analysis

ToRs – Terms of References

UNCAT – United Nations Committee Against Torture

UNICEF – United Nations Children Fund

UNCRC – United Nations Committee on the Rights of a Child

UN CRC – United Nations Convention on Child Rights

UNDAF – United Nations Development Assistance Framework

UNDP – United Nations Development Programme

UNEG – UN Evaluation Group

UNFPA – United Nations Fund for Population

Executive Summary

The context and the intervention

The UN Trust Fund in Support of Actions to Eliminate Violence against Women (UN Trust Fund) was established by the UN General Assembly Resolution 50/166 in 1996 to 'provide technical assistance at the community, regional, and international levels that will advance the development of innovative models and strategic interventions in the area of violence against women'.

With this purpose the UN Trust Fund has launched 16 grant-making cycles in the period of 1996 – 2012. The grant beneficiaries constituted governmental, non-governmental organizations, United Nation's Country Teams and other eligible applicants, who's initiatives were aimed at elimination of violence, abuse, exploitation of women and girls, introduction of country-wide or regions-specific systems and practices for protection of their rights, empowerment of women, as well as fighting and prevention of trafficking. The UN Trust Fund has delivered more than USD 78 million to 339 initiatives in 127 countries and territories.

In this framework the UN Trust Fund announced its annual call for proposals in 2008 through which the project 'Preventing exploitation, abuse, violence and trafficking of vulnerable girls through the development of effective and accessible state referral and support networks and services' has been funded. Partially, the project was funded also by the the European Union, UK Big Lottery Fund and Sigrid Rausing Trust.

Based on its prior experience in protection of children's rights and in supporting juvenile justice reforms, the grant beneficiary, the Public Association Child Rights Center (NGO CRC) in cooperation with its partner, the UK Children's Legal Center, developed the project as a consolidated response to the needs for the establishment of a coordinated system and practices for protection of the rights and rehabilitation of the girls aged 10-18 in Tajikistan.

The project focused on four main components: 1) Providing access for the girls-survivors of violence and girls at risk to the centralized protection, rehabilitation, reintegration services through development and strengthening of the newly established Girls Support Centre and through establishing two Semi-independent living units; 2) Enhancing the access to rights' protection services, qualified consultancy, gender-specific education in the regions of the country through strengthening the specialized NGOs – partners of CRC; 3) Establishing a referral network in regions, including relevant state, health and educational bodies, through improvement of the capacities of these bodies, establishing referral procedures and wider involvement of society; 4) Strengthening the coordination framework at the national level through institutional strengthening of the National Commission on Women and Family Affairs, improving the legislation as well as supporting the relevant policy framework.

Evaluation

The current evaluation is a final, end-of project evaluation of the results and outcomes of the project.

As such, the evaluation is an overall assessment of the project's relevance to the environment, stallholder's needs and priorities, the quality and completeness of design, efficiency of implementation, effectiveness in achievement of goals, planned outcomes and results, impact on the target groups and target area, as well as the prospects for sustainability of the results, services and outcomes.

The evaluation has been initiated by the UN Trust Fund, UN Women SRO in Kazakhstan and the NGO CRC, as a planned activity for learning and disseminating lessons on the performance of the project and the further needs in the target area to be still addressed by the stakeholders.

The evaluation mission took place during July-August 2012, with a field mission to Tajikistan in the second half of July. The evaluation has been carried out with the support by UN Trust Fund, UN Women and NGO CRC.

This report presents the analysis, findings, conclusions regarding the intervention and recommendations both on possible improvements of similar interventions in future and on the needs for undertaking and actions towards further strengthened impact and sustainability of the project's results and services.

The findings, conclusions and recommendations in the evaluation report do not represent the opinion of the managing parties – the UN Trust Fund, UN Women and NGO CRC. Those are the based on the evaluation consultant's work, analysis and perception.

Summary of findings

The project has been generally successful. It managed to contribute to and support the current crucial change in the national systems of protection and rehabilitation of the girls-survivors of violence and girls at risk.

Through the project the consolidation of the protection and rehabilitation system was facilitated. While previously, different authorities and institutions could and actually apply drastically divergent approaches and practices for handling violence cases, which were often ending up with the condemnation of the girls, their isolation and placement in special institutions, thus, adding to the violence and not protecting them. With recent consolidation of powers in the target area at the National Commission for Women and Family Affairs this problem has been significantly overcome. However, the NCWFA and its subordinated Girls Support Centre (GSC) experienced lack of knowledge, procedures, management practices and coordination mechanisms with the other authorities in charge. Here, the project's contribution was notable. It managed to support the NCWFA in strengthening its institutional capacities, internal management, to set-up effective supervision over the GSC, newly established Semi-independent living units (SILUs), largely effective cooperation with relevant Ministries, coordination framework and referral procedures for interaction and handling the violence cases in regions, as well as with initial development of further NCWFA policies.

The next major contribution of the project was bringing into practice the principle of inclusion and participation of the civil society into the newly established protection and rehabilitation system. The new practices and procedures made possible the participation of the communities, community leaders, families, NGOs, volunteering specialists and other civic groups in the whole chain of the protection system and prevention activities.

Hence, the projects managed to contribute to the process of change of the systems and environment for protection of girls from the previous state-centered one to a child-centered one, and, thus, also contributed to its objective of 'Prevention of exploitation, abuse, violence, and trafficking of vulnerable girls of the age of 10-18 in Tajikistan'.

The project was enough successful in achievement of its outcomes that can be characterized as follows.

- 1) The core structures of the rehabilitation and reintegration of girls, the GSC and SILUs, were finally established, strengthened, equipped and provided with sufficient procedural framework to operate efficiently;
- 2) The outreach practices and mechanisms have been developed in the regions through the strengthening, capacity building of partner NGOs in all 10 districts of the country. The partner NGOs has acted as the main initiators for protection and prevention activities. Through the activities of the partner-NGOs the protections services became better perceived, accepted by the target groups and more accessible for the girls.
- 3) The project managed to establish a referral network in the regions, including the partner-NGOs, regional Child Rights Departments, law enforcement, educational and healthcare service providers. The referral network commenced its activities based on the referral procedures developed by the project. However, it heavily relied on the partner-NGOs, who's services were mainly funded by the project.
- 4) The project notably contributed to the strengthening of the NCWFA as an institution and as a supervision and coordination body for the upgraded protection and rehabilitation system.

Meantime, the intervention had some shortcomings in the design, implementation. It also did not plan and implement enough complete set activities aimed at further sustainability of the results and widening impacts. As such the main issues were as follows:

- 1) The project would need a phased approach, where the first phase would serve for the establishment of the system, practices and learning lessons on the experience of a few years; the second phase – for further legal-regulatory and institutional development of the system and finalization of policies and respective budgetary frameworks for further efficient operation of the system
- 2) The project lacked analysis on the developed systems of protection and rehabilitation abroad. It could have used its international experts' capacities to provide for this in order to perform gaps analysis and benchmark the development of the newly established system in Tajikistan
- 3) The further sustainability of the project's results will need finalization of the Strategy of NCWFA, as a lead document for laying down the principles and approach of the development of the protection system, as well as providing for a dedicated budget for the maintenance and development of the system.

The framework and methodology of the performed evaluation:

Purpose of the evaluation

The rational and scope

This evaluation is conducted as a final assessment of and a planned measure by the NGO Child Rights' Centre, with the guidance and support of UN Trust Fund to end violence against women and UN Women.

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the final outcomes and effects of the intervention and to produce an improved vision on the further interventions aimed at protection of girls' rights and prevention of violence against the girls.

The evaluation pays attention to revealing the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability of the results and impact of the project. Particularly, the impact of the intervention on the key drivers, societal developments and emerging systems for protection of girls and reducing violence against them are examined. These are: the upgraded system of protection with several newly established elements of coordination, improvements of the environment, consolidation of role-players, decision-makers and social groups, overall perception of the problem of violence different social groups, the legal framework related to the prevention and handling of violence, initiating and communicative networks, social, educational and career opportunities for girls, development of supporting infrastructures, as well as for self-initiation and rehabilitation, reintegration of girls and encouragement to engage in social life and reveal their potential in benefit of the society.

As stipulated in the Terms of References for this evaluation mission, its objective is 'to measure the impact and success of the project in establishing a system of identification, referral, community based support and protection at Girls Support Service'.

According to the ToRs, the evaluation is specifically supposed to:

- Measure the impact and success of the project in establishing a system of identification, referral, and community based support and protection at the Girls Support Service for the target group, being girls between 10 and 18 who have been or are at risk of sexual abuse, exploitation or trafficking.
- Evaluate the changes in institutional structures and practices, analyzing the sustainability of the integration of the referral networks into the state child protection and juvenile justice apparatus.
- Provide a list of recommendations for ways in which the various components of the project can be sustained by the NCWFA following the completion of the donor funding period.

The further possible usage of evaluation results

The findings of the evaluation will be used for drawing conclusions and drafting recommendations regarding: the further state policy; policy of financing of the results of the intervention; organizational and institutional improvements needed for strengthening the NCWFA, GSC and other state bodies, the newly established referral network; finding out possibilities to retain and further develop the established regional network of partner-NGOs, possibilities to retain and further effectively use the quality professional resources created during the project's implementation.

The results of evaluation are supposed to be used by UN Women, UN Trust Fund, the NCWFA, the EU Delegation to Tajikistan, UNICEF and other stakeholders in their further attempts to support the development and further strengthening of the system of protection of girls and prevention of violence in the country.

Particularly, the evaluation consultant supposes that the findings, conclusions and recommendations will be used by the following stakeholders to undertake actions and decide on the following aspects of intervention:

In part of the Government, the NCWFA and involved ministries:

- Finalization and adoption of the key policies and improvement of the legislation for the established referral system: particularly adoption of the strategy of NCWFA and formalization of the MoUs between the NCWFA and other ministries, as well as the partner NGOs and regional branches of related state authorities.
- Further development and support for stability of the key institutions, involved in the referral network established through the project. This should include a vision on further economic

soundness/budgetary policies, human resources, applied work technologies and methodologies at the NCWFA, Girls Support Centre (GSC) and Semi-Independent Living Units (SILUs).

- Establishment of a practice of consultations between the key governmental agencies with the aim to provide for more support to the regional bodies in terms of human resources and funding.
- Elaborating specific educational and vocational programs aimed at social reintegration of the girls - survivors of violence and girls at risk.
- Schemes for continuous involvement of the partner NGOs in regions in the work of the established system of protection, as the key and, still, the most efficient partners for oversight and coordination among other partners, by the time when the NCWFA and regional Child Right's Departments will be in a position to fully coordinate the system.

In part of UN Women, UN Trust Fund, other UN Family organizations active in the target field (UNICEF, UNFPA, UNDP), the EU Delegation to Tajikistan, as well as further potential applicants and grant beneficiaries will need to take the conclusions and recommendations into account to design more targeted, well-prepared, phased and structured interventions in future, including also such aspects as:

- Better prior analysis on the situation, root causes, cultural aspects related to the violence against girls, as well as better account of the existing studies, researches on the phenomena in the country.
- The transfer of know-how on the best practices of involvement of the civil society (NGOs, communities, leaders, civic active groups) into the both policy-making and referral mechanisms.
- More efficient use of the international expertise resources, as regards the involvement of specialized international short-term expertise.
- More attention to the internal institutional and capacity building of the involved institutions.
- More elaborate approach to the improvement and fulfillment of the legal-regulatory environment.
- Possibly, construction of interventions on a phased basis, to allow time and evolution and absorption of results by the state authorities.

Summarizing, the above the evaluation avails lessons learned and recommendations, which will serve to: (i) further improved design and implementation of effective interventions by the leading stakeholders and UN Women, (ii) dedicated actions by the governmental bodies to support the outcomes of similar projects.

The context and setting of the evaluation

The evaluation takes place at the end of the initial phase of reforms towards establishment of a system for protection of the rights of, prevention and fighting violence against the girls aged 10-18.

The current project has been the main tool for supporting these reforms. It achieved results that by and large were incorporated by the upgraded system. However, a wide range of policy, regulatory, institutional and organizational issues still remain and the system still does not function to its full potential. While the main institutions were established and/or strengthened, initial work technologies and procedures were developed, public awareness increased, the achievements need further support by the government in terms of resources, streamlining and finalizing policies and legislation. Additional international expertise would be also needed to provide for a professional review of the system, gap analysis and planning for further reforms.

Hence, this evaluation mission takes place at a junction between the first, can be said, 'induction' phase and the further 'improvement' phase of the development of a comprehensive national system of protection of girls.

In this, the evaluation mission has an opportunity to observe the initial developments of a system, identify the main gaps (still not a comprehensive assessment of a system), and recommend course of action both to the government and donors, for proper follow-up and finalization of reforms.

The evaluation has been managed by the UN Women Sub-Regional Office for Eastern Europe and Central Asia and the NGO CRC – the grant beneficiary, based on the ToRs developed by the SRO.

The project has been operating for 39 months, including the three-month extension. The project has been finalized by March 2012 and submitted the Final administrative report to UN Women by April 2012.

Hence, the current evaluation has had a chance to observe the final results of the project and, to some extent, the effects and impacts of the intervention in a whole.

The current evaluation is organized in one main phase, i.e. desk study, screening the available information and immediate launch of the field phase with further delivery of the evaluation report (see also the limitations below).

Due to organizational difficulties, the field visit took place around four months after the finalization of the project. The announcement for the current evaluation has been advertised since early 2012, however, with no final outcome. So, the current consultant has been contacted in May 2012 and selected directly, based on evaluator's previous experience with UN Women.

Originally, the evaluation was planned to be carried out by a team composed of an international evaluation consultant and a local evaluation consultant by end of May, which did not realize due to international consultant's health state. Followed, due to temporary unavailability of both the consultant and the CRC core team, the start was postponed to second half of July 2012. As the start of the mission was postponed, the local evaluation consultant became unavailable due to engagement in other assignments.

Hence, the current final evaluation has been carried out by an international evaluation consultant. The NGO CRC has been supporting the consultant with project's documentation and other information specific to the target field, organizing the reference group, selection and scheduling of interviews for a field mission, additional logistical support and consultations. The UN Women availed some support in the form of project's documentation by the end of evaluation mission.

Verbally, during the implementation, the project has been evaluated through a mission deployed by the European Commission (EU Delegation to Tajikistan); however, the evaluation report has not been available to the evaluation consultant (See the limitations for evaluation mission below).

The limits of the evaluation

The evaluation mission had a range of limitations due to several factors: the unsuccessful tendering and delayed organization; weak involvement of the parties; poor organization of the information, documents reporting and statistics both at the project level and overall target field; time limitations, as well as limitation on involvement of reference groups. All-in-all, these limitations did not notably affect the possibilities to assess the final results and impacts of the intervention and on the range and quality of the conclusions and recommendations. Nevertheless, would these limitations be reduced, the quantitative analysis and findings would be enriched to allow for better grounding of further conclusions and recommendations.

To overcome the evaluation consultant adopted an approach with concentration on:

- Quality assessment of the results of the intervention, using the experience of the NGO CRC, its counterparts, the experience of similar projects in the same region, as well as the evaluator's own experience
- More focus group discussions and brainstorming to recoup with missing or incomplete data on the results and to re-check the results and their effects on legal-regulatory framework, institutional aspects and on utilization and absorption of the results by the target groups
- Conceptual mapping of the deliverables with cross-checking with the available third party information
- Verification of the conclusions with the main participants and stakeholders of the project, who are knowledgeable, experienced and possess information (often – not put on a paper and in project's reports) on factual situation and on opportunities for further developing the project's outcomes.

The main limitations of the evaluation mission in categories were as follows:

The scope of information:

The scope of information by the funding/donor organization (UN Women, UNTF) and the grant beneficiary has been rather limited in that:

- No strategic programming and planning documents of UN Women and UNTF were made available, under which the current project was funded and implemented
- The Project Document, Final Report and Annual Work Plans were not available at the start of the evaluation mission: these were made available, partially, by the end of field mission and, partially, after the first draft of the evaluation report

- No analytical information, research papers and reports have been available throughout the evaluation mission up to the second draft of the evaluation report
- A very limited analytical information has been available/found by the evaluator on the web on: the gender statistics, situation with Child's Rights, state mechanisms and policies in support to adolescents, especially the girls, analysis and reviews of implementation of the relevant UN Treaties/Conventions (e.g. Child Right's Convention, CEDAW)
- The project's former Team Leader - International Expert was not available. The second Team Leader - International Expert was available, however, with quite a weak feedback on the questions and requests of the evaluation mission for project's documents, for consolidated statistics, for description of situation regarding the implementation of national programs in support to the juveniles/girls, on compliance of Tajikistan to the relevant UN Treaties/Conventions, etc.
- No integrated and comprehensive statistics has been available on the project's performance and deliverables: the evaluator has to scrutinize the project's annual and final reports and resemble those as he could at his best, which bears the risk of technical mistakes.

Time limitations:

- The current mission was undertaken 4 months after completion of the project, which did not and could not allow effective communication with and sampling of the respondents' base.
- There was no time available for preparation and inception phase. After a number of sessions of negotiations, the decision on undertaking the mission was done in mid July and evaluation has been launched immediately starting from field phase, again, in mid July (acceptance of the evaluator's offer to start the mission and respective approval were done in one week period). Meantime, the evaluation consultant admits that himself has been under a pressure of number of missions during June-July and was rather on a busy schedule between the time of agreement on his involvement (end of May 2012) and actual start of the field phase (mid July 2012).
- The field phase, as in almost all current evaluations of projects funded through UNTF in the target region, was rather short – only five days, which did not and could not allow comprehensive field work. Particularly, it was quite difficult to organize more regional meetings or meetings with some of the professional staff of the counterparts, while their majority was on vacation.

Rather limited statistical, legal-institutional information

- There have not been a baseline and end-line studies and surveys, neither by the project nor by any other specialized organizations
- The state statistics does not detail gender-sensitive and girls' status related information
- The main source for the legal acts is the parliament's web-site, which however, does not present any analytical information on the legislation, such as: comparative analysis e.g. with UN model laws, EU legal acts; platforms for civil society consultations; reviews by independent experts, etc.

Limited access to the respondents base and, thus, sampling limitations

- Due to various reasons - the recently frequent changes in the administrative staff, the summer vacation period, limited time for visiting regions - the ministries, state agencies and local authorities were not reachable except the ones of NCWFA and those in the regions cooperating closely with the regional partner NGOs
- Some officials previously dealing with the project were not contacted due to limited timeframe and overburdened schedule of the only two staff working at CRC in summer vacations

As it was mentioned, these range of limitations were overcome jointly with the participants of evaluation mission to the extent that allowed arriving to finalized conclusions and recommendations.

The methodology of evaluation

The overall approach of the evaluation incorporated the three basic principles: inclusion, participation and power sharing. An attention was paid to the involvement of sufficient representation of the target groups and their proper participation, as much as it was possible in the limitations described above: while commencing the exercise four months after the project, in the circumstances of unavailability of one of the Team Leaders (who initially started with project), some representatives of the key institutions, clear and complete reporting and lack of aggregated statistics and supplementary studies and surveys.

The evaluator used group discussions and brainstorming as per the target groups in the **Evaluation Matrix (See the Annex 1 – Evaluation Matrix)**. A particular attention was paid to the inclusion of the most vulnerable groups and final beneficiaries. The sensitivities of voicing and appeal were considered carefully and confidentially.

An attempt was made to resemble the minimum required continuum of representatives of the core state bodies (ministries – participants of the Child Rights' Commission) through the group discussion at the NCWFA, as well as the representatives of the local administrations, governmental bodies' regional departments and civic groups at the regional partner NGOs. Hence, the groups of stakeholders and their interests have been addressed to the most possible extent in the given environment.

The evaluation was performed in a way to allow the Implementer and any other joining parties to apprehend its scope and methodology, as well as methods of self-evaluation and usage of results in further action design. A specific attention was paid to the possibility to bring-in corrections and adjustments to the scope and information by the different parties. For this purpose, the evaluation was carried out with sufficient explanations, presentations and comments on its stages jointly with the stakeholders.

The Evaluation Matrix, the basic analytical document, which served for proper planning of the process and carrying out analysis, has been developed through the review of all program documents and program design tools available (see the Annex 3 – List of documents consulted), monitoring reports, discussions with relevant partners and analysis on reviews and assessments of situation in the target field by the international organizations. The basic analysis was based on the logic of the change theory, i.e. examination of the impact of the intervention on the transformation of the previous systems to a new one. The links between inputs, activities, outputs, outcomes and goals (intervention logic) of the program has been carefully studied and re-mapping and re-conceptualization of the intervention performed.

Both qualitative and quantitative data collection methods were used. The focus was more on the qualitative methods, as the main aim of the evaluation was to assess the establishment of the protection system with its referral sub-system and respective structural, legal and institutional improvements of the constituents of the system – the involved state institutions and the regional networks.

The qualitative data of the project has been homogeneous for each target group and respective sub-component of the project. It was straightforward: means each target group was quantified once and received specific and limited number of services or products of the project, which was well-enough described in the project's annual reports. Hence, no chart, table, segmentation, correlation analysis is used.

Very often, the analysis and assumptions to arrive to conclusions referred to the same source of information, e.g. discussion and brainstorming with the target groups. This was far necessitated by the social nature of the project and difficulties in quantification of a number of its effects and impacts.

The original evaluation questions and those developed within the mission

The **Terms of References** for the current evaluation mission brought forward the following key questions.

“Relevance

- Are the project objectives addressing identified rights and needs of the target group(s) in regional contexts?
- Do the activities address the problems identified?
- Is the project design articulated in a coherent structure?

Effectiveness

- What has been the progress made towards achievement of the expected outcomes and expected results?
- What are the results achieved?
- What are the reasons for the achievement or non-achievement?
- To what extent have beneficiaries been satisfied with the results?
- To what extent the objectives have been achieved, and do the intended and unintended benefits meet fairly the needs of disadvantaged women?
- What is the reach of the project in view of the targets envisioned at the start?

Efficiency

- What measures have been taken during planning and implementation to ensure that resources are efficiently used?
- Have the outputs been delivered in a timely manner?
- Could the activities and outputs been delivered with fewer resources without reducing their quality and quantity?
- Have UN Women's organizational structure, managerial support and coordination mechanisms effectively supported the delivery of the project?

Sustainability

- What is the likelihood that the benefits from the project will be maintained for a reasonably long period of time if the project were to cease?
- Is the programme supported by national/local institutions? Do these institutions demonstrate leadership commitment and technical capacity to continue to work with the project or replicate it?
- What adaptive or management capacities of national partners, such as learning, leadership, programme and process management, networking and linkages have been supported?

Impact:

- What are the intended and unintended, positive and negative, long term effects of the project?
- To what extent can the changes that have occurred as a result of the project be identified and measured?
- To what extent can the identified changes be attributed to the project?
- What are the positive and negative changes produced directly or indirectly by the project on the opportunities of different groups of women, and on the socioeconomic conditions of their localities?" (See the Terms of References – Annex 4)

In order to provide for comprehensive assessment, as far as possible in the existing limitations, the evaluator has elaborated the **Evaluation Matrix (Annex 1)**. The Matrix detailed the further key and specific questions per evaluation criteria, further specified respondent groups, sources of information and data, methods of data analysis, and the indicators – success standards per each question.

The main data sources and data collection methods

The evaluation consultant used the following data sources.

1. Documents, studies, analysis, legal acts

- The administrative reports of the implementing organization: the annual progress reports of NGO CRC with adjacent materials: presentations, monitoring reports on field monitoring activities of the team performed in the ten regions; promotional materials.
- Periodic reports of the NGO partners; decisions of the local authorities.
- The draft Strategy of the NCWFA, the draft Law on Domestic Violence.
- The relevant decisions of the NCWFA and Ministries, files of the girls – survivors of violence with chronicle and documents of the treatment received at GSC and SILUs.
- Internal policies and procedures developed by the Girls Support Service.
- The materials, records and evaluations of the trainings provided to local partners, project's staff, NCWFA and other ministerial staff, lawyers and social workers.

2. The sources available on the web:

- The Concluding observations of the UN Committee on the Rights of a Child at its 53rd sessions on the reports submitted by the Government of Tajikistan and (11-29 January 2010);
- Concluding comments of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women to the combined initial, second and third periodic reports of Tajikistan (CEDAW/C/TJK/1-3) at its 771st and 772nd meetings, on 26 January 2007
- Publication by the Child Right's International Network of 21 September 2011
- UNICEF's Child Poverty Report of 2007
- The legal database of the Parliament of Tajikistan: particularly, the Law on Parental Responsibilities; The Law on Fighting Trafficking of Human Beings

- Evaluation of the Juvenile Justice Alternatives Projects (JJAPs) by the Commission on Child Rights under the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan (NCCR) and UNICEF

3. Interviews and discussions with key stakeholders

- The NCWFA, other governmental units (combined at NCWFA), GCS
- SILUs, social workers, trainers and girls receiving treatment and support
- CRC's local staff: the trainers, lawyers, policy team and one international expert (the last Team Leader)
- Regional Partners: NGOs – partners of the project/CRC; local authorities (combined at NGOs)

The evaluation consultant, in order to obtain the comparative picture of similar interventions in the region, contacted and received also information from the EU Delegations in Armenia, Georgia, Moldova.

The main data collection methods were: (i) structured interviews with stakeholder groups and the project team based on the questionnaires developed through the further specification of the Evaluation Matrix; (ii) groups discussions and brainstorming with the project team and some of the stakeholders' groups; (iii) analysis and studies on available materials mentioned above; (iv) web-based information and available studies on the target field in the country; (v) comparative analysis over the similar projects in the region. Taking into account the limitations, the evaluation also extensively used the supplementary methods, such as the observation of feedback and reaction of respondents, debates and knowledge testing, rating of feedback.

Table 1: The contact methods and number of stakeholders consulted

Stakeholders	Method of contact	Number of people
Project's team	Interviews; brainstorming and discussions	8
Regional partner NGOs (invited regional bodies)	Interviews, brainstorming, group discussions	7 (6)
NCWFA and PDT (invited state bodies)	Interviews, group discussions	2 (4)

Stakeholders' role and participation:

The main stakeholder groups involved in the evaluation were: (i) the project's team and specialists, as the main management, professional and training facility; (ii) the professional service-providers of diverse partner organizations trained by the project; (iii) the NGOs-partners and the representatives of the regional referral bodies; (iv) the NCWFA and representatives of main state authorities; GSC/SILUs with their professional staff and the girls supported through the SILUs.

To fulfill a sufficient sample of respondents and taking into account time and participation limitations, the evaluation consultant and the NGO CRC organized groups combined discussions at the NCFWA and regional partner NGOs.

The indicative questionnaires and core themes / topics for each group were developed based on the Evaluation Matrix and the initial re-mapping exercise on the intervention with the NGO CRC.

The evaluator will used to brief and de-brief the project's team in order to have a common understanding on the findings, conclusions and draft recommendations.

Wherever it was the case, the methods of data collection and discussion topics were enriched by the contributions of the participants.

The timelines and deliverables within the evaluation mission:

The following deliverables, stipulated in the ToRs were produced and discussed with the NGO CRC and stakeholders:

- Methodology: including the chosen methods for desk and field study, evaluation criteria and analysis, scope of responders, interviews, draft evaluation matrix and questionnaires.
- Evaluation report, including summary with key conclusions and recommendations, structured analytical part, observations, conclusions and recommendations, relevant annexes for persons interviewed, final matrix with benchmarks, references and sources.

Table 2: The timeline of deliverables

Deliverable	Timelines
Draft Methodology	15 July 2012
Debriefing and brainstorming on findings	20 July 2012
First draft of the evaluation report	18 September 2012
Final draft of the evaluation report	12 November 2012

The context and description of the project

The problems with the protection of the rights of children, including girls, have been an outstanding issue for concern and discussion in the country and in the international forum of competent bodies. The child poverty, abuse, violence against children and trafficking have been analyzed and reported on continuously since mid 2000s. (See below 'Relevance and the quality of design').

The main problems that have been reported on by UN Committee on the Rights of a Child, CEDAW, UN Committee against Torture, UN Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women, its Causes and Consequences, UNICEF, Child Rights International Network and other organizations were:

- Widespread abuse and violence against children, especially, in rural areas: with obvious lack of protection mechanisms and rehabilitation and reintegration services
- The weakness of the national legislation and reforms to improve the situation resulting on number of negative consequences, such as the impunity of the aggressors, wider base for trafficking in persons
- The social acceptance of the disadvantaged role of the children, women and girls: with implications on the limitation to education, health services and social-cultural life
- Absence of dedicated state programs supported with sufficient budgetary frameworks to address these problems
- Weak position and coordination frameworks of newly established Commission on Child Rights, Ombudsman, NCWFA
- Weak standing towards improvement of public awareness and consciousness to fight against and prevent violence and restrictive behavior.

In this environment, the grant beneficiary together with its partners developed the idea of the current project to try further improve the situation in the country.

The current grant beneficiary – the Public Association Child Rights Centre (NGO CRC) was established in 2006 through the Child Rights Project implemented by local NGO Minerva.

Since that time the NGO CRC promotes and protects the human rights of children in Tajikistan. Having considerable experience in juvenile justice and child protection systems, its strategies include advocacy, provision of legal information, advice, assistance and representation. The CRC supports social work and legal advice and works directly with children and young people. It also provides services to parents, NGOs, state bodies, agencies and institutions. In 2007, CRC was selected as the local implementing partner for UNICEF's 2005-09 child protection and juvenile justice reform program.

As part of this process, CRC in cooperation with its partners, donors and national authorities identified gaps in the system, regulatory framework and practices of protection of girls-victims of abuse or exploitation. To address these gaps CRC had identified a concept for the current intervention, which would include further re-conceptualization and upgrade of the current protection system, activation and involvement of the referral system in Dushanbe and regions, and further building of both capacities and regulatory framework to work the upgraded system better.

The NGO CRC developed the current project with UK Children's Legal Center NGO. The latter UK CLC has been at that time engaged in a project, funded through UNICEF, supporting the establishment of conceptually new Juvenile Justice Alternative Projects, aimed at replacing detention of juveniles to community based care centers.

The importance of developing of a consolidated protection system, response facility and services for vulnerable girls has been recognized by the government of Tajikistan in its National Plan of Action for protecting rights and interests of children (2003-2010) and in the National Plan of Action for Juvenile Justice System Reform 2010-2015. The current project served as a response to a number of programmatic tasks set forward in the latter National Plan.

In 2008 the current project has been launched with the support of the UK Big Lottery Fund, European Union and Sigrid Rausing Trust.¹ However, the funding from the mentioned organizations and the EU covered only the part of the project related to the renovation and equipping the GSC. The major part of the project's planned activities for providing for legal, social, psychological and other services for the girls,

¹ See the link: <http://www.childrenslegalcentre.com/index.php?page=tajikistan>

strengthening the NCWFA, GSC, establishment and improvement of regional referral network, policy and legal framework needed funding.

In 2008 NGO CRC had applied for a grant and received funding through UN Trust Fund to End Violence Against Women (UN Trust Fund), administered by UN Women on behalf of the UN system. NGO CRC entered into a Project Cooperation Agreement with UN Women, under which the current project has been implemented during the period of January 2009 – December 2011. In December 2011 the Project Cooperation Agreement was extended for another three months until 31 March 2012.

The objective of the project was to develop effective and accessible community-based and national support services for girls aged 10-18 - victims of violence or at risk of exploitation, abuse, violence and trafficking. The objective was to be achieved through improvement of institutional settings, legal and procedural frameworks and by strengthening the capacities of the child protection system, state residential institutions, district law enforcement bodies, professionals and civil society to identify the target group and respond effectively to their needs.

The main approach of the project has been the development and changes to the practices of handling the violence against girls from the traditional state of affairs and former law and state-centered approach to that of child-centered approach with inclusion of the key stakeholders and civil society representatives.

The intervention had four components, breaking down the project into four main logical courses of action, group of results, outputs and outcomes. These were:

- Establishment of Supported Living Units (SILUs) in Dushanbe. Setting up two residential units where girls aged 16 - 18 years old or over, who had completed a six month stay and rehabilitation at the Girls Support Centre, can stay, continuing their rehabilitation process, in the case it was not possible to reintegrate them back into the family or live fully independently
- Establishment of regional community-based outreach services for psychological and legal support to the target group through local NGOs in all ten regions of Tajikistan
- Training and support for referral networks and Girls Support Centre Staff to develop referral networks for efficient identification and handling of violence cases in cooperation with local (regional) level child protection, law enforcement and other related bodies;
- Establishment of a Policy Development Team to support the National Committee on Women and Family Affairs (NCWFA) in its role of a lead government agency within the protection system and an entity responsible for further policy reforms in the field.

The final beneficiaries of the project have been the girls (aged 10-18) survivors of violence or at risk of violence. The project's services are accessible for the girls through whether referral network or directly in all regions of the country.

The secondary beneficiaries of the project have been the regional authorities and regional referral bodies, policemen, healthcare staff, local NGO professionals and outreach staff who received training and coaching on how to efficiently work the referral system, how to identify and handle or prevent the violence against, exploitation, abuse, trafficking of girls. Families and communities, often, together with religious leaders constituted another related group of beneficiaries, who benefited from the improvements and opportunities generated through the project

The main partners of the project have become the NCWFA with its structures of the GSC, SILUs, regional Child Rights Departments and other related bodies. These institutions, led by NCWFA, have been strengthened and coached to later become the main working mechanisms of the system. NCWFA has been strengthened to later hand-over the further reforms in the target field and be able to engage change management and administration of reform programs.

The project was expected to assist up to 300 girls directly at the Girls Support Centre (GSC), with a further 830 benefiting from the regional outreach services. Actually, the number of assisted girls and the children / families assisted through protection and prevention activities exceeded the initial targets for around three times. Through this intervention, girls have had a viable opportunity to re-engage into a productive and empowered life.

Findings and analysis per evaluation criteria

Relevance and quality of design

The main recent reviews and analysis by international organizations, UN monitoring bodies, reveal the wide range of core problems related to the establishment of effective mechanisms of protection of Child Rights and prevention of violence against children and girls.

The '*Concluding observations of the UN Committee on the Rights of a Child on the reports submitted by the Government of Tajikistan (11-29 January 2010)*' brings comprehensive analysis in the target field.

According to the observation of UN CRC the steps undertaken towards the improvement of the situation has been long and not always efficient. By the year 2010, Tajikistan had joined and ratified practically the full range of relevant conventions, optional protocols, as well as adopted overarching national programming documents in support to the protection of Child Rights and fighting crime, abuse, violence and trafficking of children.²

The country proceeded with adoption of the National Action Plan for Children 2003-2010; National Program to combat human trafficking for 2006-2010; establishment of an institute of Ombudsman; establishment of the Commission on Child Rights; improving cooperation with the NGOs specialized in child protection.

However, several areas for concern remained, summarized as follows.

- The implementing mechanisms of the mentioned programs and established institutions and networks and their financing, as well as, generally, the budgets allocated for the needs of children, including that aimed at protection of their rights and childcare, were still insufficient
- The policies and mechanisms of prevention of institutionalization of children and violence against children, improvement of health services and inclusive education, prohibition of child labor and development of juvenile justice system, strongly needed attention
- The cooperation and coordination among the leading and main implementing agencies of the government, the involvement of the parliament and civil society have remained at a low level.
- The state statistics related to the data concerning persons under the age of 18 were of poor structure and quality, and did not represent the social situation and access to the basic rights
- The cooperation with NGOs remained project-based, with heavy dependence of the state on the NGO partners and donor-funded projects, without further policies and plans to support them with resources, policies and guidelines
- A particular concern was expressed regarding the discrimination against girls and about high school dropout rates of girls in rural areas due to negative traditional and religious attitudes on the roles of girls and women in the society
- The high prevalence of domestic violence, particularly against women and girls, the societal acceptance of widespread violence and the impunity of perpetrators were continuously observed

The Child Rights' International Network (CRIN) further developed and consolidated the observations and analysis of the situation in the country regarding the children's and women rights and issues related to their protection in its *Universal Periodic Review (17 August 2011)*. Here, in addition to the UN CRC's concluding comments, attention was paid to also other observations of the UN Family Organizations related to: the still high level of child labor and weak regulatory practices for its prohibition; particular concerns related to the religious unofficial marriages and the weak regulation of marriage age; the weakness of community-based rehabilitation and reintegration schemes as compared with schemes of detention of the children with problems with a law; limited access to healthcare services for women and girls in rural areas.³

² See the Concluding observations of the UN Committee on the Rights of a Child at its 53th sessions on the reports submitted by the Government of Tajikistan (11-29 January 2010): http://www.unicef.org/ceecis/media_20930.html

³ See the CRIN Child Right's References in the Universal Periodic Review <http://www.crin.org/resources/infoDetail.asp?ID=25819>

In its general publication of 21 September 2011 CRIN continued observations on the reports and recommendations of various UN monitoring bodies (UNCRC, CEDAW, UNCAT) on the situation with the rights of children and women in Tajikistan. This publication particularly highlighted the observations regarding the: publicly accepted practices of punishment of children (40% minimum estimate), psychological abuse (20-60%), early marriage of girls, and trafficking of girls and women for the purposes of sexual exploitation and abuse. The publication resembled the recommendations of the monitoring bodies, in the main, urging the need for the development of a protection and decentralized care system for children and girls; strengthening the national legislation as to fight against the violence and abuse, punishment of perpetrators; raising the marriage age to 18; implementation of national programs in support to increased access to education, health services and cultural life for the children and, particularly, the girls.

The Children's Rights Portal⁴, an independent Indian Humanitarian relief organization for sustainable development and sponsoring children, has pointed to a number of issues regarding the protection of the rights of children and, particularly, the girls in Tajikistan. These, in the main, relates to: the extreme poverty of children (66%); sexual discrimination against the girls related to the realization of their rights for access to education and other services; abuse, particularly, corporate punishment; child labor (over 200,000 children are reported to be exploited); problems related to registration of births and identity.

Summarizing the review of the above-mentioned reviews and reports, and analyzing the results of brainstorming and discussions with the professionals and organizations in the field, the main societal factors driving to the problems related to the girls in the country can be grouped into following three main categories:

- 1) The girls in the families are mainly brought-up as 'silently subordinated' members of the community: hence they are expected to comply with the existing rules and demands and be ruled by men and elders. Often, such demands and ruling go beyond the borders of any personal life and self-development and grows into abuse. E.g. one example of this factor is the widespread limitation of the girls by the relatives to attend a school.
- 2) The role of the girls and women in the society, especially, in the regions, is generally underestimated: they are not expected to reveal more or less strong initiatives for social life, education and further career and not supposed to become leaders and reveal their full potential. An example is the common practice of preventing the newly married women to engage in social life and work.
- 3) The ignorance of the elementary basic rights of the girls surpass the level of usual cultural or religious traditions transferring into a severe limitations, a negative attitude and an aggression, which does not receive a proper response, hence, feeding the aggressors' impunity.
- 4) The unfavorable social-economic conditions lead families and communities using the children's labor, thus, attempting an abuse and exploitation.
- 5) The response by the state and society is weak: while the basic management structures has been established, some legislation and programs developed, the coordination framework, funding framework and regulatory base for effective implementation of the legislation and programs are still awaiting.

Actually almost all-above causes-drivers are facilitated by almost absence of professional support and learning services. The rare attempts to support girls and their families, overcoming psychological problems, advancing educational and career opportunities were scattered in some short-term interventions.

The problems and needs analysis by the project

The project tried to scope the above-mentioned problems and targeted almost all related groups of direct and indirect beneficiaries. There is no information on any baseline surveys and studies by the project before its commencement. It can be understood that the NGO CRC in cooperation with UK CLC, based on their previous experience with more or less similar projects, having a team of qualified experts, developed the concept of the project based on the accumulated knowledge and experience. This is evidenced in the Project Document developed for application to for the UNTF call for proposals in 2008.

Particularly, the both partners have been implementing various projects in support to the children and girls, NCWFA, National Commission on Child Rights, national juvenile justice system. The partners also had an extensive experience and networks in the regions of Tajikistan. These projects were implemented

⁴ <http://childrensrightsportal.org/tajikistan/>

during the 2004-2008 and were funded through UNICEF, British Embassy and Swiss Development and Cooperation Agency and number of other donors.

There is a need to mention that the projects implemented by the NGO CRC and UK CLC have constituted the main interventions in the target field in Tajikistan. Meantime, these interventions addressed the existing problems only partially.

Hence, the current project became to be the first consolidated response to the problems in the target field in the country. In this regard the contribution by UNTF/UN Women has been crucially important and allowed wider and more diversified approach for solution of existing problems and issues in child protection in the country.

The project targeted the several core problems of the public infrastructures and management system in the target area inherited from the soviet times.

The previous system was based on the exclusion, isolation and, often, inadequate treatment of the adolescents, particularly, girls in difficult situation. Often, the decisions on how to approach and handle the cases of violence were taken by various law enforcement, custody bodies or special institutions with no sufficient care and support to the girls. This controversial system was more affecting than supporting.

Similarly, the former system never supposed or allowed inclusion and participation of the civil society representatives and groups. NGOs, families, communities and other civic groups were not involved in decision-making, treatment and support mechanisms.

There as no workable system of punishment of the perpetrators, fights against and prevention of aggressive behavior. The main tools deployed were administrative fines and temporary detention. Very often, the same type of violence was receiving quite diverse responses by the law enforcement bodies. In the main the violence cases were remaining not responded, being considered as an 'in-house' affair. The practices for prevention were weak and, practically, absent in the regions.

In the previous system the role of the protection bodies, committees and commissions supposed to help the girls, adolescents and women, remained rather weak. There was no consolidation and coordination among the decision-makers led by these bodies. As a result, the girls-survivors of violence may appear in isolation centres, special schools with drastically negative consequences.

The country needed a facilitated and coordinated centralized system to meet the challenges and needs of the girls and their families.

The country has a range of cultural-religious specifics, which needed proper attention. In Tajikistan the people follow the religious life closely. Furthermore, gender equality issues are complicated due to the long-standing historical traditions whereas Women have had less role and opportunities for social activity and have been subordinated to men and a wide range of conditionality in the society.

Project's response and structure

In the environment described above, the project was aimed at recognition of problems, their highlighting, and perception, establishing a coordinated national response and protection system, and advancing the capacities of involved partners.

The project identified relevant response strategy in the form of: 1) further strengthening of NCWFA, GSC and other state bodies; 2) facilitating the referral network; 3) strengthening these authorities and actors through capacity building and specialist support; 4) supporting the improvement of the policy and legal framework for further strengthening the system and practices of protection of the girls.

The project can be characterized as a 'structural' intervention. It has been supporting the development of national structures and capacities for adequate response to the violence against children and girls. It has been strengthening the state bodies, structures and civil society forces and their networks to act more efficiently and effectively. In parallel it has been targeting the further efficiency of the state policies, their implementing mechanisms and methodologies.

The project concentrated its 'structural' approach on four main possible pillars of such intervention, providing for coherent structure as follows.

Component 1: Facilitating the development of Girls Support Centre, Semi-independent living Units, methodologies and opportunities for reintegration:

This component was aimed at improving the institutional and methodological strength of the GSC and SILUs in all aspects: facilities and means of work; working technologies, including admission procedures; professionalism and methods of work at SILUs; means and methods of direct assistance to the girls for reintegration into families and society.

Component 2: Increasing the assistance and coverage for protection in the regions:

This component included capacity building and empowerment of the civil society actors in the regions. A network of 10 regional partner NGOs, possessing significant experience in child protection and fighting violence have been strengthened. The NGOs received facilitated support by the project to construct their regional networks with all local state bodies having relation to the protection and promotion of the children's rights, as well as with the communities and educational institutions. A specific assistance was availed to strengthen the legal and social services to the girls through the NGOs.

Component 3: Contribution to the referral networks in the regions:

The component was aimed at establishing working procedures for the regional Child Rights' Centers and related state bodies for monitoring, identification, referral, direct assistance and treatment of the girls-victims of violence and for prevention of violence. The capacity of the involved state bodies has been thoroughly studied, developed: work procedures for referral procedures were elaborated and introduced. The project made an attempt to contribute to the harmonized work of the regional bodies through establishing Memoranda of Understanding both at central and regional levels between the NCWFA and line-authorities and between the NGOs and local state bodies.

Component 4: Institutional strengthening the NCWFA, improvement of policy and legal environment:

The component was aimed at raising the internal working and external coordination capabilities of the NCWFA to further effectively coordinate the related state bodies centrally and in the regions, and to become the lead agency for further reforms in the target area. A special Policy Development Team was deployed to the NCWFA to support these activities. The component included also direct policy advice, awareness raising and advocacy measures to enhance the capabilities of the NCWFA and improve the regulatory environment.

The project's implementation methodology was thought-over well. It provided for logical steps to achieve the outputs and outcomes, as far as that would be possible in the given environment.

The methodology concentrated on gradual 1) liaison with core 'change agents', 2) developing their skills and capacities; 3) introducing methodologies and practices; 4) implementation of the elaborated methodologies and learning on the outcomes; 5) networking and consolidation for systemic improvements.

The analysis of the structure and components of the project indicates the general coherence of the intervention logic. In the main the planned resources were sufficient to implement the activities; the planned activities lead to the attainment of outputs and the combined acquirement of outputs might lead to the realization of outcomes.

The outcomes implied strengthening of the national system of protection against and prevention of violence, improvement of access of the girls and their families to the protections system, improvement of their treatment and support to them for rehabilitation and reintegration. The outcomes also implied facilitated coordination among the stakeholders and decision-makers, as well as closer involvement of the civil society representatives in the protection and prevention practices, which could further bolster the efficiency of the overall state system of response.

Hence, the realization of outcomes might bring to the realization of objectives, i.e. 'Prevention of exploitation, abuse, violence, and trafficking of vulnerable girls'.

Meantime, the intervention logic missed several important elements and did not fully detail the approach for attainment of some of the outputs.

GSC/SILUs: While in general the intervention planned well-enough for the strengthening of professional capacities, work technologies and procedures for this 'rehabilitation facility', and the government availed basic funding for its maintenance, the steps towards establishment of further budgetary frameworks for the GSC and SILUs to cover their needs in professional support and operational capacity were weak.

Referral Networks: The full establishment and further sustainability of the referral network would need more thought-over and systemic approach to provide for sufficient legal-regulatory framework for the stability and efficient operation of the 'network'. Currently, the network operates based on the mutual trust, relations and work methodologies achieved during the project. To a large the network relies on the regional partner NGOs, while the lead role should have been taken over by the regional Child Rights Departments. For the efficient operation of the system these departments need to have sufficient human resources, means and should be in a position to request timely actions and inclusion of all other referral bodies. However, their current budgetary frameworks and regulations do not allow fulfilling this position.

Here, another problem is the generally weak position and functioning of the inter-agency bodies, commissions and committees in the country. As far as the governance system is still mainly a vertical one, the field-level cooperation and coordination of various ministries and agencies is hardly realizable, if not given a special mandate through a law or a package of legal acts. The latter law or package of legal acts need to reflect clearly the powers and responsibilities of the participating agencies for being able to use their time, resources, expertise and means as per the requests of the coordinating body. This means that a well-thought over and dedicated work was needed to elaborate a separate legislation and regulatory basis for the referral system, with further necessary amendments to the existing regulations, charters and procedures, as well as budgets of the participating agencies.

NCWFA: One of the main assumptions of the project was that the NCWFA would be in a position to take-over 'the project', i.e. the newly established system and its development needs, and continue the intervention. However, for this the NCWFA would need rather a strong budgetary framework, as well as finalized strategies approved by the government and parliament (according to the procedures of approval of government-level policies). Although the project made significant and enough successful efforts in this regard (see the Effectiveness), the actions aimed at lobbying the NCWFA's interests at the Government were not enough to achieve strong budgetary framework and adoption of the strategy.

Here, the project could, most probably, plan for stronger support for quicker finalization and adoption of the strategy, as well as stronger coordination with the donor community (notably - UN Family, EU, US Embassy) for supporting the latter.

While the Logical Framework Matrix of the Project was developed well-enough, it missed assumptions and risk management measures related to the above-mentioned issues.

On the other hand, it can be understood that these issues may require more time than the originally planned three-year period of the project. Logically, this project was the first step for supporting the government in establishing the initial system of protection and care for girls.

The Government has experienced weak budgetary management and has been trying to address too many reforms with insufficient budgets, to be able to address the needs of a new system in full.

The project would also benefit from a more elaborate and intensive **communication and awareness building** actions. While number of such activities were implemented, those were not put in a coherent and visible plan and their coverage and effects were not monitored and assessed.

The project's compliance to the guiding National Policies, UN Policies and the Call for Proposals:

The project has responded to the needs raised by the country policy frameworks and UN policies.

The country's needs and strategies for fighting the violence against children have been formulated in the National Action Plan for Juvenile Justice 2010-2015. The document also stipulated for the establishment of the system for the protection of girls and further strengthening the NCWFA and the referral network.

The overall intervention implied through the project is well-supported by the UN framework documents concerning Tajikistan. The United Nations Development Assistance Framework for Tajikistan 2010-2015 comprehensively covers the problems related to the limited access to education, malnutrition and labor of children, including girls.

The project has been developed well-within the framework of the 2008 Calls for Proposals. It addressed the priorities of intervention stipulated the Call and developed sufficient project framework according to the Applicant's Guidelines.

The project's framework, however, could benefit from more detailed and full analysis on the assumptions and risks at the level of outcomes and objectives. A risk management matrix and plans could have been developed to allow timely assessment and mitigation or minimization of the risks. This particularly regards the establishment of the referral network, as well as sustaining the trained and qualified professional staff at NCWFA, GSC and SILUs.

The management and monitoring framework could also benefit from more clear description of further methodologies to be used for assessing and accounting on outputs and outcome indicators.

The project applied this practice for some of the activities implemented by the regional partner NGOs during the implementation, by providing for monitoring missions to the regions, regularly assessing the capacity of the partners, registering and analyzing feedback of different target groups on different measures, and by providing for learning on all these jointly with the local counterparts and donors. However, the results of these activities were not reflected and assessed in the project's progress reports.

Effectiveness of the Intervention:

The first year of implementation was characterized as preparation for the action, which included establishing relations both at national and regional levels, step-by-step introduction of services, advocacy, preparation of a wide range of professionals in diverse institutions, and fine-tuning the elaborated methodologies.

The second year of implementation was characterized with a vast amount of applications from the families and 'service agents' in the regions. Here, the project's staff and the main partners – the GSC, NCWFA, NGOs and regional state bodies had to meet the demand and handle extensive tasks.

In the third year, the partners already accumulated experience and worked-out standardized solutions and approaches, which made their work more efficient.

The main finalized results and effects of the project can be grouped as follows:

- Strengthened country system of monitoring, fighting and handling the violence against girls
- Strengthened institutions in charge of the system: NCWFA, GSC together with internal regulations, procedures, staff, coordination system with other state authorities
- Strengthened network of regional partner NGOs
- More involvement of relevant State Bodies at central government and in regions
- Established practices of identification, referral, treatment, life consultancy, planning, education and employment: finally, reintegration into society whether through the families or through the social facilities, e.g. the GSC/SILUs, colleges, universities and workplaces
- More public support and awareness
- More confidence by the girls at risk and girls-survivors of violence

The project did not develop practices for monitoring the environment (baseline and end-line surveys), final assessment of the institutional standing of the counterparts, legal-comparative analysis with the developed systems, categorization of the target groups and evaluation of the coverage, strength of the project's services to satisfy their needs and contributions to their better state.

This did not allow the project to timely adapt the weak points of intervention, such as: contribution to the legal-regulatory basis for the referral networks, further financial sustainability of the newly established system, as well as the finalized policy/strategy framework for the NCWFA.

The level and substance of achievement of the outcomes by the project has been as follows.

Outcome 1: Target Girls are able to continue their rehabilitation and reintegration service in supported living units.

The outcome has been by and large achieved.

The physical facilities and the regulatory framework for the GSC and SILUs have been established and strengthened, the professional resources improved, the networking with partner institutions improved. The Government undertook the funding of the majority expenditures at GSC and finances the rent for SILUs.

Most notably, the system for handling and treatment of the girls-survivors has been by and large established. As a result, currently they have easier access to the rehabilitation and reintegration services.

However, the further longer-term access for the girls to the services of GSC and SILUs has been constrained by the lack of sufficient funding for legal protection services (lawyer) and number of other core services for providing for efficient operation of SILUs (see also the section for Sustainability below) after the project's finalization.

Some of the indicators of achievement have been as follows.

- 6) The GSC and SILUs facilities were established and the teams trained
- 7) The procedures for GSC and SILUs have been developed and enforced
- 8) Life skills training program for the girls have been elaborated and implemented

- 9) 17 girls were admitted to the schools and, later, 8 of them – to colleges and universities; 10 girls found job; 6 girls were reintegrated to their families; 4 girls were reintegrated and hosted by employers and educational institutions.

The progress with the outputs has been as follows.

Output 1.1: Girls at the supported living units are able to increase their independence

The two apartments for SILUs have been rented and renovated since the year 2010 to host 6 girls each. Those were provided with computer, printer and sewing machine for providing internal training for the girls. In total 18 girls and 3 children have been living in SILUs.

The regulations were developed and approved by the Chair of the NCWFA on: (i) Code of conduct – identifying the internal roles and responsibilities of the staff working at SILUs; (ii) the Charters of GSC for referring girls to SILUs; (iii) the types of services and care for the girls.

Each girl has got an individual care and development plans. These plans contained the training needs and educational program for each girl. An educational program had been devised and implemented for the girls based on the initial and ongoing assessments. This included trainings on life skills and specialized courses.

The life skills program has been delivered on a daily basis and included skills for everyday life, such as house-keeping and caring, budgeting, purchases and procurement, preparation of food, ironing, managing household appliances, and child care.

The specialized courses included teaching the girls practical skills for possible employment, such as hairdressing, computer skills, and sewing. These courses have been delivered for 3 times a week.

Output 1.2: Admissions procedure for girls to the supported living units developed.

The procedures for admission of the girls-survivors of violence have been established and constantly refined throughout the project.

In steps, this includes the following:

1) Initial assessment of the girls based on the information received through the helpline and other information sources. This is performed by the legal, social workers/experts and the psychologist (as necessary) of the project by compiling an Appraisal. The appraisal is a questionnaire developed on the basis of the Rules of GSS. This involves assessment of the risks and the degree of threat in relation to the girl.

2) Further, this Appraisal is transferred to the Admissions Panel consisting of the representatives of the GSS and the NCWFA and based on their decision the girl is being admitted to SILU.

Output 1.3: Conditions for a supportive environment for the girls in the Semi-Independent Living Units created

The project recruited four Youth Workers in October 2009. They started working at the first SILU in October 2009 and in the second SILU in March 2010, and continue their work nowadays, after the project's finalization.

The main task for the Youth Workers has been coaching and partnering the girls in obtaining a beneficial environment both for living and learning. Hence, they needed some specialized trainings to be able to handle the girls' issues and situation professionally, friendly and diplomatically.

For this, the Youth Workers received a dedicated training on several topics, such as: (i) 'Healthy way of life'; (ii) AIDS and sexually transmitted diseases; and (iii) 'Working with girls at risk'; (iv) Regulations and procedures of SILUs; and (v) Social work.

These training have assisted the Youth Workers to better apprehend the needs of the girls, to obtain skills for professional and long-term treatment of the issues related to the girls, and for building-up positive experience and learning. The trainings also contributed to the effectiveness of the 'family conferences' and the work of Youth Workers towards reintegration of girls into their families.

Along with this, the staff of SILUs received thematic trainings by the project's trainers on: (i) 'Child protection politics'; (ii) Staff behavior code at GSC and SILUs; (iii) 'Work with families for rehabilitation and reintegration'; and (iii) 'The risks of trafficking and how to identify the girls at risk of trafficking'.

Hence, basically, the project allowed the Youth Workers and the staff of SILUs to obtain all relevant knowledge in respective topics and themes for the efficient work at the GSC and SILUs.

The professional work and approach to the girls-survivors in SILUs further promoted the recognition of the newly established system and the confidence of the target groups in the NSWFA and GSC/SILUs. During the project the parents and relatives of the girls-survivors have been visiting them in these facilities, which have had a multiplier effect in the realization of the need to promote this new approach among the target groups.

Output 1.4: Girls are reintegrated back to their families, communities and the society by support of Youth Workers

The main targets set for the output have been reached.

10 girls have been reintegrated into the society; all the girls have got individual care and education; all girls are able to individually plan and manage for their in-house activities and budgeting.

Out of 10 girls, six girls were reintegrated to their families and 4 girls received residential housing at the colleges and universities they have been admitted, as well as at the workplaces, as a result of the project's efforts.

Some of the project's achievements and success stories related to the family or social reintegration of the girls are remarkable. Those were worth to be aired to the wider public to have wider impact on the society. The following excerpt from the project's documents may give a good insight in such an opportunity.

Quote:⁵

One girl was delighted to receive a place to study at the Pedagogical College in Ayni, Rasht District. With the support of the Committee on Women and Family Affairs and the Department of Education she was given a residential place and can live at the college. To assist the girl to live independently and to provide her with some practical work experience, she found a part-time job working as a secretary/assistant at the Dean's office at the college. This girl who had little hope for the future when she came to GSS, now able to live independently, is studying and working. This is a remarkable achievement for this young woman. Whilst reintegration to the family has not been possible for her, a positive outcome in very difficult circumstances has been achieved and life skills learned that will help her to face the challenges of life to come.

Only one girl [among those, who were admitted to colleges/universities – A.M.] that found a place with a college was not successful in her higher education studies. She successfully completed school but found it challenging to attend college. She decided that she did not wish to pursue her studies and left the college. She has now been reintegrated to and is living with her family. The Youth Workers continue to support her, assisting her to find a job.

End of quote.

To achieve the output, the Youth Workers have been constantly supporting the girls to liaise with their families and, based on the assessment of the risk of return to their families/communities, to casually return to home. This was done carefully, 1-3 times per month accompanied by a Youth Worker. Youth Workers have been organizing 'family conferences' at SILUs or at the families, which significantly helped overcoming stigma and stereotypes by the family and community members to further accept the girls back into their environment.

Two key principles, conducive to the further integration and public perception were maintained: (i) careful assessment of the return and treatment of the girls at home and (ii) often visits by the parents to SILUs. This allowed full understanding by the parents of the new system and approach of GSS. This, in turn, made possible changing the attitudes and resuming responsibility by the parents.

An exemplary case the project faced during the work of the youth workers with families is brought in project's documentation.

Quote:⁶

When this girl came to GSS she had no documents and could not be enrolled in school. The youth workers found the girl's father who needed to assist his daughter to obtain the documents. The father refused to recognise the girl as his daughter and did not want to do anything to help her.

⁵ The project's Annual Progress Report for the year 2011

⁶ The project's Final Report, April 2012

The youth workers started to engage her father in discussions, working to change his attitude towards his daughter and to convince him to help obtain the documents she needed to go to school. They explained how going to school was vital for his daughter and would be a part of the rehabilitation process for her.

The youth workers came to explain that his daughter needed the support not only of SII but also of him and that together they could help her to improve her life. Finally, the father agreed to help to obtain the documents needed.

The Youth Workers then started to discuss the girl going into a college after finishing school as she enjoyed school and studying. The Youth Workers invited her father and mother to a family conference. It was at this meeting that the girl spoke about her interests and dreams. She told her family she wants to be a policewoman.

The Youth Workers tried unsuccessfully to enter her to the Police Academy. A job was found for her however with the security division of the Ministry of Internal Affairs in Khatlon region. She work in Attendant console of security agency of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Tajikistan. The job is part time so that she can also study. When this girl started her job and her studies her father cried, amazed that his daughter's life could have changed so much.

The contact with the family continued and developed. The girl now lives with her family attending college and her job.

End of quote.

All-along the stay in SILUs, the girls have been provided with the services of the psychologist, psychiatrist, lawyer and the nurse.

The project had notable success in finding employment opportunities for the girls. Five girls received employment, mainly, thanks to the specialized courses of the project and collaboration with the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection.

Outcome 2: Increase in assistance to the target group in their local community through the Regional NGO partners

The project has effectively built and developed the regional 'task-force' and 'mechanism' to respond to the needs of the girls-survivors of violence, girls at risk and the girls in general.

This was performed through: the construction and strengthening of networks of core 10 NGO partners in the regions (one NGO per region); effective liaison and establishment of working relationships with and raising awareness of local administrations and related authorities; direct assistance to the girls; and raising awareness of and educating both the girls, community members and professionals.

Such approach has enabled the target group to reach the respective services. The environment in the regions has been improving: in the year 2011 the intensity of applications increased by almost 2.5 times. **Furthermore, five months after its implementation, some NGO partners have been continuing handling violence cases and caring for the affected girls.**

The networking, awareness raising and capacity building activities of the project gave a result in that the all related state bodies in Dushanbe and in regions, educational and health institutions, communities, parents and professionals has seen how the joint efforts and effective networks may work towards reducing violence and strengthening the protection of the girls. The stakeholders have had a chance to witness and raise their confidence in a viability of the new joint approach. They gained capabilities allowing them initiating and undertaking such approach.

The established regional network well-served to three main functions: (i) social assistance and legal assistance; (ii) awareness rising for GSC and NCWFA; (iii) building relationships with local authorities and bodies.

During the field visits the Evaluation consultant has witnessed a situation with the CRC's partner NGO in Hissar District – the Humanitarian Center of Social Protection 'Munis', which still continues treatment of two girls. Meantime, the applications on the violence cases to 'Munis' continue.

Some indicators of achievement of the outcome are as follows.

- The project selected and maintained 10 regional partner NGOs and through them raised awareness of the issues affecting girls in the target regions and the services provided by GSS and its partners
- The project performed an assessment of the staff of the NGOs and 10 lawyers and 10 social workers employed by partner NGOs with the support of the project. A comprehensive series of training sessions

were designed and implemented to build the capacity of the 20 social workers and lawyers and 10 directors of the NGOs and the 2 lawyers working GSC.

- The preventative assistance programs were delivered, which reached more than 3500 girls and directly resulted in an increase of applications and referrals.

- Awareness raising and 14 training sessions were carried out for local authorities and state bodies by the regional NGO partners within their regions.

Output 2.1: Increase in capacity of local partners to deliver assistance to the target groups.

The project achieved the output during its implementation period.

A core team of regional partner NGO staff, lawyers, social workers, local specialists, professionals and representatives of related state bodies were trained, strengthened and engaged in the protection of girls and prevention of violence.

Since 2009 the project has identified and selected 10 regional NGOs in the regions. The NGOs had been selected according to well-elaborated criteria of, with which they complied to, as follows: (i) being specialized in the field and having several years of experience; (ii) having sufficient staff and internal work technologies / procedures; (iii) possessing good working relationships with local authorities, educational, health, law enforcement bodies; (iv) having notable experience in work with the communities, larger public, advocacy and social advertisement.

The project funded a work of a lawyer and a social worker for each partner NGO, to avail services and consultancy to the target groups.

During the 2010 the partner NGOs Directors, staff and volunteers, as well as lawyers and social workers were intensively trained by the project on the following topics:

1. Violence, its types, providing social, legal and psychological assistance to the victims of sexual violence;
2. Social work with children, child protection;
3. Referral mechanisms, identification, needs assessment and referring the girls – survivors;
4. The rights of children, protection;
5. Assistance to the vulnerable groups to prevent trafficking;
6. The critical situations and how the governmental bodies may help;
7. Information on accessible education
8. Contacting the helpline.

The lawyers have been specifically trained in the most important aspects of work with the girls-survivors: interviewing child victims; initiating criminal proceedings; Criminal Procedures Code's and Family Code's issues - alimony, adoption, age of marriage, parental rights, housing, GSS practices, inheriting, etc.

The social workers of the partner NGOs funded by the project, where intensively trained on the whole cycle and techniques of the social work.

During the 2011, the wider stakeholders in the regions – the representatives of regional administrations, local self-governance bodies, health, educational, law enforcement bodies, Child Rights' Departments (CRDs), and the NCWFA's local Committees received trainings and coaching in a number of key aspects of protection of the children's rights and prevention of violence. The topics involved: trafficking; social work; psychological assistance and consultations; inclusive education; reintegration; drug awareness. In total, around 100 people participated in these capacity building events.

The trainings were based on the preliminary assessment of the needs for improvement of knowledge of the partners and stakeholders. Those varied in content and time-coverage from region to region. Nevertheless, the trainings helped to bring the level of knowledge of the stakeholders to a level allowing effective undertaking in their respective regions.

Output 2.2: Increase utilization of social services by the target group and their families through local community NGOs

The Output has been reached. As a result of the above capacity building and coaching activities:

- 1) As per the project's statistics, over 500 girls and families were assisted for violence cases by the partner NGOs and professional staff of both the project and state bodies;
- 2) Outreach activities and preventive measures have been implemented by the partner NGOs, which allowed thousands of girls to receive training on trafficking, sexual health & HIV/AIDS, life skills, child rights, violence and exploitation. The outreach activities also contributed to the knowledge on GSC, SILUs, referral system and current practices.

The above project's statistics, however, did not take into account the final results by the NGO partners. Thus, during the field visits, it was possible to reveal that only the partner in Hissar district - NGO Munis has directly supported 487 girls-survivors and girls at risk. Of these girls 80% returned to families, 130 were referred from state bodies. Some types of issues and number of girls were as follows: 34 – sexual abuse, 84 – did not have documents, 91 – returned to school, and 20 - were prevented from trafficking.

The NGO Munis informed about two smugglers in the community, where Munis is located. Munis managed to prevent an attempt for trafficking of a 13-years old girl. However, the traffickers are still not 'bothered' neither by law enforcement bodies nor by other state and public institutions.

Taking this into account, it would be reasonable for the CRC to once again visit the activity reports of the NGOs to refine the project's statistics, particularly, in part of the girls-survivors supported through the NGO network.

Output 2.3: Increase in utilization of free legal consultations, advice and representation to girls in the target group.

The output has been by and large reached. The realization of indicators, some statistics on support to the girls-survivors and the girls at risk by the project's central facilities, NCWFA and GSC, by the end of the project have been as follows:

- 64 girls have received documents important for their mobility and ability to participate in various aspects of social life, such as passports and birth certificates;
- 12 lawyers have received training in child rights, protection and juvenile justice;
- Through the helpline 98 girls have been referred to the partner organizations (12) and Girls Support Centre (76);
- 500 girls in the schools received legal advice through a dedicated campaign;
- 21 girls have been represented at the court and in engaging with other government agencies;
- 191 girls have received legal services, and for 31 out of them cases were filed at the courts;
- The number of court cases in regions increased drastically: around 4 times in the second half of 2011 as compared to the first half of the year.

These achievements and, especially, the court cases, notably contributed to the awareness of the population and girls on the way of action in case of violation of their rights and abuse.

The project's helpline worked since mid 2009 and proved to be an effective mechanism for the support to the target group.

Project performed some advertisement for the helpline. The helpline received 2831 calls (in average 4 calls a day), of which identified 200 girls-survivors of violence. The project team compiled a detailed register of data, classified types of calls and requests.

The helpline service allowed reaching two important results:

- The girls, who were identified as victims received immediate attention by the specialists and lawyers, wherever their intervention has been deemed urgent;
- The girls who were not identified as victims, but needed specialist support, received psychological assistance.

In many cases the helpline expert has been availing support to the girls through liaison, psychological assistance, and self-reflection - as long as needed for the girl to overcome the problems and for the situation to be resolved.

Outcome 3: Effective Referral Networks identifies and refers girls throughout the country in 10 Districts in Tajikistan

The project has been enough successful for the establishment of the referral network in the country. It has been successful in transferring proper understanding and skills, establishment of basic practices of coordination and collaboration between the related state bodies, enhancing the role of the NCWFA in this network.

In the meantime, the officialized and capable referral network will be pending further and stronger budgetary and organizational support to the state bodies coordinating the new referral system.

The established network of regional partner NGOs allowed further work and close coordination with the regional administrations, local self-governance bodies, regional Children's Rights' Departments, Committees on Women and Family Affairs, local law enforcement bodies and educational departments. Hence, basically, the networks in the regions were established well-enough. This allowed timely and coordinated support to the girls (see above – Outcome 2).

It is worth noting that the referral network, while currently lacking sufficient budgetary and expertise support, works enough efficiently thanks also to the human factors, widely respected in the country's culture. The involved state bodies and NGOs, based on their good understanding of the issue and mutual respect intensively support each-other in resolving cases of violence. They provide to each-other also general specialist and organizational support.

Output 3.1: Referral bodies (child protection, law enforcement, educational and health institutions) are able to identify and refer girls of the target group to GSS through the establishment of referral networks in each target district.

The output was by and large achieved during the implantation of the project. The referral network of regional NGOs and the related local bodies were established in the 10 target districts. Each partner NGO has strengthened the ties with the local child protection and law enforcement bodies through Memoranda of Cooperation. This was further facilitated by meetings, coaching and joint work towards prevention and handling of violence, which entailed trustful and effective environment. Through this day-to-day work and official trainings the related local bodies were made knowledgeable on both the referral procedures and the services of the GSS.

Further, Memoranda of Understanding were signed with the central government bodies – the ministries, which allowed reinforcement of the referral procedures and established practices. This worked resulted on referrals by the partner NGOs, local Child Rights Departments, Temporary Isolation Centre and prosecutor's office.

The project's contributions and actions towards this output have been as follows.

The project delivered a **7 series of training sessions to around 230 professionals** of the health institutions, national security service, police, prosecutors, Committees of NCWFA, CRDs on: contraception methods; hygiene / healthy lifestyle; HIV and prevention; healthy food; first aid; child protection policy and methods; GSS with protection and referral system.

The **MOU** with the National Committee of Child Rights was signed in 2009, so as to allow effective engagement and coordination by the NCWFA. The **MoUs** were signed with the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Labour and Social Protection on the subject of support to GSS in finding proper educational programs and further employment for the girls. It became difficult to sign an MoU with the Ministry of Internal Affairs. Nevertheless, the cooperation was established and closely ongoing with all its divisions in Dushanbe and regions. Notably, the Ministry of Internal Affairs supported information dissemination and public awareness on the established system of support to the girls. E.g. the Deputy Head of the Department of Civil Rights provided lectures in the Police Academy. After the training a number of requests were received for consultancy over the girls or families they thought to be vulnerable to the project's helpline. The Ministry of Internal Affairs have also actively participated in the trainings delivered by the GSS.

The **MOUs** were also signed with the respective local bodies: CRDs (including its members - Commissions of Minors, Education and Health Departments) and Committees of NCWFA.

Output 3.2: Capacity of referral bodies is enhanced to identify and assess girls that are at risk or who have been sexually abused, trafficked or exploited.

The output has been reached. The project properly identified the training capacity needs of the local bodies through the established network of NGOs, designed a comprehensive plan for capacity building and delivered trainings. This gave immediate results: referrals to the GSS (see also above – Outcome 2); according to the information received by CRC, no girls were referred to closed detention centers during the third year of implementation of the project.

The project supported the referral bodies through adapted approach to their two main groups: the partner NGOs and the local bodies. For the NGOs the project had deployed a special 'Satellite Support Service' – a group of experts, which have been in charge of identifying the needs, training, coaching and counseling the NGOs and their specialists.

For the local bodies, the project deployed the partner NGOs and the Policy Development Team. They assessed the capacity building needs of the local bodies, drafted and delivered dedicated trainings.

In addition to the representatives of the local bodies trained by the project (see above – Output 2.1), the project built the capacity of around 230 professionals of the central law enforcement bodies, prosecution, health workers, other related experts and professionals.

Output 3.3 Five professional guides for the staff at the Girls' Support Centre are produced and used

The output has been attained. The five professional guides were developed by the project, as follows:

1. Sexual Health
2. Effects of Abuse and its Care
3. Reintegration of Abused Victims into Communities
4. Legal Aspects of Abuse and Rights of the Abused
5. Practical Guide for Lawyers

As compared with the original plan, instead of hiring new experts the project utilized own resources. The partner NGOs professional staff, project' staff and an international expert devoted time and efforts to develop the guides, which saved significant resources. This was also a notable value added, as the project's team and NGOs had a chance to apply their knowledge and experience gained through the project.

Besides being disseminated centrally, the guides were dispatched to the NGOs for dissemination during extension period of the project and have been disseminated by them among local bodies.

Outcome 4: The National Committee on Women and Family Affairs (NCWFA) is the lead state agency actively promoting the rights of the girls in Tajikistan.

The project succeeded to permanently involve and raise the interest of national stakeholders in establishment and upgrading the child protection system through the development of the NCWFA and capacity building for all other related state bodies.

The progress within the component was evident. The Policy Development Team (PDT), incorporated into the structure of the NCWFA, managed to substantially develop its capacities and advance the efficiency.

The PDT had only two experts, a lawyer and a policy expert. Nevertheless, thanks to their high level professionalism and efforts the NCWFA did considerable improvements in 4 main clusters of its activities, where the main results achieved were:

Internal organization, work procedures and supervision

- 1) Working technologies of GSC, procedures, review and admission processes
- 2) Administrative set-up for decision making over the cases
- 3) Institutional memory and filing system for the girls and cases
- 4) Budgeting and mid-term perspective

Coordination of and with relevant state bodies and regional referral network

- 5) Working Group on legislation and supervision
- 6) At central level: a coordination framework with the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Labor and Social Protection, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Prosecutor's Office, Statistics Service
- 7) At Regional Level: coordination framework with Child Rights Departments, Internal Affairs Departments, Municipalities, facilitated through the network of partner NGOs and local governance bodies and councils
- 8) Good recognition, acceptance and culture of liaison

Supervision, monitoring systems

- 9) Complaints system: forms, procedures
- 10) Practices for Checks and follow-ups
- 11) System and formats for classification of the violence cases used for statistics

Coordinated work on policy and regulatory work

- 12) Comments to the Law on Parental Responsibility (adopted in August 2011)
- 13) Amendments to the draft Law on Domestic Violence (pending)
- 14) Policy paper was prepared, however, pending for approval: it was sent to a number of international organizations which work towards eliminating violence; the comments were received and incorporated. Currently, the NCWFA needs additional technical assistance to finalize and send the paper for approval.

As a result of project's efforts the NCWFA has been notably strengthened. Actually, currently it leads the established system of referrals and follow-ups on the continuity and quality of the practices of protection of girls in all 10 regions in the country.

The NCWFA has been engaged in the first round of planning for the state funded budget, which has been approved to support the basic activity of the GSS and SILUs. It did not include the provision of security/guards, transportation costs, and the costs of operation of NGOs in the regions. Currently, these expenditures are being considered for funding by the US Embassy in Tajikistan and UNICEF.

The NCFA coordinates well both with the regional networks and central authorities, particularly, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Social and Labour Protection. It coordinates also its activities with the other Ministries in charge of issues related to the protection of the rights of and support to the girls.

Meantime, however, it is noted that the NCWFA still does not possess sufficient budget and means to manage the system as closely, as it was done during the project, while the latter was supporting the NCWFA.

Output 4.1: NCWFA is able to establish and fully manage the Girls' Support Centre

The output has been achieved since the early stage of the project in 2009. The PDT supported the transfer of the GSC to the NCWFA, which had notable impact on the strength and consolidation of the service for the girls. It also allowed closer coordination and supervision of the violence cases and the further treatment of the girls.

The NCWFA has been closely involved in the establishment of the Girls Support Centre / SILUs.

The project's Policy Development Team, consisted of two highly skilled experts, has been deployed to the NCWFA to, among other important capacity building measures (see below), support it with planning for and negotiating annual budgets for the GSC/SILUs.

The NCWFA deploys appropriate monitoring and evaluation process through its networks and has established a mechanism for processing statistics. The NCWFA has established a Working Group of related Ministries and cooperation well with them.

A notable achievement has been the review of the regulations of the special school, whereby girls are no longer referred there, and, instead, they are referred to the GSS.

Overall, the capacities and the coordination framework of the NCWFA has been well-strengthened. Meantime, it is noted that the NCWFA still needs further support for the three of its further core

competencies: advocacy, awareness raising and educating the public, and the policy-legal development measures.

The main activities and efforts put by the project to achieve the output have been as follows:

- 1) The Policy Development Team of the project was established and well embedded into the NCWFA to support it with policy advice, regulatory advice, coordination framework, methodological work, capacity building, as well as proper awareness on NCWFA and the referral system.
- 2) The PDT assisted the NCWFA to establish Working Group consisted of the main state bodies – central authorities related to the issues concerning the girls and their protection. These were: Ministry of Education, Ministry of Culture, Ministry of Economy and Trade, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Health, Prosecutor's Office and the Agency of Statistics. The respective Memoranda of Understanding were concluded with the main part of these Ministries allowing close interaction, coordination both at the central and regional levels. One of the functions of the Working Group was to study, make recommendations and amendments to legislation on violence and trafficking.
- 3) The GSC building has been transferred to the NCWFA from the National University. The GSC has been registered and accredited by the state. It has been renovated and equipped to serve the needs of the girls and to be able to provide for remedial educational programs, for which curricula has been properly developed and implemented.
- 4) The PDT worked with NCWFA staff continuously and has been coaching them to fully apprehend the methodologies and techniques of day-to-day management of the GSC and for understanding and addressing the needs of the girls better.
- 5) The PDT assisted the Partner for the review of the regulations for liaising with the public, reporting. The PDT has sufficiently supported the NCWFA to establish a full system of handling and processing of the cases related to the girls-survivors of violence and, generally, the vulnerable girls at risk. This included techniques on identification, assessment, handling applications and complaints, monitoring of the decisions of the NCWFA and fulfillment of obligations of the partners.
- 6) Based on the training needs analysis, the PDT launched a comprehensive program of capacity building for the NCWFA and the GSC. This included trainings and coaching on the mechanisms of work of the GSC, the mechanism of referring girls to the GSC and SILUs, identification of the target groups of girls and their treatment technologies. Resulting from these trainings, the NCWFA has purchased and procured personal computers to its member and provided them with internet connection.
- 7) The PDT has supported the NCWFA in its budgetary planning and negotiating it with the Ministry of Finance and the Government. The main purpose has been ensuring that the NCWFA would be able to smoothly operate and manage the GSC. The team worked with the Head of Department of Social Budget within the Ministry for Finance to negotiate the budget. The work was successful and the Ministry of Finance has approved annual budgets for basic maintenance of the GSC/SILUs since 2010. One important aspect contributing to this had been the involvement of the Ministry of Finance since the formation of the Working Group. The Committee has employed an accountant to assist the Committee-appointed Director of the Centre with the management of the budget.
- 8) The project also assisted the NCWFA to improve its internal financial management: an accountant's position was opened and the PDT worked with the accountant to ensure proper planning and execution of the budget.
- 9) The project supported the establishment of the monitoring and evaluation practices by the NCWFA. The monitoring and evaluation has been the part of the signed Memoranda and the NCWFA, after the sufficient capacity building by the PDT, has been in a position to engage into monitoring and evaluation activities.
- 10) The PDT assisted the NCWFA to develop policies and forms for the girls-survivors of violence, based on the accumulated experience and established practices during the project. PDT and NCWFA reviewed and recommended changes to the proposed law on the Parental Responsibilities, as well as worked with the Government to amend and pass the draft law on Domestic Violence (see Impact).

Output 4.2: The human resource management of the NCWFA is enhanced.

The output was sufficiently achieved. The project assisted the NCWFA to establish clear and complete procedures, methodology and practices for staff needs identification, structuring, hiring, internal training, appraisal and development.

The key milestones here were the job descriptions, qualifications and the skill-building framework developed at the NCWFA. This allowed also close monitoring and fulfilling the gaps as identified per competence area. Overall, the staffing and further human resource management policies have been sufficiently developed and established as effective practices. However, again, here also the NCWFA needs stronger budgetary support to be able to maintain and develop highly skilled specialists.

Output 4.3: NCWFA has an improved process for dealing with complaints and representations

The output has been sufficiently reached. The information system and full technology is established for handling complaints by the public, NGOs and the state bodies both in regions and in Dushanbe.

Based on the initial assessment, the procedures were established allowing: easy access to NCWFA whether in regions or centrally; objective, open and direct application at the NCWFA or its regional Committees, steady handling of the application with clear follow-up procedures and reporting on the progress and decisions; maintaining full institutional memory; complying with the principles of confidentiality.

A specific day for the citizen's complaints has been appointed on Saturday, so as allow people attend NCWFA upon weekend, when they may have more time.

After the project's finalization, it has been noticed that the NCWFA and referral bodies in the regions did not sufficiently respond to several cases of violence. This was explained by the lack of lawyer at the Child Right's Departments and transportation means to reach the areas where cases were detected and to file necessary documents to commence the referral process and the process of examination of the case.

Output 4.4: NCWFA is able to engage in advocacy, policy development, coordination and programme implementation

As a result of the joint efforts of the PDT and the NCWFA, the latter currently has enough strong perception and recognition among the national and regional authorities and state bodies. This in coup with the established institutional structures allows NCWFA to engage in its advocacy and coordination functions. The institutional structure where the NCWFA is situated allows inter-agency coordination and effective process of protection of girls. In the main the key elements of structure are: the NCWFA's pace with the National Commission on Child Rights and the Admission Panel for the girls; the GSC's participation in the NCWFA; the signed Memoranda with central and regional state bodies and established practices of communication and information management; the NCWFA's access to overarching structures and national authorities – the parliament and the government.

While the NCWA engages in the advocacy through this network and institutional structures, it would be desirable that it has also resources for wider campaigns in future for wider liaison with public, educational and health institutions, cultural and religious structures.

The NCWFA is engaged in policy and legislation development. According to its role and mandate it is in a position to screen and observe the process of law-making and policy improvements in the target field. The project's experience allowed NCWFA to sufficiently practice this jointly with partner authorities and organizations. However, at the same time, the NCWFA has not been in apposition to incorporate and fund the Policy Development Team. It also needs strengthening the policy making resources and capabilities – specialists and methodologies. The Strategy of NCWFA remained in a draft state upon finalization of the project and, thereafter, was not finalized to date.

During the project the PDT has further made recommendations for future development of the NCWFA's structure. The issue will be pending for stronger financing of the NCWFA in nearby years.

Output 4.5: The level of the public's awareness is raised by NCWFA on gender issues, child rights, protection of girls from sexual abuse, trafficking or exploitation.

The project supported elaboration of the Policy Paper on the protection of the interests and rights of girls in the target groups. The Policy Paper has been principally agreed with the NCWFA; however, it is still pending for further official approval by the Government, which will give enhanced opportunities to the NCWFA in its area of operation and for further improvement of the whole system.

The NCWFA jointly with the GSC and with the support of the project has prepared and disseminated publications and promotional materials on the subjects of intervention.

Around 1500 posters, 1100 GSC referral leaflets, were distributed in Dushanbe and regions. The awareness raising campaign included eight newspaper advertisements, sixteen television commercials on the local channel Bahoristan and six radio slots. One of the numerous results of these actions has been the increased number of calls to the project's helpline.

In addition to the awareness campaigns and trainings in in regions by NGOs and project's staff, the project delivered an awareness raising campaign to 500 girls in the schools in Dushanbe.

A complimentary nation-wide campaign was conducted in the end of the project on the related issues of drug demand reduction, which is closely related to the issues of sexual abuse and exploitation. The director, social worker and lawyer of each partner NGO participated in a ToT on this topic. The aim was to deliver training and consultations to 500 community leaders and 5000 children on how to reduce the demand for drugs in their communities and increase the awareness of youth on the drug risk.

Seminars have been delivered extensively around Tajikistan to promote gender issues, child protection and promote the NCWFA and the GSC.

Efficiency of implementation:

Although, the evaluation mission has got only the Annual Work Plan for the year 2009, the general flow of activities and achieved results allow stating that by and large the activities have been implemented timely. It should be noted, however, that frequent changes of the Team Leaders, International Experts affected some of the activities (related to monitoring and the Policy Development Team, policy and legal consultancy to NCWFA), and made few of those late: e.g. the Strategy (called Policy Paper in the project's reports) of NCWFA has been elaborated, but adoption is pending for further possible support by a lawyer of the PDT, funding for which is currently negotiated between the CRC and US Embassy, UNICEF.

The efficiency of the International Experts could have been improved. E.g. it could be expected that they could support the NCWFA, National Commission for Child Rights and the government in a whole to:

- 1) systematically address the observations of the several International Organizations as to the key needs for improvement of national policy and legal framework in support to the protection of the Human Rights of children and women;
- 2) bring in the best practices and experience of worldwide developed systems: particularly, for establishing fully-fledged regional systems of protection; for establishing practices of involvement of the civil society and the network of NGOs in the protection policies.

It is also noted that the quality of reporting could be significantly improved in terms of consistency, completeness and consolidated statistics on the services and results availed by the project. Practically, none of the project's technical documentation – analysis, mission reports, reports of the regional partner NGOs were attached to the reports. The data on the types of assistance to the girls has not been consolidated and introduced in a structures way.

The local team has put significant efforts to achieve the planned results. The provided direct assistance, trainings, capacity building, awareness raising and advocacy by the local experts brought to quality results, thus, also raising confidence in CRC as of a reliable partner at the counterparts.

Sufficiency of resources:

The project's resources have been by and large sufficient for the implementation of the planned tasks. Two key observations here are as follows:

- 1) The time allocated to the project was not sufficient for fully addressing the policy, budgetary and self-sustainable regional referral network. The first year of the project was devoted to the introduction of the project's approaches, networking and consolidation of the central authorities. The second year was an exercising over the first field activities and working the GSC and SILUs. The third year only saw the results of these activities and the services were developed to a sufficient extent.

During the past three years, the counterparts have been adapting and learning, so as to finally reach the level of practice that is efficient to address the needs of the girls. The further policy and institutional changes were to base on these learned lessons and accumulated experience. The received results should have served for lobbying and advocating for sufficient policy, regulatory and budgetary support by the Government.

Hence, this dynamics suggests that there was a need to divide the whole intervention into two consecutive parts: induction and institutional development. While the induction phase took around three years, the institutional phase, which might need significantly smaller funding (estimated at USD 100,000 – 120,000), could have been foreseen for development of policies, institutional structures and budgetary frameworks.

- 2) The current project could have foreseen a small reserve for the continued activities in most important services – essential for the existence of the system: supporting NCWFA for adoption of its Strategy, supporting legal and transportation costs for the regional referral network, and some operational costs at the SILUs, until sufficient state funding would be available. As such, whether somewhat more budget or savings in some of the budget lines (operations, field monitoring, project monitoring and evaluation) could have been foreseen.

The project's resources can be summarized as the following table (following the structure of the three-year budget).

The overall budget has been distributed progressively through the three years of implementation, which was logical, as the project's activities revealed a growing tendency from a year to a year. The main part of financial resources (over 90%) was allocated so as to support the main activities of the project per

components and was directed to the services and products for the beneficiaries. Only the small part of the budget was devoted to the monitoring, evaluation and audit (around 10%). It is to be recalled that the monitoring was mainly introduced as a quality control over the services and products and to provide for the baseline survey, further data collection and reporting, to refine the activities as per the situation and get better picture of the intervention's effects and impacts. The reporting on the monitoring activities could have been, however, improved.

General Category of Expenditures	Total Cost - USD	%
Personnel ⁷ , including the hired consultants and CRC core staff (20%)	139,150.16	28%
Equipment for Project Team, CRC, PDT, including communication costs	16,216.40	3%
Publications and documentation	10,275.00	2%
Travel, for Project Team, girls at SILUs, regional monitoring, social workers' trainings in regions, transportation of girls, Lawyers to regions	90,038.18	18%
Contractual Services, including the work of the lawyers and social workers in regions, security of SILUs and preventive outreach actions	92,987.40	19%
Other: mainly the operational costs of SILUs	100,822.94	20%
Monitoring, including the baseline report, monitoring methodological materials, data, etc	21,326.04	4%
Evaluation, including translation	18,680.00	4%
Audit	10,001.88	2%
Total	499,498.00	

The project resembled a highly skilled team of both the local experts and consultants. The expertise was involved and deployed timely and efficiently. The efficiency of the Team Leaders could have been improved in terms of stability and international expertise on system-building activities, including the techniques for involvement of the civil society actors into the newly established protection system.

The project's final audit carried out during May 2012 revealed high level of compliance to the required standards of financial management and reporting, adequate and efficient usage of resources, timely implementation of the planned budget and transparent administration of procurement activities.

Planning and re-design

The evaluation mission received only the first Annual Work Plan. Nevertheless, based on the observation of further reports and interviews, it is assumed that the planning has been rational and was executed smoothly.

The first-year Annual Wok Plan was compiled properly, with specification of indicators per outcomes, outputs and supported with component budgets.

Activities and outputs

The project's activities have been results-oriented and availed quality outputs. The project managed to reach the four main groups of outputs per its components.

Overall, the project's activities and benefits reached more than 10,000 beneficiaries and covered the whole country.

⁷ Including the fee of the Project Manager, the International Expert – 5% of the total budget, and the fee for social trainer – USD 140.

Hence, it can be concluded that the project's activities have been well-organized, purposeful and contributed well to the achievement of quality service and products for its beneficiaries.

The project's services and products are assessed highly by their recipients. The beneficiaries, who were interviewed or availed their feedback before the evaluation mission - point to several advantages in this regard:

- 1) The project's activities were purposeful, aimed at satisfaction of the counterparts' diverse needs: those were planned in a way to provide sufficient coverage to the raising issues;
- 2) The project's products were delivered in a way easing their usage and allowing their long-time utilization and maintenance;
- 3) The project's expertise has been of high quality, often competing and over-passing that of the professional centers and state bodies;
- 4) The project has been rounding-up and finalizing well each undertaken initiative.

Hence, we can state that the Implementer has put every effort to make its deliverables of good quality and used by the beneficiaries.

The project has deployed a sufficient approach for **internal monitoring and control** both over the budget and the activities.

It is, however, noted that the project could follow-up better on the establishment of analytical database and statistics over the intervention.

Operational risk management

The project together with its counterparts has elaborated and implemented a risk-scaled approach. It took into account the institutional, cultural-religious, behavioral limitations of the continuum of the beneficiaries. Particularly, the project succeeded in step-by-step improvement of the role and capacities of NCWFA, so as not to create inter-institutional competition and resistance. The social, cultural and religious patterns in the regions have been carefully considered and taken on board for the approach to the identification of problems and their solution. All these made the intervention acceptable and successful in rather diverse and complicated environment.

Prospects for Sustainability:

The project's assets and their statuses:

The analysis of the project's sustainability basically relies on the recognition and classification of the long-term assets created during its three-year time of implementation. The main assets contributed by the project and their characteristics are as follows:

- 1) The upgraded state system of the protection of girls-victims and girls at risk;
- 2) The referral network in all the 10 regions of the country;
- 3) The national programming, legal and regulatory basis;
- 4) The pool of knowledgeable professionals and state bodies;
- 5) The established work technologies with the girls;
- 6) The general forum of supporters of the intervention.

The project significantly contributed to the above-mentioned systems, frameworks, target groups and technologies. It can be stated those are generally sustainable.

However, the obvious shortage of state funding of the new system and its main role-players main reduce the strength and capacity of the system in a whole.

The upgraded state system of the protection of girls-victims and girls at risk

The NCWFA and its central state partners, GSC, SILUs, regional NGO partners and CRDs, other regional governance, educational, law enforcement bodies constitute a quite a stable and coordinated system aimed at the protection of the rights of the girls.

This network of state institutions has accumulated sufficient experience, knowledge to practice the efficient work of the whole system.

Thanks to the project's efforts the government, represented by the Ministry of Finance has availed budget for the core operation of the GSC and SILUs. The funding is foreseen to be continued through the annual budgets ad covers the main maintenance and operational expenditures.

However, still, state funding does not fully cover the several key functions, services and professional staff, which the project has been availing to the partners during its implementation. This makes some of the key partners much less-efficient. The partner institutions currently lack resources for sufficient performance. Particularly, this regards to the lawyers at the NCWFA, consultants-social workers and psychologists at the GSC, lawyers at NGOs, means for outreach work in regions, educational materials, transportation, food and clothes at the SILUs, means for operating the helpline effectively.

In addition, the NCWFA lacks resources to retain the professional staff of the Policy Development Team supported previously by the project. This makes the NCWFA inactive towards further development and advocacy for the improvement of policy and legal framework for the target field.

There are, nevertheless, some positive developments. E.g. the salaries of civil servants will be increased for 30% since September this year; some former staff of the NCWFA, engaged during the project's implementation, returned to their job after the project.

The referral network in all the 10 regions of the country

The trained NGOs constitute a relatively sustainable result of the intervention. Majority of NGOs are able to sustain and further apply the knowledge and experience got through the project. Some of them are enough capable.

For example, the NGO Munis in Hissar District has rather strong technical and professional capacities (specialists, medical college, and sewing workshop). The NGO is also active in fundraising and runs several projects funded by the European Union and other donors.

Through the projects the NGOs has got two basic and long-lasting assets in the target area: (i) high respect and close coordination network with local state bodies and communities; (ii) full working technologies for handling the cases of violence.

Meantime, the termination of the project's support for hiring social workers and a lawyer affected the capabilities of NGOs for outreach work, monitoring, identification and initiation of processes to handle and refer the girls-survivors.

In addition, the NGOs note a lack of profiled specialists in the regions. This particularly refers to the psychologists, advocates, social workers, care specialists.

This situation may affect the results achieved by the project. While the applications from the community members in the regions continue, the CRDs, NGOs and the NCWFA are not able to fully and timely respond and handle the violence cases. Currently, the CRDs are not enough strong in terms of resources to perform legal expertise, legal-procedural work in full and legal protection.

The NCWFA needs NGO network further, as those have been the main capable agents to work the system in the regions. However, for this there is a need in funding the outreach, public awareness, training activities of the NGOs, as well as the work of the profiled specialists.

An establishment of an 'association' of regional partner NGOs can be seen as a solution to provide the NCWFA with a strong and viable partner to act in the regions. Such association may act more efficiently in terms of fund-raising and applying for the state assistance.

The national programming, legal and regulatory basis

The project has sufficiently contributed to the initial stage of development of the girls' protection-oriented legislation. These included the Governmental Decree on the coordination framework by the NCWFA, the decree on removal of practices of placing girls at special school, adopted Law on Parental Responsibilities, comments on the draft Law on Domestic Violence, changes in the Family Code and Criminal Code on the marriage age of the girls, raising the schooling age for the girls, as well as draft Strategy on the protection of girls of the NCWFA.

These initiatives and achievements create a good ground for advocating further sufficient support to the system, both politically and financially.

However, the NCWFA still needs to finalize and lobby for the adoption of its Strategy, which may pave the way for further improvements in the target area.

The Strategy needs to specifically include the further principles of funding of the system. In terms of planning for such a complex system as the current referral network is, there is a need to foresee mid-term, 3-5 years, budgeting approach, which can be adjusted on the annual basis. Inclusion of the budgetary planning framework in the Strategy will ease NCWFA's way to receive state funding.

The Strategy of NCWFA also needs to provide for sufficient ground for further work towards amending and fulfilling the legal-regulatory framework of the protection system. It will need to list, authorize and assign the NCWFA and its partners to amend and fulfill several legal acts to provide for more responsibilities by the parents, educational and social institutions, regional administration, municipality halls, regional departments of state bodies in regard to monitoring the situation of the girls, identifying the cases of violence, referring the girls, undertaking steps to raise awareness of population, identifying and referring the aggressors, exchanging information and communicating with each-other.

Two peculiar aspects of cultural life of the country need to be considered carefully. It is obvious that in the country's society the cultural-religious aspects have strong influence. It can not be expected that these aspects, related to the cultural and behavioral patterns of the female part of the population, can be put aside, at least, in the relatively short period of time. Hence, the introduction of girls and women-centered legislation needs to be done carefully, step-by-step. This process should not be a frontal and straightforward. While, the steps to protect the Human Rights of women and girls may be introduced in full, some indirect aspects related to the everyday life and activity of women and girls can be introduced later. This, particularly, regards the clothing, communicating in private areas, behaving in public, etc.

There is a need for further lobbying and adoption of the domestic violence legislation, taking into account national cultural and religious specificities; particularly, the domestic violence legislation has to 'compromise' some aspects of cultural life (clothing, behaving, communication), which do not bring to the essential limitations of the rights of the persons (women and girls) as regards education, employment, usual social relationships and life activity;

The final Strategy of NCWFA needs to foresee and plan for strengthening both the legislation and institutions in part of the law enforcement bodies. A work will needed to be done towards providing for more legal-institutional strength of police, prosecution and other law enforcement bodies in regard to both functionality and responsibility for interdiction the violence againsts girls and children in general.

The Strategy will need also to clearly stipulate steps to provide for more involvement of the civil society organizations into the target area.

The pool of knowledgeable professionals and state bodies

The more than 400 professionals – civil servants, representatives of central and regional state bodies, municipalities, social and health workers, policemen, lawyers, prosecutors and other specialists have been supported, trained by the project.

These professionals constitute a long-lasting and relatively stable forum of supporters, who may further support any similar initiatives in the regions and in Dushanbe.

Nevertheless, they will need further trainings, capacity building, methodological support, motivation and incentives to keep an active profile in the area of protection of girls. To great extent, this can be addressed through the capacities of the NCWFA and in collaboration with its main central partners – authorities supervising the above-mentioned professionals.

The NCWFA, in collaboration with its partner, will need to elaborate dedicated approach for ongoing capacity building for the professionals of its partner institutions in regions and in Dushanbe. Most probably, this can be realized through its Strategy.

The established work practices

The implementation of the project allowed elaboration and practicing of methodologies for the whole cycle of work with the girls-survivors, including their identification, handling through the helpline and directly in the communities, psychological work, social support, training, capacity development and, finally - re-integration into society and empowerment.

The methodologies were also supported by the manuals for the GSC/SILUs. A notable contribution was the work with the local CRDs, educational and health institutions, as well as law enforcement bodies, which allowed further refining the methodologies and accumulating experience.

The work done through the project allowed all its partners learning and reaching the understanding for the best practices in the field. However, this understanding needs proper institutional support. The standing of the NCWFA, the regulatory framework and the regional referral network need further strengthening to make the stakeholders and decision-makers to continuously follow the best practices and lessons learned.

The general forum of supporters of the intervention

The project has directly contributed to the awareness and understanding of around 4000 girls and boys, parents, teachers, community leaders and members, as well as diverse professionals.

These groups of beneficiaries have had a chance to witness a quality shift in the societal development – attitudinal and mindset change towards the girls-survivors of violence. It is assumed that these groups may form a relatively stable forum of supporters to the intervention and the reforms for the improvement of the state systems of protection of girls.

Hence, they can be seen as a support platform for the NCWFA's further steps towards improving the system and towards raising the awareness of the population and target groups on its policies and approaches in the target field.

Assessment of the standard criteria for sustainability

The sustainability prospects as per **economic viability and financial strength** of the stakeholders are still weak. Although the state funds are allocated for the basic funding of the GSC and SILUs, the further funding of proactive policy-making, legal-regulatory improvements, coordination, maintaining and motivating the regional referral network, outreach and direct interdiction of violence, capacity building for state bodies and general awareness raising is still not the part of the state budget.

The NCWFA is in a position to advocate and step-by-step acquire funds for these important aspects of further work and improvement of the protection system. However, it will need time. Hence, there is a need for 'bridging' the funding, before any viable steps by the government are undertaken.

Currently CRC negotiates with UNICEF and US Embassy the funding of the NWCFA, GSC, SILUs and regional NGOs for the part missing in governmental funding. Specifically, this funding will cover some legal expertise for NCWFA, the work of the consultant-social worker, activities of NGOs. It is expected that this funding will last for a year, until the further financing needs will be considered for financing through the state budget.

The **ownership** over the intervention is quite strong at the NCWFA, its main partners at central government, at the regional partner NGOs, as well as at the target groups. Still, the ownership is not sufficiently developed at the societal groups, which may bring their contribution to the improvement of the protection system. These may be the corporate businesses, youth, journalists, volunteering specialists – lawyers, doctors, psychologists, social workers, as well as nation-wide Human Rights' protection NGOs.

A dedicated work – awareness raising activities, round tables, appeals, are needed for calling the attention of these potential contributors. Most probably, this can be done jointly by the CRC and the NCWFA with the possible support of the donor community.

The **political support** for the project's results and effects is rather strong. Although the Law on Religion has been seen 'a step backwards' by the international organizations monitoring violence in the country, it can be stated that this intervention received a proper support and attention by the government and society.

The **institutional capacities** are still at the early stage of development. While the NCWFA is able to by and large manage the central authorities and the regional networks, both the funding and organization needs further development. There is a need to improve the NCWFA's standing, strength and authorities for direct engagement into the functional coordination and management of the partner institutions and their regional branches. It needs also a stable budget for full-scale operations in the regions.

The NCWFA currently lacks two main organizational clusters for further effective work: a policy and legal-regulatory unit for advocacy and specialized unit for sufficient analysis and monitoring.

Impact: Longer-term effects of the project:

The project has had a notable impact already during its implementation, particularly on the current legislation, institutions, referral network, public and professional awareness.

Due to lack of consolidated macro-statistics and consolidated project's statistics, it is, often, difficult to measure the impact quantitatively, as regards the continuum of the target groups supported by the project. Hence, frequently, quantitative assessment is used to assess the project's longer-term effects on its target groups.

New practices and technologies of handling violence against girls:

The project has succeeded in the establishment of a completely new approach and basic system to protect the rights of the girls, to handle the violence cases and to promote an environment towards these goals in the country.

The work of the project on GSC and SILUs made possible the first experience with girls' rehabilitation, treatment, education and reintegration into the society. This served as a full exercising of the good practices and technologies for the complete treatment of the girls in difficult situation.

The lessons learned through the project are, to some extent, unique in terms of attaining applicable and workable experience and mechanisms to support further construction of a fully-fledged system of children's protection in the country.

Institutional improvements:

The project assisted the 'activation' and efficient work of the formerly passive state structures both in regions and in Dushanbe. While somehow established before the project, the partner institutions lacked experience and methodologies of work. Thanks to the intervention, they obtained sufficient expertise and experience, as well as procedures and regulations on how to deal with their tasks in a coordinated manner.

The intervention has been perceived and supported well. Since the early stage of implementation of the project, thanks to the joint efforts of the partners, the decree of the President of the Republic of Tajikistan was passed on the support to the children for living and education. It allowed efficient coordination between the NCWFA and all related state bodies, thus, making possible also attainment of the project's results and positive effects. This had an impact also on a wider scope of institutions not related to the state governance. As an example, one of the positive consequences of this was that state universities provided for free-of-charge education and some of the private universities 50% discounts for the education of the girls at GSC/SILUs.

The quality and efficiency of work of NCWFA and GSC has been notably improved. The established work technologies, procedures, institutional memory, coordination frameworks - established mechanisms and practices of work with central and regional authorities, as well as with regional public entities, societal active groups and specialists, allows these core entities of the system to develop further.

The project's efforts towards for capacity building of related state bodies both centrally and in regions, in coup with strengthened standing of the NCWFA and GSC contributed to the consolidation of the efforts of all relevant state institutions towards elimination of violence against the girls.

As a matter of fact, the partner NGOs and the CRDs became a network of agents working the operation of the whole system and the main linkage mechanism between the target groups, state bodies in regions and central managing bodies in Dushanbe.

Even, around five months after the project's finalization, the CRDs, partner NGOs and local state bodies continue communicating to the NCWFA and GSC cases of violence with a not less rate of intensity.

The trainings, public outreach and awareness activities of the project supplemented the set-up system with necessary environment to reveal and handle violence. This also improved the recognition and trust into the new system.

All these lead to more efficient mechanism of managing the environment of the girls in difficult situations. The created oversight and management mechanism of handling violence cases and leading the related role-players makes public more consolidated and responsible for the girls' rights. This drives also for more respect and careful consideration of the rights of the children.

A longer-term side effect is the more active and empowered standing of regional civil society representatives. The experience of the project made the society and the governmental institutions aware of their important role and the mandate to intervene and to undertake for the protection of the children's life and rights.

Another impact is the high reputation, recognition and respect towards the 'new system' – the NCWFA, GSC, regional partner NGOs, CRDs - by the decision-makers, central and local authorities. The child rights' and care institutions are now realizing well that the target area is well-supervised and controlled by a high-level authority with capabilities to influence the situation in regions.

Policy and legal environment:

The project performed a notable work towards policy and legal advice, which had an imminent impact on the current legal-institutional environment.

The project's experts made advocacy, supported the elaboration and availed comments on the Law on Parental Responsibilities of Tajikistan. The comments were carefully considered and the amendments to the Law were adopted in August 2011.

The project successfully lobbied for a decree by the government in 2009 to prevent placement of girls the Special School with boys. This problem needing immediate attention and serving as one of the core problems for launching the project has been solved.

The project's experts availed consultancy and comments on the Law on Domestic Violence. The adoption of the Law is still pending for the Parliament's nearby hearings in autumn session.

The project proposed changes to the Family Code including changing the marriage age of girls on 18. This amendment was agreed and came into effect from 1 January 2011. The project supported the amendments to the Criminal Code, whereby the marriage of girls before the legally provided marriage age of 18-years old is punishable.

The project lobbied for changes to the number of years of compulsory education for girls. This was changed from 9 to 10 years.

The project, since the start, has advocated and reached the inclusion of the key elements of the project and its main results into the National Plan of Actions for Juvenile Justice Reform 2010-2015. Particularly, the section 19 of the Plan of Actions stipulates the following tasks together with their timeframes (2010-2012) and responsible structures.

- Development of a nationwide support service for girls who are victims of sexual abuse, exploitation and trafficking.
- Establishment of a residential welfare unit for girls in Dushanbe.
- Development of a referral system to support services.
- Capacity building of law enforcement officials and the judiciary to treat girls who are victims of sexual abuse, exploitation and trafficking in an appropriate manner.
- Review and reform of procedures dealing with child victims in the criminal justice system
- Removal of girls who are victims of sexual abuse, exploitation and trafficking from juvenile justice system.

Practically, all these tasks were addressed with support of the project, which already evidences its impact. This inclusion into the National Plan of Actions also supported the smooth implementation of the project, such as the development of coordination system and state support and contribution to the establishment and operation of the GSC and SILUs.

Many of the above improvements of the national legislation and regulations have been positively noted and assessed by the International development organizations.

Improvement and consolidation of civil society represented by regional networks:

The project managed to develop the 'basement' and the key working mechanism for the overall system of protection of girls, which is the network of 10 regional partner NGOs. The project added to their capacity, contributed to their visibility in the regions, as well as assisted in establishing of regional information networks and communication culture in the regions.

By doing so, on one hand the project assisted the regional partner NGOs to become the main agents for monitoring the situation and informing the relevant bodies on the need for action. Hence, those started to serve as the main initiating agents to start the identification and treatment of girls-survivors of violence.

On the other hand the NGOs, being supported by the project, has engaged in direct assistance, advocacy and protection of the girls.

Hence, NGOs became a key sub-structure supporting the work of the whole referral network.

In parallel, they obtained vast experience on techniques and methods of handling the girls-survivors. They also developed registration and filing system that is invaluable, given the need for building proper institutional memory for the overall system.

The actions undertaken by NGOs within the implementation of the project have had notable impacts. The regional authorities, institutions, population and girls learned through them and were ensured that there is an effectively working mechanism to support the girls and children in general.

However, it should be mentioned that the involvement of NGOs and the civil society at large into the newly created system of protection of girls needed further institutional and state support (see also the part for Sustainability). There has been a need to convey the government the need to strongly support the inclusion of the NGOs in the overall system officially, as well as the need to support those financially.

The project lacked the opportunities to observe, analyze and present to the governmental partners the best practices of involvement of civil society representatives and NGOs in state systems of protection in the developed countries. Such analysis and some advocacy could help further maintaining the NGOs active and engaged in the system, which is one of the core elements of its operation.

Based on performed analysis, screening of different systems and interviews with the international experts the evaluator is of opinion that some services availed by the NGOs can not be effectively substituted by the state bodies at this stage of girls protection system development.

Particularly these are:

- 5) The helpline, with sufficient consultative functions of a psychologist;
- 6) Social work in regions, at the current initial stage of development of the system;
- 7) Public awareness raising activities, which are detrimental to the behavioral change;
- 8) Public independent monitoring of both the situation of the girls and the work towards their protection by the relevant state bodies in regions;
- 9) Educational and training activities aimed at raising the consciousness and awareness of the girls, educators, professionals and community authorities.

The regional partners NGOs of the project have rather strong organizational and professional standing. Some of them possess sufficient human resources, facilities and projects' portfolios for a long lasting activity.

E.g. the NGO 'Ghamkhori', in Kurgan-Teppa, Khatlon Region, is well-developed institutionally and professionally. The NGO has a long-standing experience in the field and of running diverse portfolio of donor-funded projects in support of the target groups. There are 42 members and employees at 'Ghamkhori' engaged in the professional activities. The organization also possesses different self-sustainable businesses allowing it partial self-financing.

During the project 'Ghamkhori' developed string regional network and commenced close liaison with all local bodies. It worked also with the religious leaders. 'Ghamkhori' supported 174 homeless girls, of which 16 were referred to GSC.

Such developed facilities, resources and practices features most of the involved regional partner NGOs. This means that the NGOs are reliable enough to be supported also in future both by the state and donors to perform their important role and functions in the system of protection of the girls.

Behavioral change and public perception:

The project has had obvious impact on the change of mindset and behavior of the target and related groups. The project has been the first consolidated attempt to change the understanding of the need and issues to protect girls and to rethink over the existing concepts and practices. This impact was further strengthened by the fact of contribution to the advancement of the state protection system of the girls.

Some main aspects of societal impacts can be characterized as follows.

Overcoming the preconceptions:

The intervention notably assisted for a breakthrough in the stereotypes of condemnation of the girls-survivors and impunity of the aggressors. One of the obvious long-term effects is the overcoming the preconceptions, pessimism and perceived lack of solutions because of weak position of girls and strong-enough habitual approaches.

The project demonstrated that in reality the society, particularly, the parents, community members and leaders and educators, would be eager to see solutions to the problem of the vulnerability, abuse and ignorance of the girls. Furthermore, the project demonstrated the way to do so and, even, more, brought-in certain practices for that.

The project's activities contributed to the nationwide advancement in understanding of the need, possibility and ways of elimination of violence and of the opportunities for girls.

The key factors dissolving stereotype thinking and preconceptions, however, need further strengthening and support. These are: continued strengthening and visibility of NCWFA, GSC, SILUs and the referral networks; continued activities of the NGOs; and further development of the legislative and budgetary frameworks for the system.

Public perception:

The project has notably contributed to the knowledge of both the public and the professionals on the issues related to the protection of girls. The project supported the raise on knowledge of around 100000 people countrywide, based on the estimations and the multiplier effect.

Mean time, there is an evident need in continuation of the public awareness raising. The nationwide recognition of the new protection system and protective actions implemented by the NCWFA and all its partners may bring to further reduction of violence against girls in the country.

The NGOs' activities in the regions brought to emergence of a strong group of supporters among the regional state bodies and communities. These local supporters can be developed further to become a platform for passage of relevant reforms and raising the culture of protection of the girls-victims and girls at risk.

Behavioral change:

Overall, a wide-scale behavioral change needs a much longer time than the 'scare' two years of the work with NGOs and the work done by them in the regions.

Nevertheless, some basis is constructed: change in attitudes, parental control and changed way of action by the parents, more attention by the communities, local authorities and more concentration and professional work by the children's rights protection organizations is visible.

Further, the strengthening of the national legislation and practices will bring to multiplication of the changes in the way of doing things both by the members of society and the state bodies.

Nevertheless, further continued actions and practicing of proactive prevention and protection is needed to bring to a notable societal-behavioral changes.

Meantime, the NGOs has observed evident shift in their communities. They call on the raise in intensively growing voicing of the problems, applications to themselves and to the regional state bodies. The NGOs has observed phenomena of activation of applications to court. According to them, the target groups and families have changed final radical solutions of isolation, escape and suicide to fighting and advocacy.

The factor of precedence:

The protection actions directly implemented by the project or through its support has served as good examples for wide continuum of specialists and professionals on how to deal with violence cases. Step-by-step the accumulated experience on the cases started to serve as precedence factor for acting by the diverse groups of state bodies and professional both in regions and in Dushanbe.

For example, the legal protection served as a long-lasting 'warning and preventing effect' for the families, communities, further destroying the prototype of impunity of an aggressively oriented individuals. It also gave a hands-on experience to the families and communities at large for recognizing the need for action and prevention the violence against the girls.

The legal consultancy has had also a learning effect for the law enforcement and judiciary for case management and reasonable decision-making. Some of the representatives of these institutions started counseling the specialists and approaching the cases in a more constructive way.

Conclusions

Overall, the intervention has been successful and responded well to the both the national priorities and the observations and recommendations of competent international organizations and UN monitoring bodies. Actually, the intervention covered an essential part of the country's Juvenile Justice National Action Plan 2010-2015 and produced inputs for further elaboration of dedicated policies towards protection of the rights of girls and prevention of violence, abuse and exploitation of girls and children. However, the latter inputs, the learned lessons, conclusions, elaborations on further policies, were so far reflected only in the draft Strategy of the NCWFA, which is still pending finalization and official approval.

This Strategy should further be finalized and adopted by the government (actually – also approved by the Parliament) to serve as a ground and official framework, within which the results of the current project can be further developed and supported politically, financially and institutionally.

Relevance and design:

Judged upon the analysis on the stakeholders' needs, project's background, structure and methodology, it can be concluded that the current project has been enough sufficiently covering these challenges and the needs of the primary beneficiaries. the girls aged 10-18, the needs for establishment of a coordinated system of response to and prevention of violence, abuse and exploitation.

The project was structured adequately. The components were planned so as to complement each other and yield synergy and impact on the target groups and their activities.

In the meantime, it is noted that the current project, still, contributed to the evolution and initial development stage of the protection system, where the basic institutions are established or supported in their management and organization, basic procedures are established and only initially experienced. The activities and achievements of the NCWFA, GSC, SILUs and referral bodies are still to be analyzed, and, based on the lessons learned, respective legal-regulatory and institutional improvements planned and implemented.

The analysis on the dynamics of applications to NCWFA, GSC and NGOs on the violence cases, and of the growing level of participatory activity of the stakeholders indicates that the new system became recognized and perceived only by the end of the second year of operation of the project. To some extent, this might be also the result of relatively weak public awareness and communication campaign. However, there was a further sharp increase in the number of applications, consultations, representation of girls at courts, judgments, which all allowed the involved institutions and individuals refine their knowledge and working methods to fight and prevent violence against girls.

Such dynamics suggests that the intervention could have been designed in two phases, where the first phase should have served for the establishment of the basic system and procedures, and the second phase – for further improvements and actions aimed at sustainability of the system, based on the lessons learned of the first phase.

The project's intervention logic was enough well-constructed and coherent. The bottom-up flow of the services, deliverables and results was thought over well and planned so as the achievement of the outputs, outcomes and objectives was enough realistic. However, the intervention logic did not sufficiently address issues related to the further sustainability and efficiency of the upgraded state protection system.

Particularly, the needs for financing of the development NCWFA, GSC, SILUs, the referral bodies in regions and NGOs remained an issue, although thanks to the project's efforts the GSC and SILUs received state funding for basic maintenance and operations. The full-scale financing of some of the core functions of NCWFA and GSC/SILUs also remains an issue: this regards to provision of professional legal services, transportation for outreach work and operations in regions, as well as some of the activities of the SILUs for rehabilitation of the girls.

The state funding of these institutions, both for their operational and developmental budgets, could have been addressed through earlier elaboration and approval of the Strategy of the NCWFA and its reflection in mid-term financial perspectives of the government.

The project considered establishment of a referral network and not a system. It planned to use the previously available network of regional partner NGOs to consolidate and coordinate with the referral bodies in the regions through MoUs. Similarly, the coordination between NCWFA and other central governmental agencies, as well as with regional referral bodies was planned to establish through MoUs. It is worth to mention that the NCWFA has a high-enough mandates to deal with these agencies. Furthermore a special governmental decision was adopted to support this coordination. However, the lack of a regulatory framework for a coordination weaken the level of responsibility of the referral bodies and do not provide for a legal basis for them to budget operations, resources and professional staff needed for

referral practices. The issue could have been probably addressed through a separate legal act or a package of governmental decrees/regulations providing for changes and amendments to the existing regulations of the referral bodies, entrusting them functions and obligations, and allowing them to budget and use resources to work the system.

The project notably contributed to the establishment of the NCWFA and its development as an institution. However, this mainly referred to its internal management and procedures, as well as the procedures for referrals. The external functions of NCWFA as a coordinating power and entity for the new protection system remained half-addressed, both due to shortage of time and the difficulty to pass policy documents and legal acts through the government. The project might have developed cooperation with various international organizations and UN monitoring bodies to stronger lobby for the NCWFA at the government, as the strengthening of the latter and the coordination of the protection system are key issues touched upon in almost all recent reports of these bodies during the official reviews of various country reports submitted by the government.

Effectiveness:

Based on the qualitative analysis of the achievement of outputs, it can be stated that the project notably contributed to its overall goal. It managed to establish a coordinated system of response to the needs of the girls-survivors of violence and girls at risk through the strengthened coordination, service/care institutions, referral network, work technologies and efficient protection cases.

In the meantime, this contribution is difficult to quantify, as base-line and end-line surveys of the target groups, categorized statistics and analysis on the handled cases and provided services were not available. This does not allow make judgments on such indicators as: the increase in the ratio of the girls acceding to the protection and rehabilitation services; assessment of the effectiveness of various channels of access; the indicators of the effectiveness of the system - time used for handling a case; ratio of successful judgments and decisions. The lack of self-evaluation and analysis on the experience also does not allow seeing the full picture as regards the effectiveness of the NCWFA procedures and of the referral network: i.e. what is the follow-up on non-selection cases; whether the decisions of the various participating agencies are taken timely; whether the opportunities and measures undertaken for education and, later, for employment are sufficient, etc.

Nevertheless, the qualitative analysis on the achievement of outcomes through various studies and analysis of existing data, procedures, working papers, as well as brainstorming and discussion reveal enough high-level of contribution. The needs for further improvements as regard improvement of the quality of attained institutions, practices and resources, as follows.

The GSC and SILUs are institutionally set-up and enough effective. The rehabilitation, educational and social programs and the wrk technologies proved to be efficient. The attention is to be paid to, in future, to obtain permanent flats for the SILUs, which may reduce the costs on the rent and allow spending the funds availed by the state budget on support actions for the girls. The maintenance and regular training of the staff of GSC and SILUs will also need continuous attention. The social reintegration program of the girls will need further coordinated support by the NCWFA and relevant ministries, so as to provide for more opportunities for education and employment. This can be probably done through elaboration of specific vocational education programs for the girls or their placement into VET institutions.

The outreach work in regions and facilitation of access of the girls to the protection and rehabilitation system has been notable. Meantime, this is an activity, where continuous state and donor support will be needed. The project has created a good base for further outreach in the regions. Nevertheless, some improvements will be needed. The NGOs represent the core mechanism for outreach and the involved authorities will need to define and implement a dedicated policy of their involvement in a well-planned regular communication campaign. If followed-up further communication campaign can be significantly supported through two most influential role players, educational institutions and religious leaders. The NGOs will need constant liaison with those and specific programs to keep on the positive trend of mindset change and strengthening prevention measures.

The referral network has been established and is workable. It was able to put in practice the elaborated referral procedures and actually handle almost all signals and cases of violence during the project's operation. However, the network heavily relied on the NGOs and their specialists, who were funded by the project. After the project, the referral network continued its operation, however, with much less response capacity due to lack of sufficient expertise and technical means at the Child Rights' Departments. The project did not plan and execute several important activities towards the strengthening of the referral network. Primarily, this is the legal-regulatory and institutional analysis of the involved institutions and the legislation regulating their powers, responsibilities, activities and funding. Such analysis is still needed given the need in institutionalization of the network. Further, no any analysis and possibilities for NGOs' official involvement has been performed. The two team leaders – international

experts of the project could help and could contribute with their knowledge of the developed systems (EU Member States) to perform a comparative analysis and recommendations on the best applicable practices for involvement of NGOs.

The project has been enough successful in strengthening the NCWFA's internal organization, procedures, human resources and, partially, budgeting practices. However, the incorporation of a Policy Development facility within the NCWFA, its further Strategy, stronger budgetary framework to implement the planned Strategy, institutionalization of the coordination system with other involved agencies remain to be solved after the project.

Efficiency

By ad large the project has been enough efficient in terms of timely availability of inputs, performance of activities and delivery of results. However, several aspects of implementation needed attention.

The frequent changes of the Team Leaders - International Experts had a negative impact on the finalization of some of the activities, such as internal and field monitoring, integration of the Policy Development Team, policy and legal consultancy to NCWFA, adoption of the Strategy, project's statistics, reporting and internal evaluation.

The time foreseen for the implementation was not and could not be sufficient for effective learning on the results, amendments to the project's approach and facilitating the factors sustainability and impact. A significantly smaller-budget second phase could have been planned for a proper follow-up ad finalization of results: supporting adoption of NCWFA's Strategy and its reflection in state budgets; legal-regulatory and institutional gaps' analysis for enrichment of the strategy with reform actions towards further strengthening and development of the involved institutions; elaboration of a program for involvement of the NGOs and the civil society in the regions, etc.

The project did not established self-evaluation practices, which would be needed to review the achievements, non-achievements and proper adjustment of further strategy of implementation.

The quality of the project's reporting could have been improved. This regards: proper statistics on implemented activities; the analysis and description of results and achievements; the risk monitoring and management. The project's databases and analytical information needed a well-set-up institutional memory, which has not been established either.

Sustainability

The project managed to attain sustainable assets – products of intervention and joint efforts with the counterparts. These are: fully established GSC and SILUs with trained staff, procedures and rehabilitation programs; workable mechanisms of outreach, eased access of the target groups to the services of and public awareness on the system; the referral networks with procedures and already notable experience, as well as the NCWFA with strengthened internal management practices and some coordination framework with the involved state institutions and agencies.

The project also supported around 1000 girls at risk and their families, as well as educated their families, community members, educators and the representatives of the related state bodies, thus, contributing to the continuum of supporters of further reforms in the target area.

Meantime, the project did not foresee a phase-out strategy, which would support the project and its counterparts to elaborate on and implement specific measures to increase the chances of the project's results and services be sustained further.

The counterparts of the project, notably the government an NCWFA, still need to pay attention to a number of important issues related to the sustainability aspects (see also above, conclusions for 'relevance' and 'effectiveness'). In the main this regards to: the finalization and adoption of the state policies (NCWFA's Strategy); establishment of 3-5 years budgeting practice for the whole system, including separate budget headings/sections for the involved ministries and agencies for specific actions to support the referral system; strategy of involvement of the civil society and NGOs in the regions.

The project has been supported well-enough politically: the issues of concern were in the focus of the relevant authorities. However, in future, there will be a need to attain support of other layers of society: the socially oriented businesses, wider civic networks, volunteering organizations, unions and professionals. Equally important is to attain strong support of the community leaders and religious leaders in the regions.

A complete review of the related legislation: the Law on parental Responsibilities, the draft Law on Domestic Violence; the Law on Fighting Trafficking in Persons; the Family Code; the Criminal Code and the Criminal Procedures; Code, as well as the legal-regulatory framework the law enforcement bodies

and related agencies will need a comprehensive review to provide for further efficiency of work of the referral network and the protection system in a whole.

A proper attention is to be paid to the further development of human resources and professional capacities. In this regard, the NCWFA will need to elaborate a training program and a separate facility and budget to provide for regular trainings of the staff of all involved institutions.

Impact

The intervention resulted on a notable, but still initial, impact in terms of: introduction of a new protection and rehabilitation system coordinated by the NCWFA; institutional strengthening of the core bodies: the NCWFA; GSC; SILUs, CRDs and regional bodies, NGOs; more active standing of the civil society representatives in the regions; number of important legislative changes and initiatives; overall behavioral changes implied through increased number of applications, overcoming the stigma and wrong perception of the girls-victims of violence, and corrective behavior based on the precedence.

The main two long-term effects of the project were: the consolidation of the protection system and its redirection to child-centered solutions and opening opportunities for inclusion of civil society into the protection and rehabilitation system.

Meantime, in addition to the above remarks on the further strengthening of the system and its elements, the involvement of the NGOs should be seen as a crucial factor for continued impact. The NCWFA will need to establish long-term partnerships with the experienced 10 NGO partners of the project in areas, where the services by the state agencies have not been and are not expected to be enough efficient. These are, particularly: the helpline services; social and educational work in the regions, public awareness activities and public independent monitoring.

Recommendations

Development of the current results and achievements:

The main recommendations for the further development of the results and outcomes of the current project are as follows.

1. A sufficient attention is to be paid to the further stability and development of the NCWFA, GSC, SILUs, as per the following key aspects:
 - 1.1. Advocating for the NCWFA's policy and budgets, by all possible means of supporters;
 - 1.2. Maintaining qualified staff, means for the girls care, educational and cultural programs;
 - 1.3. Maintaining the core services of hot-line, coordination of regional partners, outreach to the girls in regions, legal assistance and referral networks;
 - 1.4. Further promotion and raising the awareness of population on the established protection system.
2. The referral network will need further strengthening and institutionalization:
 - 2.1. The NCWFA and line ministries will need to elaborate on a separate legal-regulatory package for regulating the functions, powers and responsibility of the involved institutions both at central and regional levels;
 - 2.2. The budgets at each involved institution will need specification and separate programming to later allow usage of own resources and infrastructures for the girls' protection and rehabilitations system.
3. The established networks of NGOs need further strengthening:
 - 3.1. Attempting for further voluntary or, as far as possible, incentive-based involvement of regional partner NGOs in the referral networks, at least, in part of identification and referrals;
 - 3.2. As far as possible maintain NGOs' role of main communicators and for the monitoring of situation in the regions;
 - 3.3. Providing for further methodological support, specialized consultancy to and capacity building for regional partner NGOs;
 - 3.4. Attempt advocacy at the government for future partial financing of the NGO's work.
4. The partners need to make steps towards finalization and consideration of the NCWFA's Strategy for adoption by the Government
 - 4.1. The Strategy needs to foresee mid-term budgeting principle for the protection system, including the regional referral networks' operation;
 - 4.2. The Strategy needs to sufficiently support the legal amendments to the existing legislation and adoption of new legal acts to finalize the legal framework for the protection system, including:
 - 1) more responsibility of the parents, educational institutions, social and health workers, law enforcement bodies;
 - 2) more restrictive criminal proceedings and punishment of the aggressors, and better oversight over those, as regards their access to, relationships and communication with children, as well as institutions serving to children;
 - 3) adoption of the domestic violence legislation, taking into account national cultural and religious specificities; particularly, the domestic violence legislation has to 'compromise' some aspects of cultural life (clothing, behaving, communication), which do not bring to the essential limitations of the rights of the persons (women and girls) as regards education, employment, usual social relationships and life activity;
 - 4) fulfillment of civil and criminal procedures codes and the legislation regulating the activity of police, prosecution and social, healthcare institutions for more effective response to the violence cases and more effective treatment of the girls-survivors of violence.
5. The NCWFA needs to put efforts to improve the capacities in the regions, including:
 - 5.1. Advocating for more resources for CRDs in the regions;
 - 5.2. Providing for ongoing training of state bodies in the regions;

- 5.3. Providing for specialized training of trainers for social protection and educational institutions;
- 6. The coordination framework with the national authorities need further strengthening; the first priority actions here are to be:
 - 6.1. Providing for the framework of regular consultations with the Ministry of Social Protection, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Internal Affairs and other relevant authorities for finding ways for further strengthening the regional networks and planning for possible budgetary support to the regional departments for the work towards protection of the girls;
 - 6.2. Putting efforts to find efficient and stable solutions to the educational, vocational and employment needs of the girls.
- 7. The NCWFA with the support of regional authorities and CRC need to elaborate an approach to raising the culture of the protection of girls through the Religious Leaders. The experience of the regional partner NGO 'Ghamkhor' in Khatlon region may serve as a good example for this.

Designing future similar projects:

The specific recommendations to the Implementer, UN Women, Trust Fund, NCWFA and other related state bodies, in regard to further planning of this type of projects are as follows.

- 8. It would be reasonable to precede the actions by thorough situation analysis, including: fundamental analysis on the factors and societal psychology of the violence; surveys, statistical work and analysis on the general picture of the target group, violence and treatment; legal and institutional analysis; analysis on the current studies, papers and communications, including official reports and notes, on the country by the specialized international organizations.
- 9. The future actions will need a better set-up and organization for periodic analysis, monitoring and reporting on the situation in the country.
- 10. This types of actions need to be constructed in, at least, two phases: (i) induction phase and (ii) legal improvements and institutional building phase.
- 11. The future actions may need more attention and may foresee more support actions for: capacity building for specific groups of state bodies; involvement of the civil society; work with Religious Leaders and educational institutions; coordination with other projects and international organizations present in the country.
- 12. It is recommended to foresee that the management of the actions be done by the local experts. Instead of managers, a dedicated and specialized foreign expertise is needed in specific fields, such as: treatment of girls-survivors; social, legal and institutional mechanism of treatment and life-support to the girls; the mechanisms of involvement of civil society organizations in the work of state protection bodies and systems; comparative legal and institutional analysis.
- 13. In future similar actions it would be reasonable to introduce a mixed management team, consisting of, at least, one local Team Leader / Project Manager.
- 14. A refined planning and reporting systems should be in place for future similar actions.

Annex 1. Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation component / Intervention level	Key Questions	Specific questions	Data sources / Respondents	Data Collection Methods/Tools	Indicators/Success Standard
Relevance and quality of design: response to needs, compliance with guiding documents and principles, appropriateness					
Alignment with National Policies	Whether the intervention is aligned with the national policies?	-	Documents on analysis of the target sector / Project's team; NCWFA, other ministries and state bodies (in regions?)	Analysis of documents / discussions with the project's team, experts, stakeholders	Existence of clear state strategies allowing the project to rely on or comment substantially
	Limitations for alignment	Restrictive legal acts, practices? E.g. the Law on religion?	Documents on analysis of the target sector, Laws in English / Project's team; NCWFA, other ministries	See above	Indication and cases of limitation or generally restricting procedures
Response to the target groups' needs	Coverage of categories / groups / needs: girls-survivors; girls-with no documents; with no access to education; affected families; communities; central and regional authorities; NGOs; volunteers. Thematic coverage? Geographical coverage?	Has the social phenomena of 'victimization' of girls-survivors been analyzed? Social behavior patterns? Had any needs analysis been done prior to the project's commencement? If yes, has it been updated during the projects, what intervals? Did the needs analysis took into account the range and groups of beneficiaries? Was any desk study on the studies, analysis, monitoring reports of competent international organizations performed and discussed with them?	Project's documents / Project's team and stakeholders. Any pre-project analysis and updates during the project.	See above	Content and ratio of coverage per group and per issue Lessons learned and conclusions made out of desk study and/or surveys on: the risk groups and other stakeholder groups; their needs; problems behind of no-response or weak response by the authorities and donors; response strategy and main measures.
Appropriateness	Feasible for current environment? Is the Intervention acceptable socially and culturally? Delivery methods clear and acceptable?	Is the intervention acceptable to the involved stakeholders? Any conflicts with local culture, traditions, social technologies, experience? Has there been any analysis on sensitive aspects of intervention? Any analysis on the ways and means for raising perception and social impact?	See above	Contextual analysis, discussions with the experts and local counterparts – NGOs, as far as possible social, culture and religious activists	Evidences from experience, feedback of beneficiaries, expert assessments
Quality of Design	Main Intervention Logic: realistic, clear-cut, constructed logically, time and resources sufficient?	Has the Intervention Logic been discussed and agreed with the local counterparts? Are the means (resources and time) sufficient to perform activities? Is the range of activities sufficient to lead to the outputs and results? Were sufficient actions foreseen to assist the usage of results and attainment of effects and impacts? Do the effects out of implantation bring to realization of planned outcomes?	Project's documents / Project's team and stakeholders	Discussions with the project's staff and stakeholders (NCWFA, NGOs - notably)	As provided by UNEG Norms and Standards, UNDP PME handbook; UN Women Evaluation Policy and Guidance Notes The design has been re-evaluated in the mid-term, optimized and adapted

		Are the indicators and sources of verification identified relevantly? Has there been any re-evaluation and adaptation of the design? Jointly with stakeholders and beneficiaries?			
Effectiveness: The project's contribution to the objectives: Status of and contribution to the outcomes: Process of absorption and utilisation of outputs					
Overall Goal: Prevention of exploitation, abuse, violence, and trafficking of vulnerable girls of the age of 10-18 in Tajikistan	The effects and impact of the intervention on the situation in Tajikistan	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The overall coverage of the primary target group, the affected girls, girls at risk, who received assistance through the project, GSC, SILUs, Authorities 2. The number of girls supported for other than direct violence issues: documents, schooling, consultancy, treatment 3. The increase in the quality and coverage of the protection services 4. The legal and institutional gaps in the protection services 5. The state of affairs in prevention: state policies; local programs and approaches; work of NGOs, local authorities, bodies, educational staff, religious leaders 6. The level of stability of the current unofficial referral network 	<p>Project's statistics; national and international monitoring and observation missions</p> <p>Project's statistics</p> <p>Any analysis by the project, specialized organizations</p> <p>State authorities, regional authorities, NGOs, educators</p> <p>NCWFA, NGOs, project staff</p>	<p>Desk study on the project's documents, documents of relevant organizations</p> <p>Discussions with the project's staff, NCWFA, other authorities, NGOs, as far as available and applicable specialized organizations</p> <p>Cross-checking the field information and desk-study results</p>	<p>% of girls at risk are backstopped by the newly established state services</p> <p>Number of cases handled, proceeded and finalized: statistics and filing is available</p> <p>The prevention activities covered % of the girls in the communities, in schools</p> <p>The state policies and programs sufficiently cover the subjects of intervention and problems: direct violence, rights' protection and fulfillment, preventive mechanisms and practices, judgments and control practices over aggressors, fight against committing to crime.</p> <p>The referral network operates effectively, even though not established officially: cases are detected, girls are referred and treated, supported.</p>
Outcome 1. Target girls are able to access rehabilitation and reintegration service in supported living units	<p>The extent to which the access to services by the target group increased</p> <p>What was the combined effect of attainment of outputs, if those were sufficiently attained?</p> <p>Could any additional actions, e.g. dedicated vocational education, involvement of socially oriented organizations, bring to more effects?</p>	<p>What is the % ratio of the girls to the estimated continuum that acceded the services of GSC / SILUs</p> <p>What is the response rate of the NCWFA so far? Number of cases denied?</p> <p>The rate of % increase in identifying and handling cases in the regions</p> <p>Increase in the number of girls acceding services through the regional NGOs</p>	<p>Project's data, expert discussion and estimates, NCWFA, NGOs,</p> <p>See above</p>	<p>Round-table with project staff, experts, NGOs and NCWFA, interviews with any socially oriented organizations / businesses</p> <p>See above</p>	<p>Number increase of girls acceding to services</p> <p>Increase in acceding to services through diverse channels: NGOs, regional bodies, NCWFA, schools, hospitals, educators</p> <p>Increase in the interest and initiatives of socially oriented organizations to assist the girls</p>
Output 1.1: Girls at the supported living units are able to increase independence while at the supported living units	<p>Whether the supported 'Semi-Independent Living Units' (SILUs) were fully established, equipped and have trained personnel</p> <p>Were those in a position to provide for full treatment and training to the girls</p>	<p>Were the SILUs physically established well?</p> <p>Was the staff at SILUs trained and stayed stable during the implementation?</p> <p>What were the programs dedicated at rehabilitation and further development of the girls?</p> <p>How effective were the SILUs in terms of costs/effects: what were the results of</p>	<p>SILU's records; project's staff; grls-survivors, specialists deployed</p>	<p>Desk study; round-table with project staff, SILUs ad girls</p>	<p>SILUs are physically established, have trained and stable staff, programs and methodologies</p> <p>Girls benefiting from the services of SILUs in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - being rehabilitated psychologically and socially - improved their life skills and are able to care for themselves and

		services to the girls?			the SILU family - girls can apply their skills also out of SILUs
Output 1.2: Admissions procedure for girls to the supported living units developed	Whether the procedures developed serve for equal and objective selection of girls and ensure solutions for re-integration effectively	Do the procedures foresee collegial decisions and who is involved? What is the range of factors for selection and how its changes may impact selection? What are the procedures for non-selected girls? Further follow-up?	NCWFA; SILUs; project staff	Procedures, records, discussion with the team and officials	The procedures consider full enough range of factors for selection of girls In case of non-selection, decision is made for adopting a separate program for the non-selected girls The implementation is well-documented and filed
Output 1.3: Conditions for a supportive environment for the girls in the Semi-Independent Living Units created	Are the girls supported for education, training, socializing and treatment	Whether the training tools and means, specialists (psychologists, doctors) trained staff are available Whether the educational and socialising programs are elaborated and implemented	SILUs, specialists, girls	Lively discussions at SILUs, visits to SILUs, visits to the care centers of regional partner NGOs	The girls are provided with sufficient means for learning, education, socializing Specialist support is fully provided to the girls: psychologists, pedagogues, doctors, coaches A program for exposure of girls to the society (shopping, cultural events, liaison with adolescents) is provided and implemented
Output 1.4: Girls are reintegrated back to their families, communities and the society by support of Youth Workers	What was the overall trend and statistics on reintegration?	How many girls of those who were admitted to GSC were reintegrated? The evaluation of reintegration factors and drivers: - Increased consciousness and recognition of the need at families, parents, communities? - Increase in the abilities of the girls to socialize, study, be employed (over 18)? - The dedicated work/efforts of the Youth Workers with employers and educational institutions? - Contribution by the regional NGOs and bodies, communities? - Other factors / drivers	SILUs, Youth Workers (pedagogues), NCWFA, regional NGO partner, project's team, employers and educational institutions	Desk analysis of project's materials, interviews, discussions at SILUs	% of the girls admitted to GSC got were reintegrated and their further records indicate successful reintegration – schooling, graduation, employment The dedicated work of SILUs / Youth Workers and GSC helped overcoming the social stigma and stereotype thinking The families, communities reveal more constructive approach and initiative for reintegration Employers and educational institutions reveal interest in and ability to host the girls The girls get abilities for living and socializing in a society
Outcome 2: Increase in assistance to the target group in their local community through the Regional NGO partners	What was the capacity (organizations, individuals and their consolidation) created in the regions in support to the girls, handling and prevention of violence? What was the combined effect of attainment of outputs, if those were sufficiently attained? Could any additional actions, e.g. dedicated vocational education, involvement of socially oriented	Whether relevant NGO partners were selected and their capacities strengthened? Whether the main institutions in regions responsible / related to violence prevention were involved? Did the dedicated outreach actions: - Reached the sufficient continuum of beneficiaries: girls, families, communities, institutions?	Regional partner NGOs' reports, project's team, NGOs, local bodies, representatives of local communities	Discussions over the experience with NGOs, local bodies, families; Desk analysis on multiplier ratio, project's statistics	The key stakeholders on the regions, partner NGOs, Child Right's Departments, police, community halls, schools, region departments of relevant ministries were made aware, interested in and become able to handle violence cases Families and girls recognized the means to address the violence Additional work with local

	organizations, bring to more effects?	- Bring to the recognition of the problem and initiatives towards its elimination? Did the community members, families, girls consider and become more active in usage of the new services?			organizations and religious leaders contributed to the situation
Output 2.1: Increase in capacity of local partners to deliver assistance to the target groups	Did the continuum of NGO partners and regional institutions stayed stable and committed? What was their contribution to prevent and fight violence? What are the change / improvement in the behavior of NGOs supported?	How the selection of NGOs proceeded: criteria, establishment of cooperation, planning, reporting, and assessment frameworks? What were the main capacity building activities and their results? How the networking proceeded between the NGOs and regional institutions? What was the practical application of the received knowledge by the NGOs; other institutions? What were the preventive actions and results? Do NGOs undertake current campaigns, other than those with the project?	Project's team; NCWFA; NGOs; regional authorities and state bodies; project's monitoring missions' records for regional activities Project's analysis and observations / NGOs	Discussions in regions and Dushanbe, interviews with the providers and participants; analysis on project's documents and reports	Identification of needs for alternative assistance: psychological, social, negotiations NGOs were able to establish stable contacts with the main role-players in the regions NGOs are able to train and coach the regional partners and sufficiently support the communities and families Preventive seminars were delivered to number of girls and youngsters Current initiatives of NGOs
Output 2.2: Increase utilization of social services by the target group and their families through local community NGOs <i>(Actually: improvement of access to protection services and prevention for girls, schools communities in regions by the NGOs and regional bodies)</i>	What was the overall response to the violence in the regions by the NGOs and regional stat bodies? What were the preventive activities and how effective were those?	How many girls in general and girls at risk or survivors of valence were supported? What was the classification of the cases identified? Whether those were registered? What additional support, training and coaching received the target groups for rights' protection, prevention, liaison with state bodies?	Project's team; NCWFA; NGOs; regional authorities and state bodies; project's monitoring missions' records for regional activities	Discussions in regions and interviews with the providers and participants; analysis on project's documents and reports	Number of identified violence cases and referrals, classified per categories and filed Number of successful cases and failures Number of girls returned to families Representation of girls' rights at courts, state bodies, successful judgments and decisions
Output 2.3: Increase in utilization of free legal consultations, advice and representation to girls in the target group <i>(Actually: improvement of access to protection services and prevention for girls, schools communities countrywide by the NCWFA/GSC and project)</i>	What was the overall response to the violence countrywide by the NCWFA, GSC and the project's support facility? What were the preventive activities and how effective were those?	See above How well the help-line worked? How many applications were received and identified? What was the comparative statistics of calls and applications in the past 3 years? What is the success rate change during the three years in handling and fighting the violence cases	Project's team; NCWFA; NGOs; regional authorities and state bodies; reports of help-line, social workers' trainer; GSC and SILUs	Discussions in Dushanbe, interviews with the providers and participants; analysis on project's documents and reports	See above Increase in number of applications and calls Time used by the help-line operator and specialists on counseling, preparation of documents and submission of requests to state bodies Increased rate of successful advocacy actions per year during the three-year period
Outcome 3: Effective Referral Networks identifies and refers girls throughout the country in 10 Districts in Tajikistan	Whether any referral network and internal cooperation mechanisms reached between the main actors and decision makers in Dushanbe and regions?	Was it possible to reach a 'critical' continuum of local/regional organizations and individuals supporting the girls? Was the referral network established officially or based on non-official	NCWFA, GSC, project team, NGOs, regional and central authorities; work procedures; referral cases and files; individual files of the girls	Desk study on the available documents; discussions in regions and in Dushanbe with the NCWFA and regional authorities, NGOs	All relevant decision-makers and local authorities are involved in the referral network and cooperate well with each-other Work procedures are establish to

	<p>Did this cooperation mechanism worked and brought to results? Any comparative analysis between the 10 regions and lessons learned?</p>	<p>cooperation of the parties? Who are the leading agents – drivers of the referral network? How effective is the referral network in terms of response to the referrals? If it is not, or effective only case-by-case, what are reasons behind? Has the referral network been sufficiently supported with relevant procedures and work technologies?</p>			<p>follow-up and process identified cases with sufficient reporting to NCWFA The Local Child Rights' Departments and NGOs lead the process Internal monitoring is established to analyze wrong identification or failure of identification and absence of effective follow-up</p>
<p>Output 3.1. Referral bodies (child protection, law enforcement, educational and health institutions) are able to identify and refer girls of the target group to GSC through the establishment of referral networks in each target district. (Actually: networking and competence)</p>	<p>How the network was established, needs assessed and addressed through capacity building actions</p>	<p>Types and number of institutions involved Any competence matrix, functional maps? Whether the training needs' assessment was done? Did this served to identification of functional gaps, institutional weaknesses in the national systems of protection?</p>	<p>Project team, NGOs, regional and central authorities; MoUs signed with local bodies and central bodies, work procedures; referral cases and files; training materials; individual files of the girls</p>	<p>See above</p>	<p>The referral network is established whether: - Officially: through statutory documents or orders; or - Unofficially, through MoUs, commitments of parties and internal procedures The needs of the involved parties are studies and relevant program of capacity building elaborated and implemented (continued below)</p>
<p>Output 3.2: Capacity of referral bodies is enhanced to identify and assess girls that are at risk or who have been sexually abused, trafficked or exploited (Actually: dedicated trainings to referral bodies)</p>	<p>See above: Additionally, whether civil society was involved?</p>	<p>What type of trainings and capacity building was provided and what was the coverage among the involved institutions? How this enhanced the effectiveness of the referral network? How has the civil society been involved in networking and capacity building for state bodies? Community leaders / activists, engaged in advocacy, prevention, handling of cases</p>	<p>Project team, Policy Development Team, NGOs, regional and central authorities; MoUs signed with local bodies and central bodies, work procedures; referral cases and files; training materials; individual files of the girls</p>	<p>See above</p>	<p>The core functions of the referral network is taken-over by the regional Child Departments The internal work procedures and guides are elaborated and recipients are trained on those The civil society has been involved in establishment of the network to provide for objectivity and completeness of functions The network works and is able to handle violence cases</p>
<p>Output 3.3 Five professional guides for the staff at the Girls' Support Centre are produced and used</p>	<p>Did the guides become working and learning tools for the trained referral bodies?</p>	<p>Were the lessons learned through the exposure to regions and from the needs assessment process incorporated into the guides? Were the guides developed jointly with any available specialists in the regions, NGOs? Were those explained and proper trainings on those delivered to the recipients? Whether the published copies sufficiently covered the need in?</p>	<p>Project team, NGOs, regional and central authorities</p>	<p>Review of the guides; comparison with any existing similar guides; discussions with the project's team, NGOs, authorities</p>	<p>The five guides provided with sufficient joint review by the stakeholders The guides avail theoretical and practical knowledge to identify and handle violence cases and to work towards prevention of violence</p>
<p>Outcome 4: The National Committee on Women and Family Affairs (NCWFA) is</p>	<p>Has the NCWFA been strengthened enough to undertake further reforms and improvements on its own?</p>	<p>What were the measures to develop and strengthen the NCWFA's institutional and management capacities?</p>	<p>Project's reports; NCWFA charter and internal procedural documents; project team, NCWFA,</p>	<p>Review of NCWFA's policies, materials, procedures, staff and</p>	<p>The NCWFA has become a lead agency with a definite strategy for improvements of the legal-</p>

<p>the lead state agency actively promoting the rights of the girls in Tajikistan</p>	<p>Did the attainment of outputs have a positive effect on further self-organization and increased capacities of the NCWFA to engage in and regulate the target area?</p>	<p>Was the NCWFA supported with updated human resources and budgetary policies? Was the NCWFA supported with sufficient legal and regulatory advice? Any experience of developed systems in other/similar countries analyzed, knowledge transferred? Was the awareness on NCWFA's leading role and referral system increased in the regions and in Dushanbe? Whether the regulatory framework was analyzed, gaps identified and long-term reform plan drafted?</p>	<p>PDT, other state bodies in Dushanbe and regions, NGOs</p>	<p>financial policies, legislation in force and in process of preparation Interviews and discussions with the participants of the process</p>	<p>regulatory framework, supported with budgetary frameworks, proper human resources policy and is capable of coordination of both central and regional authorities to protect the rights of, prevent and fights violence against the girls The NCWFA takes account of and attempts implementing the best practices applicable in Tajikistan</p>
<p>Output 4.1: NCWFA is able to establish and fully manage the Girls' Support Centre</p>	<p>Does the NCWFA manage the whole process of handling and fighting violence cases? Does it effectively manage the referral network and the GSC? Does it have an agenda for development of the system?</p>	<p>Whether the GSC institutionally embedded into the NCWFA Whether complete set of legal acts and procedures are elaborated and enacted to manage the GSC with its selection panel Whether there is a plan for development of GSC financed through the state budget Annual budgets for GSC/SILUs? Is there an internal human resources and training plan for the GSC? Has the GSC staff passed trainings and attestations by the NCWFA? Whether the established coordination, referral and information system works enough efficiently to manage the whole procedural cycle of assistance, violence handling? Whether the NCWFA is in a position to monitor the process of handling of cases? What are the internal reporting mechanisms?</p>	<p>Project's reports; NCWFA charter and internal procedural documents; Project team, NCWFA, PDT, GSC</p>	<p>See above Any communication, meetings and discussion minutes with other state bodies, referral bodies</p>	
<p>Output 4.2: The human resource management of the NCWFA is enhanced</p>	<p>Does NCWFA have an internal human resources management and development policy? Is the NCWFA sufficiently provided with professional staff: if not, does it have a plan for that?</p>	<p>Is the management, monitoring, policy-making, administrative and training staff of NCWFA provided? Does NCWFA have internal training, performance and quality assurance mechanisms? What are the staff development actions and plans? Motivation base and its further improvements?</p>	<p>Project's reports; NCWFA charter and internal procedural documents; NCWFA staff; Project team, NCWFA, PDT</p>	<p>Analysis on available documents of NCWFA; interviews with the staff and management</p>	
<p>Output 4.3: NCWFA has an improved process for dealing with complaints and</p>	<p>Are the NCWFA's response mechanisms well-set-up? Is there a sufficient database and</p>	<p>Does the NCWFA have sufficient admissions' staff and consultancy unit? Are the admissions sessions recorded,</p>	<p>Project's reports; NCWFA admission procedures and records; referral communication; other documents;</p>	<p>See above Analysis on NCWFA</p>	

representations	analysis on complaints, applications and representation?	cases registered, classified, followed-up, responses to the applicants performed and the process - properly monitored? What were the outcomes of the applications; any statistics with final results; the level of satisfaction? Do the referral bodies contacted or involved, in average in what time period since the identification of a case within their competence?	Project team, NCWFA, PDT, other state bodies as relevant; citizens-applicants	records, applicants' files	
Output 4.4: NCWFA is able to engage in advocacy, policy development, coordination and programme implementation	Has the NCWFA's further policies/strategies been formulated? Did NCWFA started field coordination of the referral bodies? What were the main policies, legal-regulatory initiatives so far?	What is the state of the Strategy of NCWFA: is it aligned with the Juvenile Justice National Action Programme 2010-2015? Is there a budgetary framework to support the implementation of the Strategy? Has there been any legal gaps analysis both for the protection system and the institutions? Any analysis on legislation of in the countries with 'developed systems'? Is any legal-institutional improvement plan worked out? Was any analysis on the institutional standing and needs for improvement of the regulatory base for the referral bodies identified? What were the project's contributions to the Law on Parental Responsibilities and the Law on Domestic Violence?	Project's reports; NCWFA's and PDT's documents; Project's team, NCWFA officials, other state bodies, as applicable	Analysis on NCWFA draft Strategy, other policy papers, legislation, budgetary frameworks of NCWFA; amendments to the laws on parental responsibility and gender equality Study on any available analysis of legal-institutional gaps Interviews with NCWFA, PDT, other state institutions	There is an elaborate Strategy (draft-commented or approved) of the NCWFA in line with the Juvenile Justice National Action Program 2010-2015 The legal-institutional gaps analysis is performed and results incorporated or awaiting incorporation into the Strategy The Strategy is sufficiently supported by mid-term budgetary frameworks The institutional development plans for the referral bodies in part of prevention of violence and protection of girls are worked out The sufficient policies to support the re-integration of girls-survivors of violence are drawn-up and key referral bodies have internal procedures and standardized plans for support
Output 4.5: The level of the public's awareness is raised by NCWFA on gender issues, child rights, protection of girls from sexual abuse, trafficking or exploitation	To what extent the public perceives the NCWFA as a lead and trustful institution to fight violence against girls? Whether NCWFA undertook any actions to raise public awareness?	Does the population, communities and referral bodies recognize its mandate and accepts it an efficient institution? Whether baseline and end-line surveys were provided for measuring the public recognition and perception of the problems?	Any surveys in regions and in Dushanbe; feedback of the trainees and participants of events and discussions Project's team, NCWFA, PDT, other state bodies	Analysis on the surveys and media highlights Interviews with the participants of the events and surveys	The NCWFA has adopted a proper communication strategy and is able to carry-out The end line survey indicated % increase in public perception of the violence against the girls and the ways to fight it The state officials, professionals and regional bodies refer to NCWFA as a lead institution able to efficiently address the problems
Efficiency: The perception of process of attainment of outputs and usage of resources					
Planning and adaptations	What was the quality of planning?	Did the project have clear and realistic plans of activities and deliverables? Was it used through-over the project and adaptations performed, as necessary?	Project team, counterparts, UN Women and donors; Project's reports and documents	Desk analysis on project's reports and internal documents; interviews with the project tam, experts, monitoring team, UN	The project has had clear and concise planning able to leading to smooth implementation and monitoring

		Were clear benchmarks / objectively verifiable indicators worked out for the activities and deliverables?		Women, decision-makers	The benchmarks and OVIs were developed sufficiently
Coordination	As required, how efficient was the coordination with any national stakeholders and other projects / actions?	As necessary, were the plans agreed with the counterparts and any other parallel projects? Was the capacity of counterparts sufficient as against the plans?	See above	See above	The planning was agreed with counterparts – NGOs, decision-makers, external experts and specialists
Inputs and resources	Was the project provided with sufficient resources to allow smooth implementation?	Was there any resource (inputs and financial means) utilization plan and reporting? Were the experts' inputs and resources provided timely and with sufficient quality? Was the time allotted to the project sufficient?	See above	See above	The resources were planned in detail in accordance with the activities' plans, allowing adaptations as necessary The inputs were provided timely and with sufficient quality The experts were selected transparently and with sufficient coverage of required competences The time of the project was sufficient to develop, implement activities and assess the results
Implementation / Delivery	Was the project implemented timely and deliverables produced / services availed fully?	Were the activities implemented timely? Were there any delays and what were the reasons? Was risk management and adaptations in place to cope with delays?	See above	See above	The results and outputs were delivered timely, so as to allow their utilization and absorption by the recipients and the environment The deliverables were of good quality matching the needs of the beneficiaries The risks related to the quality, access to the results by the beneficiaries were mitigated timely
Internal reporting, monitoring and quality assurance	Were there any internal monitoring and learning schemes deployed?	Was there reporting for the whole project and for the pillars/components and experts? How sufficiently the reports were performed to allow internal monitoring? Was the internal monitoring performed? Were any lessons learned on-the spot and for any possible adaptations?	See above Internal monitoring team; monitoring reports on NGOs' activities	See above	The internal monitoring system was set-up and allowed timely adaptations and risk management The reporting allowed providing for transparency and accountability The reporting and monitoring system allowed internal learning by the team, experts and stakeholders
Project management mechanisms	Were the project management structures well-set-up and supporting the implantation?	Were there any advisory bodies (steering committees, councils) established to follow-up on project's planning, implementation, and internal decision-making and supporting risk management? How flexible was this structure and efficient in decision-making? Did it support to a review, assessment and learning on the achievements/failures?	See above	See above	The project management structures proved to be viable decision-making and support mechanism to enable smooth planning and implementation The review mechanism was set-up and regular reviews / assessment on the achievements with sufficient lessons learned were provided

External Reporting	Did the project have sufficient and full reporting on its performance?	How the external reporting was organized, did the team / partners participate? Did the reporting developed sufficiently: including performance, updated planning, adaptations, risk management, lessons learned? Are the reports supplemented with sufficient analytical and secondary information? Do the reports allow learning on the project's experience for the third-party readers, the donors and specialists?	See above	See above	The external reporting of the project allows tracking the whole management cycle The reporting allows learning on the project's experience
Sustainability: the opportunities, developments, capacities and indications for the project's effects and deliverables be maintained and developed					
The project's assets	Whether the project brought to advancement of existing social capacity or added value to its components	The value added produced through the project: new systems, capacities, knowledge, human resources, work processes and technologies, support-base for further actions and reforms	See below	See below	See below
The upgraded state system of the protection of girls-victims and girls at risk	Whether the formerly existing systems were refined and transferred to new ones – with enhanced efficiency?	How better is the new system of NCWFA-GSC-SILUs-National and Regional referral bodies-NGOs, in terms of meeting the needs of the girls and for prevention and handling of violence against them How efficient is the new set-up: how well it operates? How stable is the new set-up: any risks from parallel structures; social resistance; bureaucracy; lack of means and human resources?	NCWFA, GSC, NGOs, regional CRDs, project's team: assessments and evaluations on the new set-up	Study of any assessments: interviews with the team and officials	The new system allows concentration, coordination of the national agencies and institutions It provides for inclusion and participation of other layers of society
The referral network in all the 10 regions of the country	The stability and efficiency of the referral network	How integrated and coordinated is the referral network? How efficient is it? What are the needs for further improvements?	NCWFA, GSC, NGOs, regional CRDs, project's team: assessments and evaluations on the referral network	Study of any assessments: interviews with the team and officials	The referral network continues operations after the project It is able to reveal and handle violence cases after the project There is a plan for institutional and procedural improvement of the network
The national programming, legal and regulatory basis	The project's contribution to the completeness, gaps analysis and further plans to improve the programming, legal-regulatory framework	What is the project's contribution for and whether: - the national programming documents (notably – Juvenile Justice NAP and the draft Strategy of NCWFA) provide for full framework of coordinated planning and implementation of reforms - the current legal-regulatory framework covers the protection of girls and provides grounds for effective response to violence	NCWFA, GSC, NGOs, regional CRDs, project's team: assessments and evaluations on national programming framework	Study of any assessments: interviews with the team and officials	The Strategy elaborated by the PDT is adopted by the Government The Strategy with supplements provides for steps for improvement of national legislation and regulatory framework, and is supported by mid-term financial plans or any substituting financial perspectives
The pool of knowledgeable	What is the project's contribution to the	What is the continuum of specialists,	NCWFA, GSC, NGOs, regional	Study of any assessments:	The NCWFA Strategy paves a way

professionals and state bodies	'professional support groups'?	professionals and improvement of their capacities through the project What has been the coverage of the skills and knowledge, what else to be advanced	CRDs, project's team, professionals, specialists	interviews with the team professionals and specialists	for further human resources development – specialists in prevention and handling violence – profiled lawyers, social workers, psychologists, other specialists The current referral network institutions have sufficient staff, which is stable in mid-run
The established work technologies with the girls-survivors and at risk	Has the project contributed to more or less stable technologies / means / methodologies of work with the girls?	What was the project's contribution to: - Violence cases identification techniques - Work methods for admission of girls to GSC / SILUs - Re-integration strategies and techniques - Individual methodologies for residential care and self-development at GSC/SILUs	NCWFA, GSC, NGOs, regional CRDs, project's team: professional feedback on the work methodologies	Interviews with the team, professionals	The work technologies and methodologies are properly reflected in the guides and procedural documents of the NCWFA NCWFA supports the referral and care institutions with methodological guidelines
The general forum of supporters of the intervention	Whether any societal groups were created or motivated through the project to support the girls and further reforms for their protection	The project's contribution to the more support from: - Communities; families; religious leaders - Educational and cultural institutions and groups - State bodies and institutions - Professionals and specialists - Youth, volunteers - Socially oriented businesses - Civil society organizations, unions, political parties	NCWFA, GSC, NGOs, regional CRDs, project's team	Interviews with the team, counterparts	The established system and the girls have wide support of layers of society Initiatives of different groups in support to the girls
The network of partner NGOs	Whether the partner NGOs will continue the flow of benefits	Do the partner NGOs have current and planned initiatives Do they continue benefits to the girls Do they keep on networking with each-other Do they still maintain their leading role in regional initiatives and referral network	NCWFA, GSC, NGOs, regional CRDs, project's team: monitoring reports on NGOs' performance	Study of the monitoring reports: interviews with the team, NGOs	The partner NGOs continue their activities after the project They are able to continue diverse projects in the target area There is a state support or plans for support to the NGOs specialized in social work and protection of girls
The key sustainability criteria					
Financial/Economic Soundness	Whether the recipients are able to maintain and develop the results and services and are provided with financial means for that	Do the recipient organizations see the need for maintaining and developing the deliverables; is there any phase-out strategy? Is NCWFA able to involve sufficient expertise to follow-up on the Strategy and its adoption; coordination mechanisms; processing complaints? Are the regional CRDs and referral bodies equipped with sufficient means to efficiently respond to the violence cases;	NCWFA, other state bodies, GSC, regional CRDs, project's team: internal assessments on results	Study of any assessments: interviews with the team and officials	Phase-out strategy with proper assessment of results is in place Further developmental and economic needs of counterparts are assessed and relevant action plans are elaborated

		to provide for preventive measures? Are NGOs possess means or run follow-up projects to further continue services and coordinate with referral bodies?			
Ownership by the target groups	Are the target groups assuming responsibility to continue the services?	Do local referral bodies 'feel' responsible for continuing support and services? Do local communities, families, leaders, civic organizations see the need and take responsibility to continue supporting? Do the specialists deployed through NGOs (lawyers, social workers, others) ready to volunteer and support the NGOs and referral bodies? Are the girls who reached maturity, graduated and re-integrated into society through GSC, feel confident to support and counsel others in difficult situation?	NCWFA, other state bodies, GSC, regional CRDs, project's team	Interviews with the team and officials	The related referral institutions and state bodies plan for steps and measures in their respective annual plans for supporting the girls at risk, according to the policies and strategies set-forward by the NCFWA NGO specialists avail time and consultancy to support the counterparts The girls reveal initiatives to support others
Political support	Whether there is a developed policy framework for further reforms and for developing the achievements	What is the status and coverage of the Strategy of NCWFA? Does it sufficiently address the needs for legal-institutional improvements and further needs of the newly established system? Are there any professional reviews of the legislation and institutions in support to the girls at risk and survivors of violence? What is the response of the government to such analysis and recommendations? To what extent the project was able to contribute to the political support at different layers of society: government, agencies, regional bodies, civil society, businesses, professionals and volunteers	NCWFA, other state bodies, GSC, project's team	Study of any reviews: interviews with the team and officials	The NCWFA has a framework for screening and planning for further policy and strategy development, including legal-institutional improvements; human resources development; financing and visibility actions. The representatives of other layers of the society eager to invest for further development of services for the girls.
Institutional capacities' development		To what extent the project contributed to the institutional strength and management capacities of the involved institutions? Any plans at the NCWFA, GSC/SILUs, and regional CRDs for further institutional developments? Are steps being taken by NCWFA for fulfillment of legislation and regulations towards raising the responsibility, means, coordination frameworks of the involved institutions?	NCWFA, GSC, other state bodies, project's team: assessments of the institutional strength of te counterparts	Study of any assessments: interviews with the team and officials	The NCWFA, GSC, some other state institutions are strengthened through the capacity building actions of the project There are analysis on the institutional standing of the counterparts and plans for their strengthening
Impact: The possible wider and longer-term effects of the project					
New practices and technologies of handling violence against girls	Whether the project succeeded to upgrade the existing systems or supported establishment of a new one?	Did any strengthening, consolidation and concentration of functions of state bodies and services take place as regards	Project team, stakeholders; The documents and legal acts	Study in the documents; interviews with the project's team and	The formerly state-oriented and inflexible system is radically changed

		<p>protection of girls and prevention of violence?</p> <p>Whether the cooperation and coordination among the key institutions, NCWFA, GSC, regional CRDs, other state bodies was improved?</p> <p>To what extent the new system is stable and efficient and what are the further steps for improvements?</p>	related to the elements of the upgraded/new system	stakeholders	<p>There are well-established coordination framework and decision-making mechanism within the new system</p> <p>The new structure and mechanisms cover the main problems and cases</p>
Institutional improvements	What were the institutional improvements among the key stakeholders?	<p>Whether the key institutions in the system reveal functional, organizational and performance improvements?</p> <p>Whether the involved institutions possess new work technologies and methodologies and apply those?</p> <p>Whether any new or improved functions and operations were substantiated with new regulations and procedures?</p>	Project team, stakeholders; The documents and legal acts related to the elements of the upgraded/new system	Study in the documents; interviews with the project's team and stakeholders	The referral bodies and involved institutions has improved internal structure and procedures to deal with prevention and fighting violence
Policy and legal environment	What were the improvements in the policy-legal frameworks?	<p>The changes and amendments to the Juvenile Justice NAP 2010-2015; the Law on Parental Responsibilities; the draft Law on Domestic Violence; Family Code</p> <p>Changes to the number of secondary legal acts on schooling age, placement of children and girls in closed state institutions, procedural documents</p> <p>Other initiatives and plans for further legal improvements</p>	Project team, stakeholders; The documents and legal acts related to the elements of the upgraded/new system	Study in the documents; interviews with the project's team and stakeholders	The initiatives towards amending and upgrading the legal-regulatory framework effect on more efficiency of the new system
Improvement and consolidation of civil society represented by regional networks	How the situation changed in regions with participation of NGOs	<p>Whether partner NGOs were strengthened to the extent to play their key societal role</p> <p>Whether the NGOs succeeded in providing for involvement of wider civil society cycles</p>	NGOs, project team, stakeholders;	Interviews with NGOs, project team, regional stakeholders; Study on the initiatives and current activities of NGOs	The NGOs are informed on and have a good coordination mechanisms with all local stakeholders, and continue initiatives on their own
Behavioral change and public perception	What has been the impact on an individual, their groups/categories and the society at large?	The impact on children, girls, families, communities, schools and other educational institutions, community leaders, social, religious, political groups			
<i>Overcoming the preconceptions</i>		Whether the previously traditional preconceptions were overcome	Project's team, NGOs, civil society members	Interviews with project's team, NGOs, civil society members	The societal groups voice the need to overcome the problems and initiate
<i>Public perception</i>		Whether the public became more aware and cautious to the issue?	Project's team, NGOs, civil society members	See above	The surveys reveal improved understanding on the issue
<i>Behavioral change</i>		Whether diverse groups reveal initiatives and voicing to solve the problem	Project's team, NGOs, civil society members	See above	Societal groups initiate and communicate to solve the problem
<i>The factor of precedence</i>		Whether the cases of protection of the girls, court hearings, interventions by regional bodies, NCWFA acted as a precedence to avoid impunity and provide for more responsibility	Project's team, NGOs, civil society members, judges, law enforcement bodies, schools	See above	The prevented cases, investigations, judgments, decisions impact on the number of cases; isolation and punishment of an aggressor becomes a rule.

Annex 2. People met and interviews conducted

Persons, groups / Position, status	Dates / Place
<p><i>Briefing, re-mapping and conceptual analysis of the intervention, assessment of the results with CRC</i></p> <p>Mr. Tojiddin Jalolov, Project Manager</p> <p>Ms. Mukarama Davlyatova, Project Assistant and Finance Manager</p> <p>Ms. Sokina Tagoeva, Regional Outreach Services</p> <p>Ms. Shahlo Unusova, Helpline Manager</p> <p>Ms. Sayora Isaeva, Consultant-Trainer</p> <p>Ms Jamilya Kamilova, Manager of Legal Department</p>	<p>16/07/2012, Project's Office, Dushanbe, Tajikistan</p>
<p><i>Discussion and brainstorming with GSC staff with invited representatives of the CRC project staff</i></p> <p>Ms. Shamsia Mirgaisivea, Manager of the GSC</p> <p>GSC Staff and CRC representatives</p>	<p>17/07/2012, GSC premises, Dushanbe, Tajikistan</p>
<p><i>Meetings and discussions at the two Semi-independent living units with participation of CRC</i></p>	<p>17/07/2012, premises of the two SILUs, Dushanbe, Tajikistan</p>
<p><i>Meetings with regional partners and invited representatives of local referral bodies</i></p> <p>NGOs Ghamkhori, Kurgan-Teppe, Khatlon Region</p> <p>Mr. B. Toshmatov, Director</p> <p>Staff and other participants</p> <p>NGO Munis, Hissor, Republican Subordination District</p> <p>Mrs. M. Hakimova, Director</p> <p>Staff and other participants</p>	<p>18/07/2012, Kurgan-Teppe, Khatlon Region</p> <p>19/07/2012, Hissor, Hissor RS District</p>
<p>Meeting at the National Commission on Women and Family Affairs with invited representatives of the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Healthcare and Social protection</p> <p>Mrs. Marhabo Olimova, Deputy Head of the Committee</p> <p>Mr. Ulugbek Norov, Consultant of the Policy Development Team</p>	<p>20/07/2012</p>
<p><i>Final brainstorming with CRC and invited professionals</i></p>	<p>20/07/2012</p>

Annex 3. The documentation, information and sources

The project's administrative documents:

1. The Applicant's (CRC's) checklist for application within the UNTF Call 2008 for Grants
2. The Project Document of the current project (2008)
3. The annual progress reports of CRC covering the years 2009-2011
4. The Final progress report of CRC, April 2012
5. The Annual Work Plans for 2009-2011
6. The amended budget of the project
7. The Logical Framework Matrix of the project (2008)
8. The regular reports of NGOs and the monitoring reports by the project's monitoring team
9. The methodologies and guidelines for specialists, GSC, SILUs, NGOs
10. Presentation on the project and its implementation at the GSC Directors' meeting on June 19, 2011
11. Project's publicity materials and samples, including those of NGOs

Programming and policy documents, documents of the international missions and researchers:

12. UNIFEM Strategic Plan 2008-2011
13. United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women Strategic Plan 2011-2013 with the Annex for the Development Results' Framework
14. United Nations Trust Fund's Strategy 2010-2015 (Vision 2015)
15. UNDAF Tajikistan 2010-2015, with Results Framework and the Matrix, M&E framework
16. Concluding observations of the UN Committee on the Rights of a Child at its 53th sessions on the reports submitted by the Government of Tajikistan (11-29 January 2010)
http://www.unicef.org/ceecis/media_20930.html
17. Concluding comments of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women to the combined initial, second and third periodic reports of Tajikistan (CEDAW/C/TJK/1-3) at its 771st and 772nd meetings, on 26 January 2007
18. The Universal Periodic Review References by the Child Right's International Network
<http://www.crin.org/resources/infoDetail.asp?ID=25819>
19. Child Poverty Report for UNICEF by the University of Southampton, 2007
20. CRIN Child Right's References in the Universal Periodic Review
21. Evaluation of the Juvenile Justice Alternatives Projects by the Commission on Child Rights under the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan and UNICEF

Strategy and Policy documents, legal acts, regulations:

22. The draft Strategy of the National Commission on Women and Family Affairs supported by the Policy Development Team
23. The Juvenile Justice Reforms National Action Plan 2011-2015
24. The Law on Parental Responsibilities
25. The draft Law on Domestic Violence
26. The Law on Fighting Trafficking of Human Beings
27. The regulations and procedures for the referral mechanism, admission to GSC/SILUs
28. The Charters and internal procedures of NCWFA

Annex 4. Terms of Reference for the Evaluation

TERMS OF REFERENCE

**Consultancy for Evaluation of the project “Preventing exploitation, abuse, violence and trafficking of vulnerable girls through the development of effective and accessible state referral and support networks and services” implemented by the Child’s Rights Centre
(funded by UN Trust Fund to End Violence Against Women)**

1. BACKGROUND, PURPOSE AND USE OF THE EVALUATION

UN WOMEN and the Public Association Child Rights Centre (CRC) entered into a Project Cooperation Agreement under which CRC agreed to meet prescribed objectives and activities for a three (3) year period from January 2009 to December 2011. In December 2011 the Project Cooperation Agreement was extended for a further three (3) months until 31 March 2012.

The project is intended to contribute to preventing exploitation, abuse and trafficking of and violence against vulnerable girls, promoting and aiding the rehabilitation of child victims and successfully reintegrating them back into their families wherever possible, or their local communities. The specific objective of this project is to develop effective and accessible community-based and national support services for girls aged 10-18 years who are or are at risk of exploitation, abuse, violence and trafficking or who have been victims, by strengthening the capacity of the existing child protection system, state residential institutions, district law enforcement bodies, professionals and civil society to identify the target group and respond effectively to their needs. These services and support networks did not exist at the start of the project.

The project funded by UN Trust Fund to End Violence Against Women (UN Trust Fund), administered by UN Women on behalf of the UN system, **has four (4) specific components** intended to support the Girls Support Service established by the Children’s Legal Centre in partnership with its implementing partner, the Child Rights Centre:

1. to **establish supported living units in Dushanbe**: Setting up two residential units where girls aged 16 - 18 years old or over who have completed a six month stay at the Support Centre will be able to stay, continuing their rehabilitation process should it not be possible to reintegrate them back into the family or live fully independently;
2. to establish **regional community-based outreach services (psychological and legal support)** to the target group through local NGOs in ten regions across Tajikistan;
3. to train and provide support for **referral networks and Support Centre Staff to develop referral networks for the Girls Support Service using district level child protection and law enforcement bodies**;
4. to **establish a Policy Development Team to develop the role of the National Committee on Women and Family Affairs (NCWFA)** as the lead government agency supporting the Girls Support Service and undertaking policy reform on child abuse and exploitation.

The **project outcomes** are as follows:

- | | |
|-----------|--|
| Outcome 1 | Target girls are able to access rehabilitation and reintegration service in supported living units |
| Outcome 2 | Increase in assistance to the target group in their local community through regional NGO partners |
| Outcome 3 | Effective Referral Networks Identifies and Refers Girls throughout the Country in 10 Districts in Tajikistan |
| Outcome 4 | The Committee of Women and Family Affairs, (NCWFA) staff is the lead state agency actively promoting the rights of girls under 18 in Tajikistan. |

The primary beneficiaries of the project are girls aged 10-18 who have been or are at risk of becoming victims of violence, exploitation, trafficking or abuse. Girls from around Tajikistan can access the service

through a formal referral process or self-referral, or be provided with assistance through the regional outreach services. The secondary beneficiaries of the project are the district authority workers, policemen, healthcare staff, local NGO professionals and outreach staff who receive training. Families of the girls benefit from being with support and assistance in how to more effectively interact with and care for their daughters. The NCWFA benefits with the development of its policy and role towards a more focused approach to dealing with gender issues.

The purpose of the evaluation is to measure the impact and success of the project in establishing a system of identification, referral, community-based support and protection at the Girls' Support Service for the target group.

2. OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION

The objective of evaluation is to measure the impact and success of the project in establishing a system of identification, referral, community based support and protection at the Girls' Support Service for the target group. In close collaboration with the staff of the Girls Support Service, the selected evaluators are expected provide an evaluation which:

- A. Measures the impact and success of the project in establishing a system of identification, referral, community based support and protection at the Girls Support Service for the target group, being girls between 10 and 18 who have been or are at risk of sexual abuse, exploitation or trafficking.
- B. Evaluates the changes in institutional structures and practices, analysing the sustainability of the integration of the referral networks into the state child protection and juvenile justice apparatus.
- C. Provides a list of recommendations for ways in which the various components of the project can be sustained by the NCWFA following the completion of the donor funding period.

Evaluation questions

The evaluation will answer the key questions outlined below in its final report. These questions remain generic, but are consistent with standard approaches to project evaluation.

Relevance

- Are the project objectives addressing identified rights and needs of the target group(s) in regional contexts?
- Do the activities address the problems identified?
- Is the project design articulated in a coherent structure?

Effectiveness

- What has been the progress made towards achievement of the expected outcomes and expected results?
- What are the results achieved?
- What are the reasons for the achievement or non-achievement?
- To what extent have beneficiaries been satisfied with the results?
- To what extent the objectives have been achieved, and do the intended and unintended benefits meet fairly the needs of disadvantage women?
- What is the reach of the project in view of the targets envisioned at the start?

Efficiency

- What measures have been taken during planning and implementation to ensure that resources are efficiently used?

- Have the outputs been delivered in a timely manner?
- Could the activities and outputs been delivered with fewer resources without reducing their quality and quantity?
- Have UN Women's organizational structure, managerial support and coordination mechanisms effectively supported the delivery of the project?

Sustainability

- What is the likelihood that the benefits from the project will be maintained for a reasonably long period of time if the project were to cease?
- Is the programme supported by national/local institutions? Do these institutions demonstrate leadership commitment and technical capacity to continue to work with the project or replicate it?
- What adaptive or management capacities of national partners, such as learning, leadership, programme and process management, networking and linkages have been supported?

Impact:

- What are the intended and unintended, positive and negative, long term effects of the project?
- To what extent can the changes that have occurred as a result of the project be identified and measured?
- To what extent can the identified changes be attributed to the project?
- What are the positive and negative changes produced directly or indirectly by the project on the opportunities of different groups of women, and on the socioeconomic conditions of their localities?

Existing Information Sources

Information about the project is available through documents collected during the lifetime of the project including but not limited to:

- Project Cooperation Agreement
- Annual and mid-year reports – narrative and financial
- Internal policies and procedures developed by the Girls Support Service and/or CRC
- Periodic reports from NGO partners
- Internal information management tools and reports including monitoring reports
- Training records including attendance sheets
- Agreements and reports in relation to the NCWFA

3. EVALUATION APPROACH, PROCESS AND METHODS

The evaluation is to be conducted by a team of two evaluators, one international evaluator and one national evaluator.

Tasks and Responsibilities for the International Evaluator

The international evaluator will:

- Lead the evaluation process in accordance with the approach, process and methods set out below.
- Be responsible for the quality of submitted deliverables
- Supervise the delivery of the tasks and responsibilities of the national evaluator

Approach, Process and Methods

The evaluation will be undertaken through a combination of qualitative and quantitative techniques that will be used to gather data and information from main stakeholders of the project mainly target groups including women and girls, volunteers, members of Women initiative groups, local government officials etc. The evaluators should use Human Rights and Gender Equality based approaches, as well as results-based management approach, including the methodology of participatory approach of evaluation. The data and information gathered will be systematically analyzed and presented following the evaluation criteria mentioned above.

In close cooperation with the CRC project staff, the evaluator is expected to:

- Conduct a **desk review**, including analysis of information available. The evaluator extensively review existing documents, contact with CRC project team and prepare a brief inception report. The inception report will include a clear, time and resource bound detailed work plan, clear evaluation questions and tools. An inception report to be prepared by consultant and presented to CRC for discussion and agreement before moving to the implementation phase.
- **Data collection**, including site visits and conducting interviews with main beneficiaries, project staff, selected partners and key stakeholders.

The site visits are to be made to:

- (i) The office of the Child Rights Centre located at 49A Bukhoro Street Dushanbe
- (ii) The office of the policy development team located in the building occupied by the National Committee on Women and Family Affairs.
- (iii) The Girls Support Centre
- (iv) The two semi-independent living units located in Dushanbe
- (v) A minimum of three (3) outreach partners located in the regions of Tajikistan to be determined at the time of the evaluation dependent upon access due to weather conditions at the time.

CRC staff is responsible for invitation of the key stakeholders and schedule the time for interviews.

- Evaluators will **analyse** collected data/information, seek clarifications from different sources to enrich the findings. The project staff will send any necessary documents and information.
- Evaluator will present and submit **report** according to the agreed format to the CRC Management.
- The project staff is responsible for **dissemination** of the findings to the appropriate stakeholders and beneficiaries.

4. DUTY STATION AND OFFICIAL TRAVEL INVOLVED

Dushanbe and 3 regional locations of Tajikistan. The regional locations may be in Sugd region (specifically Khujand, Babajon Ghaforov, Isfara, Istarafshan or Penjikent), GBAO (specifically Khorog) or Khatlan (specifically Gissar, Kurgan Tube or Kulyab) and will be determined at the time of the evaluation depending upon the accessibility of the sites.

Summary of Coverage

2 offices within Dushanbe, the Girls Support Centre, 2 semi-independent living units within Dushanbe and 3 sites outside Dushanbe (to be agreed at the time of the evaluation depending upon the accessibility of the sites).

5. TIMEFRAME AND DELIVERABLES

The overall consultancy will tentatively begin on **March 19, 2012** and finalize in 15 working days including a 5-days mission (field visit) to Tajikistan to undertake consultations with CRC team.

The Evaluator is expected to submit a draft evaluation report, revised based on inputs received from the other consultant, with a debriefing with the CRC and UN Women EECA SRO no later than **7 April 2012**.

Deliverables

A. Inception Report

Within five (5) days of award of contract, the Evaluator, based on consultations with the national consultant shall submit an electronic copy of a draft inception report to CRC. The inception report provides an opportunity for CRC team to ensure that their interpretations of the TOR are mutually consistent. The project director will coordinate the internal review and approval of the inception report. The inception report shall:

- Explain the evaluators' understanding of what is being evaluated and why;
- Review and strengthen the evaluation methodology, describing the plans to engage and involve stakeholders in the design (e.g., questions, objectives, methods, data-collection instruments), data collection, data analysis, and development of recommendations;
- Note: Consultant/Evaluator are encouraged to suggest refinements to the TOR and to propose creative or cost- or time-saving approaches to the evaluation and explain their anticipated value.
- For each of the evaluative criteria, describe the measurable performance indicators or standards of performance that will be used to assess progress towards the attainment of results, including outcomes;
- Explain the Consultant's/Evaluator's procedures to ensure informed consent among all people to be interviewed or surveyed and confidentiality and privacy during and after discussion of sensitive issues with beneficiaries or members of the public;
- Provide a proposed schedule of tasks, activities, evaluation methodologies and deliverables consistent with this TOR.

B. Draft Evaluation Report

The Evaluator shall submit an electronic copy of a draft evaluation report to CRC no later than 15 days after completing project evaluation. The draft report should be thoroughly copy edited to ensure that comments from CRC, UN Trust Fund and other stakeholders on content, presentation, language, and structure can be reduced to a minimum.

After CRC and stakeholders' review of the draft report, the project director shall submit these to the Evaluator. Based on these comments, the Evaluator, shall correct all factual errors and inaccuracies and make changes related to the report's structure, consistency, analytical rigor, validity of evidence, and requirements in the TOR. After making the necessary changes, the Evaluator will submit a revised draft evaluation report, which may lead to further comments from CRC, UN Women EECA SRO, and the UN Trust Fund. After the second round of review and, if necessary, further revision to the draft evaluation report, the Team leader can then submit the final report pending CRC, UN Women EECA SRO and the UN Trust Fund's approval.

C. Power point presentation of preliminary findings to the key stakeholders.

The comments made by key stakeholders should inform the draft report.

D. Final Report

The evaluator should submit final report to CRC and UN Women EECA SRO in two signed hard copies and electronically.

The recommended structure of the final report is provided below and the Consultant/Evaluator should follow this as closely as possible. The report must contain a self-contained executive summary that provides a clear, concise presentation of the evaluation's main conclusions and key recommendations and reviews salient issues identified in the evaluation. All deliverables must be in English.

The Final Evaluation Report should include the following components:

- Executive Summary
- Programme description
- Evaluation Purpose
- Evaluation Methodology
- Findings
- Recommendations

Annexes (including interview list – without identifying names for sake of confidentiality, data collection instruments, key documents consulted, Terms of Reference)

6. MANAGEMENT OF EVALUATION

CRC will nominate one or more people to coordinate the evaluation process. CRC will facilitate the participation of stakeholders, as required, in the evaluation. CRC must provide planning documents, mission reports or other relevant documents. CRC will be responsible for providing office space to the evaluators and for arranging the logistics such as travel.

The Evaluators will be responsible for all administrative and secretarial support, telecommunications, printing of documentation. CRC will make a printer available for printing documents. The evaluators are also responsible for the dissemination of all methodological tools such as surveys. CRC will facilitate this process to the extent possible by providing contact information such as email addresses and phone numbers.

7. ETHICAL CODE OF CONDUCT

The evaluation of the project will be conducted along highest ethical and legal standards and with due regard for the welfare of those involved in the evaluation, especially women, girls and members of other vulnerable or disadvantaged groups and in accordance with Ethical guidelines for Evaluation. Due consideration will also be given to beneficiaries and other stakeholders on confidentiality of information and privacy during consultations and personal interviews.

8. CONSULTANT/EVALUATOR QUALIFICATION AND EXPERIENCE

Competencies:

Technical/Functional:

- Extensive knowledge and experience in evaluation and application of quantitative and qualitative methods.
- A strong record in designing and leading evaluations.
- Experience in gender analysis and human rights.
- Experience in evaluating the delivery of social services
- Familiarity with the political, economic and social situation in Tajikistan an asset
- Experience in working with multi-stakeholders essential: governments, civil society, community based organizations, and the UN/multilateral/bilateral institutions.
- Ability to produce well written reports demonstrating analytical ability and communication skill. Proven ability to undertake self-directed research.
- Excellent writing skills, ability to write in a structured, lucid and concise manner.
- Experience in evaluation of programs with budget over USD 1 million.
- Fluent in English, knowledge of Russian language would be an asset

Required Skills And Experience (For The International Evaluator):

Education:

- University degree or equivalent in Political Science, International Development Studies, Gender/Women's Studies, Economics, Sociology or Social Sciences. Advanced University degree in Monitoring and Results Based Management considered an asset

Experience:

- 7 years of working experience in evaluation, and at least 5 in evaluation of development programmes

Evaluation of submitted proposals:

Technical evaluation criteria

Nr.	Criteria	Maximum points
1.	University degree or equivalent in Political Science, International Development Studies, Gender/Women's Studies, Economics, Sociology or Social Sciences. Advanced University degree in Monitoring and Results Based Management considered an asset	80
2.	7 years of working experience in evaluation, and at least 5 in evaluation of development programmes. Experience evaluating the delivery of social services an asset.	80
3.	Extensive knowledge and experience in evaluation and application of quantitative and qualitative methods	70
4	Ability to produce well written reports demonstrating analytical ability (on the basis of samples of previous evaluation reports)	70
5	Proficiency in English, Russian is an asset (<i>English – 30; English and Russian – 50</i>)	50
	Maximum total technical scoring:	350

Only candidates who reached at least 245 points will be qualified for financial evaluation.

Financial proposal

Evaluation of submitted financial offers will be done based on the following formula:

$$B = T + C_{low} / C \times 150,$$

where

T – is the total technical score awarded to the evaluated proposal (only to those proposals that pass 70% of technical evaluation);

C – is the price of the evaluated proposal; and

C_{low} – is the lowest of all evaluated proposal prices among responsive proposals.

150 is the maximum financial points obtainable

Winning candidates (For The International Evaluator)

The winning candidates will be the candidates, who have accumulated the highest aggregated score (technical scoring + financial scoring).

9. APPLICATION REQUIREMENTS

All expressions of interest should be in English and include:

- **Evaluator's CV** outlining her/his experience
- **Technical Proposal** highlighting: brief explanation about the Evaluator with particular emphasis on previous experience in this kind of work; profile of the Evaluator to be involved in undertaking the evaluation, brief description of methodology applied).
- **Financial Proposal:** Each applicant will be required to submit an aggregated financial offer ("aggregated financial offer" is the total sum of all financial claims of the candidate for accomplishment of the task including travel expenses related to 5-days mission to Tajikistan). The evaluator shall bare costs for all supplies needed for data collection and data processing including possession of his own personal computer.

Applications should be submitted by **15 March 2012** via email to t.jalolov.crc@gmail.com marked with the Title of the letter: "Evaluation of the CRC project".